

## Management Response

### Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”

#### WFP Gambia

Rec. #	Recommendation Text	Management Response	Actions to be taken	Action By	Implementation timeframe	Status
1	<p><b>R1: The WFP should urgently improve its monitoring of the education parameters that should show evidence of the positive impact of school feeding. Time frame: end of 2018.</b></p> <p>a) WFP should endeavour to work out better monitoring systems for the school feeding programme, in close collaboration with the MoBSE. This joint effort should start from MoBSE’s existing monitoring system and improve it gradually. In any case, the two organisations’ systems should be better harmonised, to allow for a meaningful monitoring of those parameters that are relevant to both. It could consider to equip all cluster monitors with an iPad (or tablet or smartphone), in which they</p>	Accepted.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Discussions with MoBSE to develop a road map ongoing</li> <li>Current CSP integrates placement of an M&amp;E Staff at MoBSE</li> <li>Tablets for data collection and transmission already purchased</li> <li>WFP has developed a training plan to reinforce capacity</li> </ol>	WFP CO in collaboration with MoBSE	June 2018- Dec 2019	In progress

**Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”**

**WFP Gambia**

<b>Rec. #</b>	<b>Recommendation Text</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Actions to be taken</b>	<b>Action By</b>	<b>Implementation timeframe</b>	<b>Status</b>
	<p>would be able to insert the SF data off-line (as well as other data on education parameters if the software programme allows that). As these tablets are equipped with SIM-cards, the cluster monitor would then, when he/she is back in the regional capital, register and send the data to WFP (and to MoBSE). The possibility of adopting a SMS based monitoring system for the SFP in The Gambia could also be explored</p> <p>b) The monitoring system should monitor the relevant parameters that are intended to show the impact of school feeding, distinguishing schools with school meals from those without. Thereby, results of school feeding on education could be included in both WFP’s yearly SPR’s and in the MoBSE’s Statistical Yearbooks. The average NAT3 and NAT5 pass rates for mathematics and English in SFP-assisted schools could be one of these relevant parameters.</p>	<p>Not accepted</p> <p>Expertise and Resources to implement such a rigorous methodology – to factor in control groups – is limited.</p> <p>WFP programmes globally are designed to impact</p>				<p>Not started.</p>

**Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”**

**WFP Gambia**

<b>Rec. #</b>	<b>Recommendation Text</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Actions to be taken</b>	<b>Action By</b>	<b>Implementation timeframe</b>	<b>Status</b>
		on enrollment, attendance and retention, and not academic performance.				
2	<p><b>R2: The WFP should facilitate the preparation of a realistic and consensual operational plan or road map for the hand-over of responsibilities for the school feeding programme from the WFP to the MoBSE. Timeframe: immediate, as it is urgently needed to guide the ongoing process.</b></p> <p>a) The WFP should work closely together with the SAFMU/MoBSE to prepare a strategic/operational road map or implementation/transition plan for: a gradual shift towards more CBT modality schools, a gradual shift towards more SAFMU/MoBSE operational (and financial) responsibility, and a regular</p>	Accepted.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. WFP CO will hire a consultant to support MoBSE to develop a road map and handover plan.</li> <li>2. Continuous consultation with MoBSE ongoing</li> </ol>	WFP CO	November 2018 - December 2019.	In progress.

**Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”**

**WFP Gambia**

<b>Rec. #</b>	<b>Recommendation Text</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Actions to be taken</b>	<b>Action By</b>	<b>Implementation timeframe</b>	<b>Status</b>
	<p>follow-up and assessment of the gradual increase in capacities at school/RED-SFFP/SAFMU/ MoBSE levels.</p> <p>b) Such a plan should guide the ongoing process. It should have clear benchmarks and should spell out clearly the required capacity strengthening on the side of the MoBSE and follow a realistic strategy to build that up. MoBSE should have the greater responsibility in working out such a plan, and WFP should play only an assisting and facilitating role. Most likely, WFP and the MoBSE would benefit from the collaboration with external consultants to help with this hand-over plan and for finding alternative solutions to the existing difficulties, because of their probable stronger capacity to «think outside the box». The ToR of such consultancies should be worked out by the MoBSE (and SAFMU), with assistance from WFP, but in such a way that it is formulated specifically for the task at hand, and as much as possible, free from pre-established WFP templates.</p>	Accepted.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Minister to present the road map to National Assembly for endorsement</li> <li>2. Capacity building for MoBSE to ensure handover ongoing – see point above on the same.</li> </ol>	WFP CO	December 2018 – December 2019.	In progress.

**Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”**

**WFP Gambia**

<b>Rec. #</b>	<b>Recommendation Text</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Actions to be taken</b>	<b>Action By</b>	<b>Implementation timeframe</b>	<b>Status</b>
3	<p><b>R3: WFP should avoid as much as possible the systematic interruptions of both food supply and cash transfers to schools.</b></p> <p>Both in-kind supplies and cash transfers should arrive in the schools in a timely manner. This requires that: WFP should endeavour to obtain sufficient funding for the SFP, from various sources, both national and international; parallel efforts from the MoBSE to secure additional and/or new funding are of course also essential; new and innovative ways should be identified, worked out and experimented, in order to simplify, and to speed up the administrative procedures linked to planning, authorising, procuring, transporting of food, or of transferring funds to the schools, as well as the reporting by the schools, the SFFP and the RED’s on the use that was made of these food and cash transfers.</p>	Accepted, contingent to availability of resources	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. WFP and MoBSE are engaged in continuous resource mobilization.</li> <li>2. MoBSE already allocated funding for school meals in two regions.</li> </ol>	WFP CO in collaboration with MoBSE	June 2018 onwards.	In progress.

**Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”**

**WFP Gambia**

<b>Rec. #</b>	<b>Recommendation Text</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Actions to be taken</b>	<b>Action By</b>	<b>Implementation timeframe</b>	<b>Status</b>
4	<p><b>R4: WFP should create conditions for the design of improved implementation mechanisms, procedures, norms, and monitoring systems. Timeframe: urgent, before end 2019.</b></p> <p>SAFMU and MoBSE should be the main actors in this design process and the improved mechanisms should correspond better to the existing MoBSE functioning mechanisms and procedures. WFP should support that process, without taking the lead. WFP mechanisms, procedures, norms and monitoring systems should be a source of inspiration for the MoBSE to develop their own mechanisms, procedures and norms, not necessarily the starting point of the process.</p>	<p>Partially accepted</p> <p>WFP would need to drive the process in the first two years to build their capacity</p>	<p>CSP envisages a technical M&amp;E Officer situated at the Ministry to support MoBSE Monitoring system.</p>	<p>WFP CO in collaboration with MoBSE</p>	<p>January 2018 onwards.</p>	<p>In progress.</p>
5	<p><b>R5: WFP should assist the MoBSE to upgrade and improve the existing mechanisms of accountability and security at school level, in relation to school meals. Time frame: before end of 2019.</b></p>					

**Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”**

**WFP Gambia**

<b>Rec. #</b>	<b>Recommendation Text</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Actions to be taken</b>	<b>Action By</b>	<b>Implementation timeframe</b>	<b>Status</b>
	a) The presence of cash in the schools can lead to many irregularities at the local level. New control mechanisms must be introduced, and the existing mechanisms need to be monitored, so that they are effectively put in practice.	Accepted.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Segregation of duties at community level already in place.</li> <li>2. Cash management policy in place to avoid presence of large sums of cash at any given time.</li> </ol>	WFP CO in collaboration with MoBSE	June 2018 onwards.	In progress.
	b) The possible introduction, in the local school management committee (SMC) of a subcommittee for control of the management of finances and food items, of the type that typically exists in co-operatives e.g., can be considered. Such a Control Committee (CC or CoCo) could then be responsible for the regular checking of the use of funds and of material goods belonging to the school meal programme as well as those from the School Investment Grant (SIG), for which, at present, there may be no explicit control bodies.	Accepted	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Bank accounts and cash safes already purchased and distributed</li> <li>2. Training envisaged in the CSP</li> <li>3. Within the school management committee key members are designated and charged with the responsibility of cash management and regular control of the cash.</li> </ol>	WFP CO in collaboration with MoBSE	June 2018 onwards.	In progress

**Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”**

**WFP Gambia**

Rec. #	Recommendation Text	Management Response	Actions to be taken	Action By	Implementation timeframe	Status
6	<p><b>R6: WFP should assist the MoBSE in promoting the purchase of locally produced food, including rice, directly from the local producers, by experimenting new competitive procurement mechanisms. Timeframe: urgent, before end of 2019.</b></p> <p>Public tenders correspond more to the conditions and practices of traders and businesses, but not of farmers. Also, the harvest calendar does not correspond well to the school tendering calendar. Thereby, SF food procurement should explore/experiment the possible use of negotiated contracts with farmers or farming groups for future harvests. A supply contract with an agreed upon price can be a procurement mechanism that is more appropriate for the specific conditions of the farmers than the public tender formula currently used. To this end, a «tender» can be organised specifically between producers/farmers, for the supply of clean</p>	<p>Not Accepted. Tender and procurement procedures need to be followed.</p> <p>Discussions with RB/HQ to be pursued to seek guidance on waivering of procurement procedures</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Plans are being finalized to have study tour to other countries to learn Home Grown School meals</li> </ol>	<p>WFP CO in collaboration with MoBSE</p>	<p>January 2019</p>	<p>Not started</p>



**Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”**

**WFP Gambia**

<b>Rec. #</b>	<b>Recommendation Text</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Actions to be taken</b>	<b>Action By</b>	<b>Implementation timeframe</b>	<b>Status</b>
	rice (with agreed upon quality criteria, including a certain percentages of broken grains) to a school or a cluster of schools. In collaboration with the agricultural extension officers, they could develop and test mechanisms to promote new forms of the joint sale of produce to the schools by smallholder farmers. At the inter-ministerial level, structural linkages are urgently needed between the MoBSE and the Ministry of Agriculture (MoA) in order to facilitate purchases from local farmers. The operationality of these linkages should be at the school/cluster and regional level, but a global MoBSE-MoA agreement should establish a framework and encourage the regional staff of both these ministries.					
7	<b>R7. WFP should assist the MoBSE to explore and find possible solutions for processing and preparing of «coos» (from maize and millet).</b> <i>Time frame: Before end of 2019.</i>  Preparation of coos in the CT schools is currently a very laborious and cumbersome	Partially Accepted. Contingent upon funding availability.	1. Consideration of inclusion of milling cost in budgets allocation to be explored	WFP CO in collaboration with MoBSE and MOA	June 2019	Not started

**Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”**

**WFP Gambia**

<b>Rec. #</b>	<b>Recommendation Text</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Actions to be taken</b>	<b>Action By</b>	<b>Implementation timeframe</b>	<b>Status</b>
	<p>operation and too heavy a burden for the cooks. Some suggestions were made in the schools, that, in the opinion of the ET, merit could be considered as a possible solution: equip every (cluster of) schools with a mill (with different implements for the respective operations to be performed), so that they can do the processing themselves. At the same time, this could possibly be a source of income for the school, when operating the mill commercially for external clients; allow the schools to use SF funds to pay for the processing (and the transport costs to a mill nearby). This was permitted in 2016-17 but later abolished by WFP; allow the schools to include the processing of maize and millet into «coos» their tender notice, inviting interested parties (local women groups for example) to be candidates for this processing work, preparing ready-to-use «coos» for the school cooks.</p>					
8	<p><b>R8: In partnership with UNICEF and contingent on funding WFP should</b></p>					

**Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”**

**WFP Gambia**

<b>Rec. #</b>	<b>Recommendation Text</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Actions to be taken</b>	<b>Action By</b>	<b>Implementation timeframe</b>	<b>Status</b>
	<p><b>hand over the school meal programme with fully refurbished school kitchens, and with good sources of potable water for cooking and drinking. <i>Timeframe: Before end of 2019.</i></b></p> <p>a) Most school kitchens need replenishment of their equipment: one or two cooking pots, some pans, basins, and some specific utensils. Each team of cooks can make a list of items lacking. And practically all wood-saving stoves need urgent repair, often even rebuilding, which would best be done by skilled and experienced masons.</p> <p>b) The vast majority of assisted schools have insufficient plates, and spoons are practically non-existing. And there is nowhere a more or less clean and wind-protected «eating area». Many schools lack sufficient water sources for cooking</p>	<p>Partially Accepted. (contingent to funding)</p> <p>Accepted.</p>	<p>1. Note that availability of portable water and kitchen had been a targeting criteria for inclusion in school meals programmes</p> <p>2. Consultations with MoBSE, UNICEF and WFP will pursue expansion of water supply in community schools</p> <p>1. WFP to provide plates for all children in all regions in 2019.</p>	<p>WFP CO</p> <p>WFP CO in collaboration with MoBSE</p>	<p>June 2019</p> <p>March 2019 to Jan 2020</p>	<p>Not started</p> <p>In progress</p>

**Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”**

**WFP Gambia**

<b>Rec. #</b>	<b>Recommendation Text</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Actions to be taken</b>	<b>Action By</b>	<b>Implementation timeframe</b>	<b>Status</b>
	and washing of dishes, and in many cases the water has to be collected and brought from sources outside the school. An assessment and further improvement in water sources for the school feeding would increase the chance of adopting better hygienic practices on the food preparation and distribution and promoting the food safety of school meals.		2. WFP to monitor WASH principles are adopted by MoBSE and in schools			
9	<p><b>R9: WFP should review the take-home ration of rice of the cooks, which is their gratification, as it is now perceived as very low and with quite some irregularities in practice. Timeframe: before the end of 2019.</b></p> <p>a) The WFP norm is 2.5 kg of rice per cooking day per agreed upon cook. The WFP estimates one cook per 200 children. Often times, the FMC adds one or more voluntary cooks, unpaid, when the WFP-cooks cannot cope with the</p>	<p>Partially Accepted.</p> <p>WFP note the extra work involved and is considering increasing cash</p>	1. WFP will increase cash allocation to cater for the transformation-assessment is completed once	WFP CO	September 2018 onwards.	In progress.

**Decentralized Evaluation of Gambia DEV 200327 “Establishing the Foundation for a Nationally Owned Sustainable School Feeding Programme in the Gambia”**

**WFP Gambia**

<b>Rec. #</b>	<b>Recommendation Text</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Actions to be taken</b>	<b>Action By</b>	<b>Implementation timeframe</b>	<b>Status</b>
	<p>tasks at hand. This occurs especially in the CBT community managed modality where the school menu is more complex and requires additional work for its preparation, so that extra voluntary, unpaid, community cooks come in. The unequal treatment causes a sense of injustice.</p> <p>b) In practice the payment received by the SFP-accepted cooks varies considerably, from 30Kg/three months to 60kg/month for a half-time cook. WFP should apply its norms correctly and better supervise the other actors involved (such as the food transporters). If the WFP cannot increase the «payment» or gratification of the cooks, then the WFP should assist the MoBSE to lobby the local authorities (councils, local administrations) as these could possibly make contributions from their own resources.</p>	<p>allocation to accommodate the transformation of food commodities based on an assessment that will be carried out.</p> <p>Not accepted. WFP gives 50Kg to each cook per month</p>	<p>2. WFP would standardize the 50kg per cook or consider paying cash equivalent</p> <p>3. WFP and MoBSE will encourage community/PTA participation.</p>			