

Value Chain Development, Gender and Women's Empowerment in Ghana

VAM Gender and Markets Study #1 2016-2017





The Zero Hunger Challenge emphasizes the importance of strengthening economic empowerment in support of the Sustainable Development Goal 2 to *double small-scale producer incomes and productivity*. The increasing focus on resilient markets can bring important contributions to sustainable food systems and build resilience. Participation in market systems is not only a means for people to secure their livelihood, but it also enables them to exercise agency, maintain dignity, build social capital and increase self-worth. Food security analysis must take into account questions of gender-based violence and discrimination in order to deliver well-tailored assistance to those most in need.

WFP's Nutrition Policy (2017-2021) reconfirms that gender equality and women's empowerment are essential to achieve good nutrition and sustainable and resilient livelihoods, which are based on human rights and justice. This is why gender-sensitive analysis in nutrition programmes is a crucial contribution to achieving the SDGs. The VAM *Gender & Markets Initiative* of the WFP Regional Bureau for West and Central Africa seeks to strengthen WFP and partners' commitment, accountability and capacities for gender-sensitive food security and nutrition analysis in order to design market-based interventions that empower women and vulnerable populations. The series of regional *VAM Gender and Markets Studies* is an effort to build the evidence base and establish a link to SDG 5 which seeks to *achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls*.

All rights reserved in all countries English edition, 2016-2017 Copyright © World Food Programme Bureau Regional Dakar

Author: Analee Pepper Edited by: William Ndiaye

For more information contact:

World Food Programme

Simon Renk (Regional Markets Advisor): simon.renk@wfp.org Desiree Lwambo (VAM Gender Specialist): desiree.lwambo@wfp.org

Table of Contents

Lis	of Acronyms	4
Tal	e of Figures	5
Exe	utive Summary	6
INT	ODUCTION	9
	. Objectives	11
	I. Context	12
	II. Gender Context	12
	V. Methodology	14
	/. Study limitations	15
1.	Roles and responsibilities of women and men in agricultural value chains	17
2.	Specific challenges and constraints for women in agricultural value chains	30
3.	Gaps and challenges in gender analysis and in tracking women's empowerment	38
4.	Role of Market-queens in high-value food commodity supply, distribution, and pricing	45
5.	Programmatic solutions and value-added opportunities for women in associated markets	50
со	CLUSION	51
AN	EX	53
	Annex I – Partner organizations and WFP staff surveyed	53
	Annex II – Literature Review	54
	Annex III – Mission Plan	56
	Annex IV – Output	57

List of Acronyms

ADP	African Development Bank						
ADVANCE	Agricultural Development and Value Chain Enhancement						
AEAs	Agricultural Extensions Agents						
CFSVA	Comprehensive Food Security and Vulnerability Assessment						
CGIAR	Consultative Group for International Agricultural Research						
CO	Country Office						
DFATD	Department of Foreign Affairs, Trade and Development						
EFSA	Emergency Food Security Assessment						
ENVAC	Enhanced Nutrition and Value Chains project						
FBO	Farm-Based Organizations						
GADS II	Gender and Agricultural Development Strategy II						
GCAP	Ghana Commercial Agriculture Project						
GIF	Gender Innovation Fund						
GRN	Gender Results Network						
IFPRI	International Food Policy Research Institute						
METSS	Monitoring, Evaluation and Technical Support Services						
MoFA	Ministry of Food and Agriculture						
MoGCSP	Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection						
P4P	Purchase for Progress						
RBD	Regional Bureau for West and Central Africa						
SBCC	Social and Behavioural Change Communication						
SRID	Statistical Research and Information Directorate						
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme						
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund						
USAID	United States Agency for International Development						
USDA	United States Department of Agriculture						
VAM	Vulnerability Analysis and Mapping team						
WEAI	Women's Empowerment in Agriculture Index						
WFP	World Food Programme						
WIAD	Women in Agricultural Development						

Table of Figures

Figure 1. Food Security Groups, by gender of head of household
Figure 2. Traders, by gender and by region
Figure 3. Type of Trade Activity, by gender20
Figure 4. Type of Trade Activity by region
Figure 5. Traders' capacity to respond to increased demand for food commodities, by gender21
Figure 6. Traders' capacity to respond to increased demand for food commodities, by activity22
Figure 7. Clientele gender, by trader region, trader activity and trader gender23
Figure 8. Source of funding by trader gender25
Figure 9. Stock purchase on credit, by trader gender25
Figure 10. Staff Employment by gender
Figure 11. Employment in Agriculture and Services, by gender26
Figure 12. Vulnerable vs. wage/salaried employment, by gender (2010)27
Figure 13. Payments & Wages received, by gender (2014)27
Figure 14. Greatest constraints or challenges for business activities
Figure 15. House and Land Ownership, by Gender (2014)
Figure 16. Bank account, by gender
Figure 17. Stratégie de Stockage, par sexe du commerçant
Figure 18. Seasonal stock-outs, by trader gender
Figure 19. Educational Attainment, by gender (2010)
Figure 20. Level of Education, by trader gender
Figure 21. Decisions on taking out credits, % of traders, by gender
Figure 22. Decision Making on Major Household Purchases (2008)43
Figure 23. Role of market queens in agro-food value chain45

Executive Summary

The Vulnerability Analysis and Mapping (VAM) unit of the World Food Programme (WFP) Regional Bureau for West and Central Africa (RBD) launched a regional Gender and Markets initiative to reinforce the collection and analysis of gender-based data on the roles, challenges and empowerment of women and men in markets in nine West African countries.

Ghana represents an example of comparatively stronger gender equality and living conditions for women in this region and, as such, it is well-positioned to influence a new market-based and gender-responsive approach to the Enhanced Nutrition and Value Chains (ENVAC) project, set to be launched in 2016-2017 by the country office. The ENVAC project expands on the Purchase for Progress (P4P) Initiative in Ghana, and like P4P, it focuses on women's empowerment and gender equality with the objective of connecting local small-scale processors with consumers to improve local processing capacity and increase the availability of nutrient-rich local flour blends.

This report is organized around the 5 standard research themes that are the object of this study:

- 1. The roles and responsibilities of women and men in agricultural value chains. Agricultural commodities in Ghana are traditionally produced and traded by women. Men participate in value chains at the point where more capital and resources are required and profit margins are higher. The informal food markets in legumes (soybean, cowpea) and cereals (millet) –products relevant to ENVAC– are dominated by women when it comes to small-scale production, transformation and trade, while men dominate the wholesale trade. But even for commodities traded mostly by women, profits tend to go to the male head of household and male value chain actors tend to enjoy greater profits than their female counterparts. In formal markets such as supermarkets women can only play a greater role through participation in farm-based organizations (FBOs).
- 2. Specific challenges and constraints for women in agricultural value chains. Women and men generally face the same challenges and constraints in the agricultural value chain, though these tend to be more exacerbated for women than for men. Key constraints for women entering, operating and expanding within agricultural value chains relate to insufficiencies in (i) capital (including land ownership), (ii) access to credit and financial services (in part due to limited or lack of capital), (iii) skills and knowledge in agro-technology, (iv) extension services, (v) access to labour, storage facilities and, primarily for aggregators, (vi) transportation infrastructure. Gender disparities are clearly observed through the comparative advantage men enjoy over women at most stages of the agricultural commodity value chain.
- 3. Gaps and challenges in gender analysis and tracking women's empowerment. WFP VAM assessments conducted in Ghana rarely include sex and age disaggregated data or gender analysis. Whenever these specificities happen to be taken into consideration, it is in a limited manner and they do not compel programmatic recommendations to address gender-based or age-related issues. The 2016 Ghana Emergency Food Security and Market Assessment (EFSA) is an exception as it received direct gender technical support from RBD throughout the assessment process, resulting in a strong gender-sensitive evaluation of market dynamics. But even so, the focus of primary data collection on physical marketplaces and gaps in the collaboration between the VAM team in Ghana and other concerned Programme teams remain challenges for WFP.

At the government level, there are obvious gaps between strategic objectives and gender analytical capacity. Although gender equality and women's empowerment are acknowledged as part of government's goals, they are overshadowed by the lack of adequate tools and standards necessary for assessing and monitoring indicators.

4. Role of market-queens in high-value food commodity supply, distribution, and pricing. Market queens in Ghana are powerful actors who exercise control over several stages of the small-scale agricultural value chain, as well as in cross-border trade. They manage suppliers, transporters, wholesale and in-market purchases and sales of agricultural products, and decide and set market prices daily.

Market queens have the power to function as market regulators by manipulating prices using supplyside control. The key disadvantage is that market queens are able to create artificial commodity shortages to increase the price of their product and thereby increase their profit margins. Market queens can thus pose a direct threat to official market structuring and regulations, where informal market systems such as theirs constitute a serious economic hindrance for the country. Conversely, because market queens play a critical role in the movement of fresh produce from farms to markets, they are potentially valuable partners for value chain development activities.

5. **Programmatic solutions and value-added opportunities for women in associated markets.** Following the Framework validation and application in ENVAC, the WFP Ghana Country Office (CO) VAM team and CO Gender Results Network (GRN) members should share this tool with partners and request feedback on its usability in their Programmes. They should also be key actors in achieving the following objectives, with the support of RBD VAM and its Programmes and the HQ Gender Office.

• Improve gender analysis and reporting capacity among VAM and Programmes staff

To support the ENVAC team, the "Gender Analytical Framework for Assessing Value Chains" (referred to as "Framework" hereafter) was developed as the key output of this study. This tool is informed by identified gaps and responds to the particular assessment and monitoring approach planned for the ENVAC. The Framework will be presented and finalized at an inception workshop to be conducted by the ENVAC team in Accra with key stakeholders and partners.

• Adapt to support Humanitarian Programme Cycle

At the regional and global levels, the proposed framework and research contained in this case study should be promoted as an analytical model to support preparedness, and recovery and rehabilitation stages of the Humanitarian Programme Cycle. This should minimize the need for emergency response and support early recovery through resilience-oriented and market-based activities, such as ENVAC.

• Establish internal route(s) of communication of gender-sensitive information

Within WFP, a standard route of communication should be established between programmes and VAM to clearly communicate to VAM gender-related information needs before an assessment is conducted. This route would also be used by VAM to share findings before an intervention is designed.

• Promote adoption of Framework at government level to ensure sustainability

At the government level, efforts should be taken to work collaboratively towards developing government capacity by using the Framework and adapting it as necessary to collect, analyse and report on key gender figures in markets and value chains.



INTRODUCTION

In September 2015, the Vulnerability Analysis and Mapping team of the World Food Programme Regional Bureau for West and Central Africa launched a gender and market study to strengthen the collection and analysis of gender-informed data on the roles of women and men in markets of the region, their challenges and their empowerment. Following a desk review of current practices and available information in the region, a second phase of this initiative has been commissioned which consist in case studies to test and build on findings across a range of contexts and sub-regions. The primary objective of this second phase is to develop a set of practical examples of common gender and market information needs and constraints, and tools to respond to these needs. The present report focuses on the case study conducted in Ghana in collaboration with the WFP Ghana country office team engaged in the design of a value-chain development project.

Among the 9 countries included in this case study phase, Ghana serves as an example of comparatively stronger gender equality and better living conditions for women than other countries in the region. Moreover, it has historically recorded the second highest GDP rate in West Africa¹ behind Nigeria. Ghana was also selected to support the planned ENVAC project. ENVAC who will follow the Purchase for Progress (P4P) pilot in Ghana over the next 4 to 5 years has committed to adopting a genderresponsive market-based approach to enhance agricultural value chains for targeted commodities.

The country case studies that make up the regional Gender and Market initiative are conducted along a set of common guidelines to respond to key research questions established by the RBD VAM Gender and Markets study. The questions that follow are adapted from the common regional study methodology, to respond to the specific context of markets and WFP activities in Ghana:

- What are the roles of women and men in food markets in Ghana?
- What specific challenges do women face for economic inclusion in food markets?
- What are the current gender gaps in WFP market-based responses and assessments?
- What are the current gaps and challenges in gauging and tracking women's empowerment in markets?
- What role do "market queens" play in controlling the supply, distribution channels and pricing of high-value food commodities?
- What are potential programmatic solutions to address the identified challenges and gaps, and to improve women's opportunities in the trade of agricultural products (with emphasis on soybean in the Northern, cowpea in the Upper West and millet in Upper East)?

The Ghana case study focuses on the development of the ENVAC project which connects local smallscale processors with consumers to improve local processing capacity and availability of nutrient-rich local flour blends. The ENVAC project which expands on WFP's experience with the Purchase for Progress (P4P) initiative in Ghana is scheduled to run from 2016 to 2020. With an estimate of about 964.400 beneficiaries, the project will be implemented in the Ashanti, Brong Ahafo, Upper West, East and Northern regions. The ENVAC project goal is to achieve agricultural sustainability by adding value to staples and soil conservation in order to maintain and preserve ecosystems. The project is structured around three inter-linked pillars to address the full value chain of selected nutritious staple crops that are locally available:

• **Pillar 1:** Promoting crop production among smallholder farmers.

¹ World Bank national accounts data; OECD National Accounts data files.

- **Pillar 2:** Promoting crop processing through selected industrial processors and community-level processors.
- Pillar 3: Promoting a greater consumption of local crop outputs among the population in general, and nursing women and infants in particular.

The project which adopts a market-based approach to tackling nutrition concerns in Ghana aims at promoting smallholder farmers' participation in value chains to ultimately increase the production of nutritious complementary foods. This is achieved with the help of an awareness campaign among the general population, and particularly women, on the benefits of consuming such foods. The ENVAC project's objectives are to link smallholder farmers with quality markets, and simultaneously to intervene to treat moderate acute malnutrition and prevent stunting among women and children during the first 1,000 days using food-based approaches. This is achieved by effectively linking two ends of identified commodity-based value chains, from smallholder farmers as suppliers of quality staples to women and children as target consumers of nutritious foods. Pregnant and lactating women, and children are the targeted consumer groups for awareness campaigns on the benefits of local flour varieties, as these groups have been identified as the most vulnerable to malnutrition. In addition, valuechain development activities aim at empowering women smallholder farmers and small-scale processors to more effectively participate in the targeted value chains.²

This case study is most interested in pillars 1 and 2 of the ENVAC project and its beneficiaries who are not traditional beneficiaries of WFP programmes. It thus makes this project particularly interesting as a case study for the regional Gender and Markets initiative. WFP traditional assistance in Ghana has focused on nutrition programming for pregnant and lactating women through vouchers. While one group of ENVAC beneficiaries are pregnant and lactating women and children who will be impacted by the nutrition programming campaign, assistance provided under the market-based approach focuses largely on capacity-building instead of food aid. The main beneficiary groups planned for this latter portion of the project include:

- Smallholder farmers (targeted via FBOs, gender-specific and mixed) – ENVAC plans to impact 10,000 individual smallholder farmers;³
- Small-scale food processors (targeting approach to be determined: possible criteria include current or former partner groups, specifically including women processing groups; priority products selected based on this to entice farmers to meet demand and quality standard) – ENVAC plans to impact 30 processing groups.

The ENVAC project, just like P4P, emphasizes the positioning of women's empowerment and gender equality as cross-cutting goals, both in the capacity-building of women smallholder producers and small-scale processors, and in targeting consumers of nutritious commodities based on gender and age. The project seeks to empower both women farmers and processors to effectively participate in targeted commodity value chains, as well as to equip mothers with knowledge on proper complementary feeding practices.⁴

The ENVAC project focuses on the support of smallholder farmers to improve the production and quality of maize, cowpeas, soybeans and millet. It seeks to ensure that these products be either processed at community level into nutritious blended flours for sale to bakeries or for direct sale, or be sold to identified industrial processors who

² WFP Ghana. ENVAC Funding Proposal – Executive Summary. 2015.

³ It is important to acknowledge that in defining "smallholder farmer" most women may not meet the traditional criteria, as formal ownership tends to be held by men. As noted in the P4P Global Gender Strategy, it may thus be more helpful to think about women involved in agriculture as producers/marketers, unpaid family workers, producers/petty traders, and casual agricultural labourers (WFP. P4P Global Gender Strategy. 2011.).

⁴ WFP Ghana. ENVAC Funding Proposal – Executive Summary. 2015.

produce "super cereals" (i.e. maize and soybeans or millet and soybeans). ENVAC will support the increase in capacity of farmers' organizations and out-grower business models focused on these commodities. It will also provide technical and financial support to small-scale community-level processors of blended flours and the two industrial processors of super cereals. For the blended flours at community level, a social and behavioural change communication (SBCC)⁵ approach will be carried out to encourage communities to consume nutritious blended flours. As for the super cereals, they will be distributed through vouchers to WFP nutritious beneficiaries and SBCC/social marketing will be carried out to promote their wider adoption into the local and regional markets.

The key commodities of interest for this case study on gender dynamics in agricultural value chains are soybeans in the Northern region, cowpeas in the Upper West and millet in the Upper East. These commodities, for which women play a central role throughout the value chain in Ghana, are widely used to prepare blended flours and porridges for consumption local and use by local bakeries.⁶ Cowpeas have previously been supported through P4P, while soybeans and millet have not yet been included. The three commodities have been identified to increase women participation and economic inclusion in agricultural value chains.

This case study will thus focus on women's roles and constraints at different stages of the value chains under study, including investigation into commodity distribution channels and the role of "Market Queens", the influential women traders who exercise control over local markets. It will also look at how WFP and partners can better assess, analyse and respond to gender dynamics in such distribution channels and value chains in order to better support gender-equitable and market-based approaches to humanitarian action.

I. Objectives

The objective of the present study is to provide actionable information to the regional Gender and Markets initiative and support the WFP Ghana country office team in designing an appropriate implementation plan for the ENVAC. Specifically, the research process i) supports the Ghana ENVAC team by providing information on the subject material and market analysis tool(s) for appropriately conducting gender and empowerment analysis to inform the ENVAC implementation plan in June/July 2016; ii) contributes to the regional Gender and Markets initiative with a documented case study of gender dynamics and women's empowerment in a relatively stable market environment, and iii) provides an example of how assessment tools can be tailored to programmatic information needs.

To support the ENVAC team, a "Gender Analytical Framework for Assessing Value Chains" was developed as the key output of this study. The Framework will be presented and finalized at an inception workshop to be conducted by the ENVAC team in Accra with key stakeholders and partners. The Framework includes qualitative and quantitative methods and covers a range of ENVAC targeted groups that include smallholder farmers, small-scale processors, traders, farmer-based organizations, among others. Once the Framework is finalized at the outcome of the inception workshop, this tool will be used to inform the baseline assessment which will in turn inform the ENVAC implementation plan.

⁵ "SBCC for health is a research-based, consultative process that uses communication to promote and facilitate behaviour change and support the requisite social change for the purpose of improving health outcomes. To achieve social and behaviour change, SBCC is driven by epidemiological evidence and client perspectives and needs. SBCC is guided by a comprehensive ecological theory that incorporates both individual level change and change at broader environmental and structural levels. Thus, it works at one or more levels: the behaviour or action of an individual, collective actions taken by groups, social and cultural structures, and the enabling environment" (Manoff Group).

⁶ ENVAC staff. WFP Ghana CO. Research planning consultations. March-April 2016.

II. Context

The ENVAC project's market-based approach focuses on small-scale actors in the agricultural value chain and local procurement. This is a new and increasingly popular direction for WFP food assistance even though tools to collect gender-responsive data are lacking. There is consequently an opportunity for the regional Gender and Market initiative to investigate emerging WFP programmatic information needs on gender dynamics and empowerment in food markets, and develop tools and approaches to tailor assessments to those needs.

At the time of this study, the ENVAC project is in the design stages and an inception workshop with the Ghana country office (CO) staff and key partner inputs is planned for late-2016 to facilitate the finalization of the implementation plan. One aspect of the inception workshop will be to present a draft assessment, monitoring and evaluation framework. The scope of the study and the gender analytical framework included here (see Annex IV) will be presented in this workshop for validation. The ENVAC assessment will be at a smaller scale than the

one conducted to support the P4P. The assessment focuses primarily on the inflow and outflow of goods, looking at the production, sales and purchases, and at the proportion of produced goods that ends up in household consumption versus that which is sold or traded on the markets. The assessment should include different tools for different target groups, and should also use the tools and approach formerly used for P4P, though adjusted to a smaller scale.

III. Gender Context

The situation for women in Ghana is comparatively better than in most West African countries, though if compared globally, it is still quite challenging. According to the African Development Bank's 2015 Africa Gender Equality Index, Ghana performs strongest in the region in terms of gender equality, after Cape Verde. Similarly, the most recent UNDP figures on the region rank Ghana highest in the Gender Development Index and second lowest in the Gender Inequality Index after Senegal. Nonetheless, at the global level, Ghana's performance remain relatively low.⁷

Gender Development Index (2014)		Gender Inequality Index (2014)		Africa Gender Equality Index (2015)	
Norway (top ranked, globally)	0.996	Slovenia (top ranked, globally)	0.016	South Africa (top ranked, Africa)	74.5
Ghana	0.885	Senegal	0.528	Cape Verde	66.8
Senegal	0.883	Ghana	0.554	Ghana	62.3
Burkina Faso	0.881	Cameroon	0.587	Sierra Leone	57.6
Cameroon	0.879	Togo	0.588	Burkina Faso	56.6
Nigeria	0.841	Benin	0.614	Nigeria	54.7
Togo	0.831	Gambia	0.622	The Gambia	54.7
Benin	0.823	Burkina Faso	0.631	Benin	52.0
Sierra Leone	0.814	Sierra Leone	0.650	Senegal	51.9
Côte d'Ivoire	0.810	Liberia	0.651	Togo	49.5
Liberia	0.789	Mali	0.677	Liberia	48.4
Guinea	0.778	Côte d'Ivoire	0.679	Guinea-Bissau	47.7
Mali	0.776	Chad	0.706	Cameroon	46.7
Chad	0.768	Niger	0.713	Cote d'Ivoire	43.7
Niger	0.729			Chad	42.2

Table 1. Sources: ADB Africa Gender Equality Index 2015; UNDP Gender Development Index and Gender Inequality Index 2015

⁷ 2015 African Gender Equality Index; UNDP Gender Inequality Index & Gender Development Index

According to figures from the recent Ghana Emergency Food Security Assessment (EFSA, WFP 2016), 20.2% of women heads of households in Ghana's five regions have food insecurity compared to 15% of male heads of households.⁸



Figure 1. Food Security Groups, by gender of head of household

According to the 2016 EFSA and key informant interviews conducted for this study, women actors in the agricultural value chain are generally more vulnerable than their male counterparts, but they tend to have more control and a strong participatory role in production and in markets.

In Ghana, women enjoy legal protections and regulations designed to provide them with equal treatment in the labour market in terms of public and personal security, ownership, and other areas prone to discriminatory practices. The table below provides a list of legal indicators selected from the World Bank Gender Statistics database. It shows women enjoy the same legal rights as men in terms of land and property ownership, and that the constitution prohibits gender-based discrimination.

However, there are gaps in the protection of equal access to employment and equal remuneration for equal work for men and women. Moreover, according to key informant interviews and secondary resources, while land and property ownership is officially equal between women and men, in reality women experience significant discrimination.⁹ This theme is explored in greater depth in the "Land and Capital" part of Section 3 of this study which addresses women's challenges and constraints.

2015
No
No
Yes
Yes
Yes
Yes
No

⁸ WFP. Ghana Emergency Food Security Assessment (EFSA). VAM – WFP Ghana. 2016.

Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

⁹ African Development Fund (AFD). Ghana Country Gender Profile. 2008; Sarpong, D. B. Department of Agricultural Economics (University of Ghana). Written Interview. April 2016.

IV. Methodology

There are five elements in the methodology for this case study: 1) literature review of key publications, tools and project documents; 2) high-output meetings with WFP colleagues to establish ENVAC gender-responsive data and information needs; 3) review of past WFP VAM Ghana assessments to identify the extent to which past efforts meet gender information needs; 4) informant interviews with identified partners; and 5) a validation workshop with the ENVAC team to discuss and finalize findings.

Literature review

Key resources were identified and compiled based on recommendations from WFP Ghana staff and key informants. Additionally, P4P strategy documents were included to set standards for project documents and for the proposed analytical framework. Finally, data and analysis tools from WFP Ghana VAM, ENVAC and external partners engaged in relevant gender and market assessment activities were collected and assessed. The table in Annex II provides an overview of documents reviewed.

Review of VAM-Ghana Assessments

For the years 2010-2015, six WFP VAM assessments were conducted in Ghana, including one Comprehensive Food Security and Vulnerability Assessment (CFSVA) and four market assessments. The assessments were evaluated according to gender performance on: collecting and reporting data disaggregated by sex and age; conducting and reporting on sufficient gender analysis; how gender dynamics and other relevant disparities influenced results and recommendations; and whether any reference was made to women's empowerment. In addition to the six assessments, the WFP 2016 Ghana Emergency Food Security Assessment (EFSA) was conducted in parallel to the present case study research. Thus, this phase of the study also included a review of the 2016 EFSA process, and provided support to the VAM staff conducting the EFSA to

develop gender-sensitive data collection tools, conduct gender-sensitive analysis and reporting, and provide a gender-based evaluation of the final report.

Internal consultations

To assess the programmatic information needs, high-output meetings were conducted with the CO Ghana ENVAC team, VAM colleagues, and the Gender Focal Point. The meetings' objectives were to establish gender-responsive data and information needs to support ENVAC. Additional information was exchanged through preliminary discussions conducted via e-mail and telephone calls in the research planning phase.

Key informant interviews

Interviews were carried out with partners and stakeholders of the ENVAC project, as well as recommended key informants. These include partners from the University of Ghana, Monitoring, Evaluation and Technical Support Services (METSS)¹⁰, the Food Research Institute in Ghana, and government bodies, such as the Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection (MoGCSP), the Ministry of Food and Agriculture (MoFA), Women in Agricultural Development (WIAD) and the Statistical Research and Information Directorate (SRID). The complete list of informants is included in Annex I.

Validation of working group

To present findings to the implementing team and ensure the best possible approaches, a workgroup session was held with the ENVAC implementing team consisting of Programme staff and Monitoring and Evaluations Officers. Identified gaps and key areas of interest were presented, and qualitative information on agricultural value chains of interest was gathered. Several analytical tools were proposed for assessing gender dynamics in value chains relevant to the needs and priorities of ENVAC project staff expressed during consultations in research phase 3.

¹⁰ METSS is a joint initiative by the USAID, USDA and Kansas State University to assist the USAID/Ghana Mission's Economic Growth Office in monitoring the function and achievement of programmes receiving US funding for economic and agricultural development (For more details, see: <u>www.metss-ghana.k-state.edu</u>).

The ENVAC team was committed to provide feedback and inputs on the proposed analytical framework, and by the end of the workgroup session, several tools were identified as relevant and selection was made as to which would best fit the planned ENVAC assessment methodology. In particular, a set of adapted indicators and questions from the Women's Empowerment in Agriculture Index (WEAI) was specifically noted as having the most value in terms of supporting the team to assess empowerment in value chains, a cross-cutting goal for ENVAC.¹¹ Annex IV lists the adapted indicators which are set to be validated during the ENVAC stakeholder consultation.

V. Study limitations

The case study for Ghana was affected by two constraining factors. First, due to incongruent and limited timelines, primary data collection was not possible, as it was for case studies in other countries. Moreover, the original plan was to collect data during the 2016 Ghana EFSA which would inform the study throughout all phases. However, due to quality control issues in the first round of EFSA data collection, the timeline for reporting was delayed and primary data was not available until after the interviews and analysis phases of the case study had been completed.

In spite of these limitations, however, the study benefited from a high degree of qualitative information, as key informants filled the gap created by the lack of primary quantitative data. Furthermore, the adopted participatory approach allowed for the development and strengthening of partnerships with key actors over the course of the interview phase. In addition, the open informationsharing practice enticed key informant to collaborate with the project. The main practical output of the case study —the Gender Analytical Framework for Assessing Value Chains (see Annex IV) - was shared with all key informants, both to request their inputs on the tool, as well as to support capacity-building efforts in their particular sectors, from government ministries to national research centres to international organizations. This mutual exchange approach of sending information back to respondents had the positive effects of creating stronger ties with the respondents and reducing attrition in panel surveys. It is also expected that it will support the mobilization of respondents in the future.

¹¹ The WEAI is a tool developed by the International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI), Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative (OPHI) and USAID Feed the Future. The WEAI measures how empowered women are within five domains, including: decisions and agricultural production; access to and decision-making power over productive resources; control over use of income; leadership in the community; and time use (For more details, see the <u>WEAI Resource Centre</u>).

Photo: WFP/Amadou Baraze

1. Roles and responsibilities of women and men in agricultural value chains

The analysis of interviews with key informants and WFP colleagues, as well as primary data findings from the 2016 Ghana Emergency Food Security Assessment (EFSA) reveals manifest patterns on gender-specific roles and responsibilities in Ghana's agricultural value chains. Wherever possible, and to benefit the ENVAC project, the research focuses on the formal and informal soybean, cowpea and millet value chains, as these commodities tend to be produced by women smallholder farmers.¹²

Gender dynamics pertaining to specific commodities appeared to be influenced by societal factors (i.e., agricultural commodities are traditionally produced and traded by women) and economic factors (i.e., men tend to dominate where more capital is required and profit margins are higher, and particularly where products become commercialized).¹³ According to partners at the WIAD department of the MoFA, the typical agricultural product value chain is as follows:



Production – Women dominate small-scale agricultural production of most commodities, except when the product has a comparatively higher valueadded or is traditionally a "male-cultivated" product. For example, check-check is a stream of rice sold primarily by boys and men because the value-added is higher than that of the standard stream of rice primarily sold by women. In addition to their domestic responsibilities and tasks the in households, women are also responsible for agricultural cultivation.¹⁴ Women producers may sell goods at farm gates or other locations, but they are unlikely to keep or retain control over their profits once they return to their household.¹⁵

Aggregation – Most agricultural producers in Ghana are small-scale farmers, which makes the role of aggregators particularly important for wholesalers and market vendors in urban centres. Most often, women act as aggregators, traveling to the north of the country to buy food products from various producers and re-sell them in bulk to predominantly male wholesalers in the south. Youth, women and men, may also participate in the aggregation process, depending on the season and product. Some men are also working as aggregators but, unlike women, they do it at lower volumes and not throughout the year.¹⁶

There are two key risk factors for aggregators, both of which relate to transport: insecurity on roads and safety of poor road or vehicle infrastructure. These risks exacerbate the precarious situation of aggregators by exposing them to consequences of such dangerous transport conditions for the very low profit margins they get from this activity. In addition, due to the limited literacy of both producers and aggregators, contracts between these two groups

¹² ENVAC team. WFP Ghana CO. Preliminary Planning Consultations. April 2016.

¹³ Aniaku, V. WIAD (MoFA). Interview. April 2016; Kabutha, C. Ghana Agricultural Development and Value Chain Enhancement (ADVANCE) Programme – Gender Assessment. USAID; VOCA. Accra, Ghana. 2010.

¹⁴ Asare, C. Department of Gender (MoGCSP). Interview. April 2016.

¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ Ibid.

are often verbal and rely on trust, which increases risks for either side. At times, women aggregators may finance producers to ensure consistent supply and partnership.

Wholesale – Wholesalers are largely male located in urban centres. They possess comparatively more capital than other actors and are thus able to buy in larger quantities and further aggregate products to increase profit margins. Their larger capital resources enable them to also benefit from superior storage facilities to hold purchased goods, allowing them to sell according to price fluctuations. Wholesalers tend to buy products from predominantly women aggregators and re-sell goods at higher profit margins to small-scale women market vendors. They generally operate out of their own shops and are not physically present in large markets.

Markets - Small-scale market vendors of unprocessed agricultural products are typically women. They purchase their products from predominantly male wholesalers, or women aggregators, and sell them for limited profit margins. Because they operate on a small-scale, often lacking capital and storage facilities, they are not able to purchase large quantities of products, store products based on going prices or store products that are not sold, thereby decreasing their capacity for generating higher profit margins. There are exceptions to this however, as in the case of "market queens" who control all transactions pertaining to a particular commodity in a market. These women may be market trader association leaders or hold similarly powerful positions in the marketplace. They tend to have comparatively greater access to capital resources, storage facilities, and other assets, and are able to use their resources to control the marketplace and influence supply and demand and, thus, create artificial price fluctuations. Section 4 discusses in depth the unique role of market queens in Ghanaian agricultural value chains and their relative control over distribution channels for agricultural commodities.

The above model is meant to provide a picture of general gender dynamics of a simple agricultural value chain. It also aims at bringing up key issues in terms of how constraints and capacities, as well as societal norms, influence who plays what role and holds which responsibilities in supply channels. However, there are many exceptions to this model and complex variations depending on the commodity and context, and on whether the commodity will be processed or sold in raw form. For certain agricultural products predominantly produced by women, value chains are almost entirely women-controlled at all stages. Exceptions occur when the product becomes commercialized, that is, is sold in bulk and its profit margins increase. In such cases, men may enter the value chain, and the commodity may even become male-dominated at the point in the value chain where profit margins rise or profits are increased using large amounts of capital. This favours male actors as they tend to have greater access to capital than their female counterparts. Because of women's constraints in increasing their economic participation and income in value chains -which will be outlined in the following section— men are generally better able than women to fulfil the needs and take advantage of increased economic opportunities for a commodity.17

Specific to the commodities of interest for this study, cowpeas, soybeans and millet somehow diverge from the general value chain picture shown above, mainly in the area of processing. The small-scale production, processing and marketing of products sold on the informal legumes (soybean, cowpea) and cereals (millet) markets are dominated by women, while men dominate the wholesale trade.¹⁸ According to some reports however, men dominate in the production of cowpeas, with women participating to a lesser extent.¹⁹ Different types of processing exist for these three commodities. Cowpeas are processed for consumption by women

¹⁷ This is according to interviews with key informants, as well as the following reports: WFP. Ghana Emergency Food Security Assessment (EFSA). 2016; Hagan, E. N. & Opare, J. A. 2011.

¹⁸ Sarpong, D. B. Department of Agricultural Economics (University of Ghana). Written Interview. April 2016.

¹⁹ Asare, C. Department of Gender (MoGCSP). Interview. April 2016.

in their households, with little or no equipment and using very time-consuming methods. Men also engage in cowpea processing but for storing purpose, which increases their efficiency and, thus, potential profit margins above those of women processors.²⁰ Millet is produced primarily by men but it is processed largely by women, and soya beans are produced and processed primarily by women. More importantly even than who processes commodities, are the modes of processing which are highly gender-tailored in Ghana and often equate to different necessary inputs and profit margins.²¹ Men tend to aggregate these legumes and cereals and transport them across locations, while women retail these commodities in markets.²² In spite of women's dominance in market activities for selected commodities, profits tend to go to the male head of household.²³ In formal markets (i.e., supermarket chains), the role of women is only enhanced when they can actively participate in a value chain through farm-based organizations (FBOs). Unfortunately, women are usually marginalized in male-dominated FBOs.²⁴ And even in cases where FBOs are exclusively run by women, particularly in the northern regions, they are traditionally required to include a few male members in their governing structure (i.e. secretary, bookkeeper, etc.).²⁵

The 2016 Ghana EFSA generally reflects genderspecific patterns in market and value chain participation, and provides some details on specific commodities.²⁶ According to results, 79.9% of traders surveyed in physical markets are women and 20.1% are men. This supports the pattern described by key informants that women dominate the physical marketplace for agricultural commodities. The Northern and Ashanti Regions have the largest number of male traders at 20% and 27% respectively (see chart below).



Figure 2. Number of Traders, by gender and by region

For the type of trade activity, 70.8% of male traders

and 72.2% of women traders are retailers, while

Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

²⁰ Aniaku, V. WIAD (MoFA). Interview. April 2016.

²¹ Asare, C. Department of Gender (MoGCSP). Interview. April 2016.

²² Sarpong, D. B. Department of Agricultural Economics (University of Ghana). Written Interview. April 2016.

²³ Asare, C. Department of Gender (MoGCSP). Interview. April 2016.

²⁴ Sarpong, D. B. Department of Agricultural Economics (University of Ghana). Written Interview. April 2016.

²⁵ Kaye, Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.

²⁶ For more detailed information on the food security and markets context in Ghana, see 2016 Ghana EFSA.

wholesale trade is conducted by 25.5% of males and 26.6% of women. Few collectors were surveyed for the EFSA, as only 2.8% of male traders and 0.5% of women traders are collectors. This data does not support the gender-specific trends described by key informants and recorded in secondary sources that

men are disproportionately involved in bulk buying and women in retail buying.²⁷ However, these surveys were conducted in physical market places where, according to WIAD key informant, wholesalers and aggregators would be significantly less frequent.²⁸



Figure 3. Type of Trade Activity, by gender

The highest proportion of retailers are in the Ashanti Region, while the largest proportion of wholesale traders are in the Upper West Region.



Figure 4. Type of Trade Activity by region

²⁸ Aniaku, V. WIAD (MoFA). Interview. April 2016.

Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

²⁷ Sarpong, D. B. Department of Agricultural Economics (University of Ghana). Written Interview. April 2016; Aniaku, V. WIAD (MoFA). Interview. April 2016; Kabutha, C. Gender Assessment – Ghana Agricultural Development and Value Chain Enhancement (ADVANCE) Programme. USAID; VOCA. Accra, Ghana. 2010.

According to EFSA results, women traders tend to sell a broader range of local food products than their male counterparts. While the EFSA report does not discuss why this may be, based on key informant interviews, it could be linked to the facts that male traders are not only better able to target and trade in specific goods based on saleability and potential for higher profit margins, but also, they purchase in bulk rather retail. For example, maize is the main local commodity sold by 34% of traders, and more often by men traders than women traders. About 42.7% of male traders identified maize as the main local product sold, and 15.1% pointed to yam instead. Among women traders, only 30.6% identified maize as the main local product sold, and 7.4% pointed to millet (before yams). In the Upper East Region, where there are more local rice traders (25%) than maize and millet traders, men traders are primarily engaged in the sale of local rice (25%), maize (12.5%), imported rice (50%) and yam (12.5%). By contrast, women traders sell a wider range of food items, with the top four items being millet (18.2%), maize (16.7%), local rice (15.2%), and cowpea (10.6%). In the Northern Region, 60% of men traders sell maize as the main local product while 15% pointed to yam. By contrast, 41.5% of women traders

in the region sell maize and 17% pointed to millet.²⁹

Another possible explanation is linked to the labourintensiveness of certain crops. Specifically, maize is less labour-intensive than soybeans or millet, and men tend to be attracted by crops that require less processing.³⁰ There are also social factors at play in terms of gendered practices in the culture of bargaining and socializing, which may contribute to more women ending up with market product retailing activities while men focus on bulk buying and selling. Ultimately, further investigation needs to be conducted into the multiple explanations on why women traders tend to sell a broader range of local food products than their male counterparts, particularly in comparison to economic performance in a marketplace. It is however equally important to know, in addition to the range of products sold, what the end result in terms of economic profitability is.³¹

Key informants reported gender disparities in the access to storage facilities which hinder women capacity to respond to increased demands. But in spite of such reports, 2016 EFSA results reflect relatively equal capacity of women and men traders to respond to increased demands.



Figure 5. Traders' capacity to respond to increased demand, by gender

Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

²⁹ WFP. Ghana EFSA. 2016.

³⁰ Kaye, N. Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.

³¹ Ibid.

As the above graph shows, in the event of a substantial increase in demand, 49.3% of traders have the capacity to increase supply to meet this demand in a week or less and 28.5% have the capacity to meet the increased demand in less than 2 weeks. 50.9% of men traders and 48.9% of women traders have the capacity to respond in a week or less. There is slightly greater disparity based on the type of market activity, where 56.7% of collectors, 52.1% of wholesale traders, and 48.4% of retailers have the capacity to respond to an increase in demand for commodities within a week.

Disparities are comparatively greater based on region. The Ashanti and Volta regions have the structural advantage of being production zones with agricultural surplus, while the three northern regions are often categorized as structurally food deficient zones.³² According to the EFSA, in each of the Northern, Upper East, Upper West and Brong Ahafo regions, more than 50% of traders have the capacity to respond to increased demand in a week or less while in the Volta and Ashanti Regions, it is respectively 30.1% and 41.2%.



Figure 6. Traders' capacity to respond to increased demand for food commodities, by activity

Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

There appears to be some gender disparity in the volume of clients compared to actual sales reported by traders in the 2016 EFSA survey. Approximately 61.1% of traders are of the view that the number of clients purchasing their goods have increased, with more positive reporting from men traders (68.9%) compared to women traders (59.1%). The gender disparity disappears in actual sales however, with 23.6% of men traders reporting increases in sales between 10% and 50%, compared to 25.2% of women traders. Furthermore, 16.1% of men traders report decreases in sales between 10% and 50%,

compared to 15.4% of women traders. If respondents are correct in their reporting on shifts in number of clients and sales, it would seem that while women enjoy slightly higher, if not equal, numbers of sales to their male counterparts, male traders are experiencing greater increases in the number of clients purchasing their goods. This may however also be the result of a higher level of optimism among men traders compared to women traders. Gender disparities are also significantly impacted by the gender differentiation between selling in bulk versus retail, where these different roles carry

³² Ibid.

different weights when it comes to quantifying

Women traders surveyed are more likely than male traders to change supply sources when faced with new challenges and constraining factors. The 2016 EFSA found that, as a result of increases in the cost of transportation and production pattern, 22.3% of women traders reported changing their supply sources since the start of the trading activity, compared to 14.2% of men traders who reported doing so. This may be explained by the fact that men are more likely to borrow a hauling truck and monetary funds to transport products to a given destination if they believe they can secure a market. Conversely, lacking financial resources and borrowing power, women are less likely to take number of clients versus sale values.³³

similar risks to follow a potential market if they do not already have the means.³⁴

Market traders' clientele are predominantly women, according to the EFSA results. More than 75% of surveyed traders working as retailers, and operating in the Ashanti, Brong-Ahafo, Upper West, and Volta regions, as well as women traders reported that most of their clients are women, as shown in the tables below. This is reportedly because women are still predominantly responsible for purchasing food and preparing meals within their household. They therefore go to retailers to make provisions for household food needs.³⁵



Figure 7. Clientele gender, by trader region, trader activity and trader gender

³³ Kaye, N. Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.

³⁴ Ibid.

³⁵ Ibid.



Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

In terms of credit and financial services, surveyed women and men traders reported similar circumstances, though related challenges tend to be disproportionately felt by women, according to EFSA figures and interviews with key informants. Approximately 75.3% of traders self-finance their trade, compared to 7.2% who rely on banks. The proportion of self-financed traders is similar for both men and women (79.2% and 74.3% respectively). This is partially due to the general unavailability of credit at the national level. Compared to neighbouring countries, it is very expensive to borrow money in Ghana and with a current interest rate of 25.6%, it is understandable that few farmers (men in general and women in particular) rely on banks to borrow money.³⁶ The significant reliance on self-financing may exacerbate gender disparities in earnings, where women are reportedly less likely to have access to equal amounts of financial or otherwise productive capital as their male counterparts.³⁷ Gender disparities are greatest between those who receive funding from banks versus clients. While 10.2% of women traders reported clients as their main source of funding, only 3.8% of men traders responded the same. Conversely, 9.8% of men traders reported banks as their main source of funding, compared to 6.7% of women traders. Unfortunately, EFSA data collection tools did not allow respondents to include commodity-based associations as a survey option.

³⁶ Kaye, N. Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.
³⁷ Ibid.



Figure 8. Source of funding by trader gender

Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

All types of traders across the six regions surveyed for the EFSA purchase food commodities on credit basis. Stock purchase on credit by men traders is slightly lower than that of women traders (58.2% against 62%, respectively). Disparities in this regard are widely geographical however, as most traders in the Upper East and Upper West (55.4% and 57.9% respectively) do not purchase goods on credit –a situation that could indicate a lack of access to such facilities. By contrast, up to 60% of traders in the Brong Ahafo, Volta and Ashanti Regions purchase their goods on credit. Among those who receive goods on credit, 76.7% do not have to pay any interest, while 15.1% are charged an interest between 1% and 9%. Such disparities are linked to surplus production regions versus deficit regions. People in surplus regions have more confidence in stocking purchases on credit than those in deficient regions, as the latter are more aware of production performance affected by seasonal irregularities.³⁸



Figure 9. Stock purchase on credit, by trader gender

The number of employees traders have reflects the size and profitability of their enterprise. Surveyed men traders are more likely to have employees than

women traders: 42.5% of men traders have at least one employee compared to 24.7% of women traders. Of all traders surveyed, about 28.3% have

³⁸ Ibid.

Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

employed others to assist in their business: 10% of these employed at least one person while 74.5% employed between 2 and 5 people.

According to a 2011 Rapid Gender Analysis of Ghana Commercial Agriculture Project (GCAP), women formed an estimated 52% of the labour force in the agricultural sector with a contribution between 55% and 60% of the total agricultural output. Additionally, 70% of food crop growers, 95% of actors in agricultural processing and 85% in food distribution are women.³⁹

Figures from the World Bank show the percentage of employed women is higher in the service sector and lower in the agricultural sector compared to men. In 2013, 34% of all men employed were engaged in the service industry, compared to 48.2% engaged in agriculture. Comparatively, 47.3% of all women employed in 2013 were engaged in the service sector, while 41.4% were engaged in agriculture. Participation for both women and men in the agricultural sector has increased in recent years, while it has decreased in the service sector.



Figure 10. Staff Employment by gender





Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

Source: World Bank Databank – Gender Statistics

³⁹ Hagan, E. N. & Opare, J. A. final Report on Rapid Gender Analysis of the Ghana Commercial Agriculture Project (GCAP) – Accra Plains and the Savannah Zone. Government of Ghana; World Bank. 11 Dec 2011.

Women are less likely than their male counterparts to receive a formal wage or salary, and are more likely to be vulnerably employed. In 2010, the large majority of women employed in Ghana (84.3%) were vulnerably employed. The majority of employed men were also engaged in vulnerable employment, though to a lesser extent than women, at 68.9%. Additionally, 25.3% of men employed received wages or salary, compared to just 11.4% of employed women.



Source: World Bank Databank – Gender Statistics

In 2014, less than 10% of women over 15 years of age received wages in the previous year, compared to 20.3% of men of the same age. Similarly, though less

pronounced, 26% of women received payments for agricultural products in the previous year, compared with 33.9% of men.

Figure 13. Payments & Wages received, by gender (2014)



Source: World Bank Databank – Gender Statistics

Finally, in assessing the roles and responsibilities of female actors in agricultural value chains, it is important to consider that for every identified pattern there will be a list of exceptions, depending on the particular context and other social factors beyond gender (i.e. age, ability, economic class, ethnic group, religion, etc.). Women and men are not homogenous groups and value chain participation, while heavily gendered in many ways, is also influenced by other factors. Dynamics also change depending on the seasons, the mode of production and processing, the introduction of new technologies, and market shifts in supply and demand. As for the subsequent section on women's challenges and constraints, information provided here is meant to serve as a foundation for seeking out new elements and regularly updating old data on gender dynamics at play within agricultural value chains. This will be necessary to promote genderequitable programming and women's empowerment, where female actors are otherwise marginalized.



2. Specific challenges and constraints for women in agricultural value chains

Women and men generally share the same challenges and constraints for operating in agricultural value chains, though these tend to be more exaggerated for women than for their male counterparts.⁴⁰ Key constraints for women entering, operating and expanding within agricultural value chains are (i) access to capital, including land ownership, (ii) access to credit and financial services, in part due to limitation or lack of capital, (iii) skills and knowledge of agro-technology, (iv) extension services, (v) storage facilities and, (vi) primarily for aggregators, transportation infrastructure.⁴¹ Access to labour at opportune periods in productive activity cycles is also critical, since male farmers are likely to hog available labour to the detriment of women farmers.42

These are the primary constraints for women towards achieving and increasing economic inclusion in high-profit margin agricultural value chains. Constraints also tend to be inter-dependent: for example, limited capital impacts access to storage structures, credit and financial services, as well as capacity to invest in productive inputs such as transportation and processing or agricultural technologies. In addition, societal norms and practices pertaining to knowledge and education, leadership and participation (in FBOs and gendered domestic responsibilities, for example) can pose challenges for women producers and other women actors which do not affect men in the same ways. In spite of comparatively strong rates of gender equality relative to neighbouring countries, women's inferior social status in Ghana is further reflected in

the high incidence of illiteracy among women, low self-esteem and heavy work load.⁴³

According to the EFSA results, traders in the six regions surveyed are confronted with a number of constraints which either limit their capacity to expand or reduce the profitability of their trade. Some 49.3% of traders are affected by the lack of capital, while low market demand affects only 9.9%. Women traders are approximately 10% more likely than their male counterparts to be affected by the lack of capital (51.1 and 42.5% respectively). They are also more likely to be affected by low market demand than male traders (10.7% vs 6.6% respectively). Poor product quality is also a greater concern for women traders, where no male traders reported this as a concern. Other constraints include lack of storage space, irregular supply of commodities and high cost of credit facilities. It is important to consider the quantity or volume and diversity of products a trader is responsible for as this can significantly impact the market demand experienced by the trader. For example, depending on whether the trader is selling one or multiple products, the producer may or may not be able to fulfil the demand in a timely fashion.44

At the household level, food insecurity in households headed by women is also linked to limited access to land and agricultural inputs as control over essential natural resources rest with their male counterparts, according to 2016 EFSA results. By virtue of the unequal access to resources (i.e. land, credit and extension services), women's ability to produce

⁴⁰ WFP. Ghana Emergency Food Security Assessment (EFSA).

⁴¹ Sarpong, D. B. Department of Agricultural Economics (University of Ghana). Written Interview. April 2016.

⁴² Kaye, N. Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.

⁴³ World Bank. World Data Bank Gender Statistics (on literacy). Accessed July 2016.; Hagan, E. N. & Opare, J. A. Rapid Gender Analysis of the Ghana Commercial Agricultural Project (GCAP) – Accra Plains and the Savannah Zone. Government of Ghana; World Bank. 2011.

⁴⁴ Kaye, N. Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.

enough and gain adequate access to food is constrained. Households headed by women are primarily involved in agricultural production (45%), trading (20.1%) and agro-pastoral (19.8%) activities. About 7.3% of women-headed households are smallholder farmers cultivating less than 2 acres, compared to less than 1% of their male counterparts. Among the reasons for the decrease in agricultural products harvested in Ghana the previous year, a larger proportion of households headed by women pointed to limited access to inputs and lack of financial resources to expand production. According to WFP staff, access to labour is a critical factor influenced by the producer gender.⁴⁵ Furthermore, a larger proportion of households headed by women (61% versus 53% of households headed by men) are engaged in coping strategies due to lack of food or money to buy food.



Figure 14. Greatest constraints or challenges for business activities

Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

Land and Capital

In Ghana, 80% of the total land area is customarily owned by clans and families. The state owns 18% while the remaining 2% is held in dual ownership by individual beneficiaries and the state: the beneficiary interest is held by the community and the legal right is vested in the state.⁴⁶ Acquisition of land is both a main challenge for women, as well as a necessary factor for moving women's activities from consumption and small-scale trade, to marketing and higher profit margins.⁴⁷ Governing law in Ghana does not formally favour either women or men. However, in practice, gender is a key determinant in how individuals gain primary and secondary rights over land. Ghana has a plural system of land tenure governed by both customary and formal land administration systems, where approximately 80% of rural land is regulated by customary law under the

⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶ Ministry of Justice (2003). State Land Management Regime. Impact on land rights of Women and the Poor in Ghana, Access to Justice Series, No 2, Ghana Publishing Corporation (Assembly Press).

⁴⁷ Asare, C. Department of Gender (MoGCSP). Interview. April 2016.

custodian guardianship of traditional authorities. According to such customary law, all members of lineage are entitled to usufruct rights⁴⁸ regardless of gender, but there is often informal discrimination against women in practice. Furthermore, with regard to their limited access to labour, women cannot establish land ownership through land clearing as this is traditionally a male task.⁴⁹





Women are significantly less likely than men to own a house or land, according to 2014 figures from the World Bank. Women are additionally more likely than men to not own either a house or land, and less likely to own a house or land jointly, as shown in the chart above.

In Ghana, women's ability or right to own land and have decision-making power in general is very much influenced by whether or not they are in patrilineal or matrilineal systems of inheritance. At the same time, regardless of which inheritance system a woman finds herself in, other considerations are at play in deciding her right to own land or property and make decisions, and such considerations may or may not be in line with what is perceived to be customary laws.⁵⁰ According to the Consultative Group on International Agricultural Research (CGIAR) Research Program on Policies, Institutions, and Markets (PIM) in collaboration with the International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI), land ownership patterns differ widely depending on marital and inheritance legal regimes. This is demonstrated using Ecuador, Ghana and Karnataka (in India) as examples, where women constituted 51% of landowners in Ecuador, 38% in Ghana, and only 20% in Karnataka. Differences in marital status and legal inheritance rights of record help explain these shares. In Ecuador, the default rule is that assets acquired during marriage belong to both partners, and male and female children inherit property equally. In Ghana and India, on the other hand, assets acquired during marriage belong solely to the person who purchased them (de facto disadvantaging women) and inheritance regimes tend to favour sons.⁵¹

Source: World Bank Data Bank - Gender Statistics

⁴⁸ Usufruct rights refer to the right to use and profit from property (i.e. land, capital, etc.) belonging to another party (Merriam-Webster Dictionary).

⁴⁹ African Development Fund (AFD). Ghana Country Gender Profile. 2008.

⁵⁰ Kaye, Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.

⁵¹ Deere C. D and Doss, C. 2014. Women's land ownership and decision-making. IFPRI & CGIAR Consortium. PMI quarterly Newsletter.

Access to Credit and Financial Services

A high proportion of women traders surveyed in the 2016 EFSA are affected by lack of capital, and a lower proportion of women traders have access to bank accounts and are more involved in the purchase of

goods on credit. These conditions inherently affect their access to formal credit and financial services, and therefore, their businesses' profitability and ability to expand. This ultimately exacerbates food insecurity among women, and particularly in the households they head.



Figure 16. Bank account, by gender

In general, financing opportunities on the local market are limited in Ghana due to the high interest rates on bank loans that are generally above 25%. There are twenty-six relatively small commercial banks in Ghana.⁵² According to the 2016 EFSA, about 59.2% of traders have a bank account, with 78.3% of men traders having access to bank accounts compared to only 54.4 percent for their women counterparts. Since access to and use of banking facilities at times determine the customer's ability to obtain a loan, men traders are likely to have a greater access to bank credit than women traders. Among traders with access to bank accounts, 45.8% have accounts with the Ghana Commercial Bank, and 35.3% with the Group Ndoum Bank.

Lack of Storage structure

Access to storage by value chain actors in Ghana is gendered in large part due to economic inequality as women are less likely than their male counterparts to have the necessary capital to afford storage facilities. According to trader responses recorded in the 2016 EFSA, more than 60% of male traders report storing their stock in their personal storage located in the market, compared to just 33% of women traders. Conversely, women traders were significantly more likely than men traders to store goods in their home (28.5% versus 5.7%).

In terms of storage strategy and experienced seasonal stock shortages however, the gender disparity appears to be less significant between traders. The stock management strategy of some traders entails purchasing and storing cereals at harvest, which are then sold later when stocks are low and prices are likely to be higher. EFSA results show that about 55.3% of men traders and 56.8% of women traders stored food commodities from the previous agricultural season. However, disparities are more apparent by market activity where 64.4% of wholesale traders and 100% of collectors stored food commodities from the previous agricultural season, compared to 51.1% of retailers. Among traders who stored food commodities after the harvest in order to sell at higher prices in 2014-2015, 71% stored less than 100kg compared to 20.3% who put more than 1 metric tons in storage.

Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

⁵² African Economic Outlook. Market Structure, Country Profiles: Ghana. Accessed June/July 2016.

One influential factor in establishing need for storage facilities is availability or volume of produce to be stored. As described throughout this study, women traders tend to be less likely to have excess quantities of produce that would need to be stored in anticipation of more lucrative market conditions.⁵³

Half of the traders (50.9%) experience stock-outs during the rainy season, with little difference between women and men traders. This is a period when access to some markets becomes constrained due to deterioration in road conditions.





Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016





Half of the traders (50.9%) experience stock-outs during the rainy season, with little difference between women and men traders. This is a period

when access to some markets becomes constrained due to deterioration in road conditions.

Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

⁵³ Kaye, N. Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.

Road Infrastructure and Transportation Services

The main challenges for aggregators in the agricultural value chain are access to transportation services, sufficient road infrastructure and relatedly, security. These challenges are greater felt by less enfranchised aggregators who tend to be women or youth. Men reportedly are more likely to have transportation equipment, and thus pay less than women aggregators to move goods. Transportation costs are generally shared between cultivator and aggregator.⁵⁴

Extension Services

According to the 2015 Ghana Gender and Agricultural Development Strategy II (GADS II) of the Ministry of Food and Agriculture, extension coverage is generally low, particularly among small-scale farmers where women predominate. Specifically, frequency of access among men and women farmers was respectively 34.4% and 9.5%, which is higher than other agricultural value chain actors. The four most significant extension-related barriers identified in the GADS II include: 1) proximity to extension agents; 2) actors' personal perception that they do not need such services; 3) lack of knowledge of the existence of these services; and 4) inability to find service officers. Additionally, of the Agricultural Extensions Agents (AEAs), only 13% are women, with a ratio of 1 agent in 1,500 women though it is required that the ratio be at least 1 agent in 500. One reason, according to the report, is that it is easier to approach men farmers than women farmers and, unlike women farmers, men farmers most of the time take the initiative to inquire about issues on extension services.55

The gender assessment of the Ghana Agricultural Development and Value Chain Enhancement

(ADVANCE) Program also found that men seek more technical advice than women, in part because they own large farms which extension agents tend to visit. Women on the other hand seek more processing information. Men also participate more than women in technical training, which can be partly attributed to women's double-burden of domestic and productive responsibilities, which limits their available time. However, it was also found that when training services were held on farms close to women's homes, they were more likely to participate.⁵⁶

Agro-technology & Skills

Gender disparities in agro-technological knowledge and skills limit women participation and earning power, both at the production stage of the value chain, and in processing and marketing. Men tend to enter production and processing stages when equipment and advanced technologies are introduced. This is in part due to necessary operational skill and physical capacity disparities between women and men. According to key informants at WIAD and the MoGCSP, women often consult male parties to act as advisor in deciding such market factors as pricing and management, and operation of technological inputs. Even in womenonly FOs, a male party may be invited to advise members on such themes. Such requests for male participation on women-run production plots, or process, may be influenced as well by socio-cultural norms on gender roles in operating labour-intensive or technical equipment. The most visible exception to this, however, is the 'market queen' (see section 4).⁵⁷ In addition to disparities in knowledge, wherever cultivation is energy and labour intensive, women are also likely to hire male labour for which added costs translate into decreased profits for women producers compared to men producers.⁵⁸

⁵⁴ Aniaku, V. WIAD (MoFA). Interview. April 2016.

⁵⁵ Women in Agricultural Development (WIAD). Gender and Agricultural Development Strategy II (GADS II). Ministry of Food & Agriculture (MoFA). Accra, Ghana. 2015.

⁵⁶ Kabutha, C. Ghana Agricultural Development and Value Chain Enhancement (ADVANCE) Programme – Gender Assessment. USAID; VOCA. Accra, Ghana. 2010.

⁵⁷ Aniaku, V. WIAD (MoFA). Interview. April 2016; Asare, C. Department of Gender (MoGCSP). Interview. April 2016; Nanam & Torto. Food Research Institute. Interviews. April 2016.

⁵⁸ Asare, C. Department of Gender (MoGCSP). Interview. April 2016.

Education

There are significant differences in education between women, men, girls and boys. World Bank figures (shown below) from 2010 show that as many as 43% of women over 25 years of age in Ghana have no schooling, compared to 26.6% of men. While

nearly three-quarters of men (73.4%) have at least completed primary school, only 57% of women have done so. Such disparities reflect the comparatively lower social status of women to men, and the gap in access to information and possibly in opportunities for intellectual growth.



Figure 19. Educational Attainment, by gender (2010)

Results from the 2016 EFSA also show that most traders surveyed (61.7%) had no education while the remainder had at least some primary education. Women traders were significantly more likely than men trader to have no education, with 66.5% reporting this being the case, compared to 42.5% of male traders. Conversely, men traders were more likely to have a primary, secondary or university level of education than women traders.



Figure 20. Level of Education, by trader gender

Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

Source: World Bank Databank – Gender Statistics


3. Gaps and challenges in gender analysis and in tracking women's empowerment

To assess gaps in current analytical practices by WFP and partners, an evaluation of food security and market assessments was conducted by WFP VAM in Ghana in the period 2011-2015. Challenges were identified first-hand during the development of the 2016 Ghana EFSA, and also through meetings with relevant staff. Furthermore, gaps and challenges at government and partner levels were assessed to identify opportunities for collaboration in providing information to inform and build on WFP gender analysis capacity, as well as to improve government partner capacity in this area.

Of the five WFP VAM assessments conducted in

Ghana in 2011-2015, two have no mention of gender analysis or sex and age disaggregated data. Two of those which do disaggregate data according to sex and age fail to sufficiently integrate gender analysis of reported figures. And the only assessment which does integrate disaggregated data and gender analysis does not translate findings into conclusive statements or recommendations for better targeting gender-equitable programming or promotion of women's empowerment through WFP action. None mentions women's of the assessments empowerment or related indicators such as decision-making and control over productive assets.

Type of assessment	Year	Sex/age disaggregation of data	Gender analysis	Analysis of women's empowerment	Related recommendations
CFSVA	2013	Х	Х	0	0
<u>Market Assessment in</u> <u>Fentantaa, Egyeikrom and</u> <u>Ampain Refugee Camps</u>	2014	Х	0	0	0
Rapid Market Assessment in Tamale, Bolgatanga and Wa	2012	Х	0	0	0
The international rise in maize and wheat prices and its potential impact on food security in West Africa (market assessment)	2012	0	0	0	0
<u>Crise rizicole, évolution des</u> <u>marchés et sécurité</u> <u>alimentaire en Afrique de</u> <u>l'Ouest (market assessment)</u>	2011	0	0	0	0

Table 2. Source: WFP VAM Shop Assessments - Ghana

In parallel with the present case study, the 2016 Ghana EFSA was supported by the Gender and Markets initiative, and received direct gender technical capacity support from the West Africa Regional Bureau. As part of this support, the Ghana market assessment questionnaires for traders, transporters and market key informants were adapted by the regional VAM team and Gender Specialist to include questions on women's empowerment in markets, and to ensure the collection of gender-sensitive market information. Following the completion of the data collection phase, support was provided in analysing figures using a gender-responsive approach during the development of the final report. The result of these efforts is a comparatively stronger report in terms of gender-responsiveness, which includes sex and age disaggregated data on market participation and roles in the agricultural value chains. However, while the market assessment adequately reflects gender analysis, other aspects of the assessment are less gender-sensitive such as intra-household dynamics and unpaid domestic or agricultural labour. In addition, the exclusive focus of primary data collection on the physical marketplace limits significantly the extent to which value chain participation can be assessed. This is likely one of the main reasons for clear discrepancies between key informant information on gender dynamics at different stages of a value chain and reported figures in EFSA results (i.e., EFSA results show more male aggregators than women aggregators, and a proportional percentage of women and men wholesalers). The EFSA report also implies a lack of collaboration between the Ghana VAM team and affected Programme teams as information and analysis reported do not reflect gender-equality and women's empowerment objectives adopted by programme strategies and country projects.⁵⁹

Similar gaps between strategic objectives and gender analytical capacity are apparent at the government level. Interviews with the MoGCSP, WIAD of the MoFA, and the SRID of the MoFA noted a divide between gender equality and women empowerment as governmental goals, as well as the lack of adequate tools and standards necessary for assessing and monitoring associated indicators. This was particularly a concern in terms of gender dynamics in markets and value chains, where women's economic empowerment is a key focus area for the National Gender Policy and the GADS II.⁶⁰

The SRID Market Services unit is the responsible body for conducting food market assessments. According to SRID staff interviewed, the lack of

practical and accessible tools for integrating gender into food security assessments, and particularly for market assessments, is a fundamental challenge. SRID market analysis reportedly focuses on prices and commodities and uses farm gate data to generate prices, costs of inputs, transport, and livestock sales. Little to no integration of sexdisaggregated data or gender analysis is included. The SRID Gender Focal Desk further clarified that where sex and age disaggregated data is collected it is not analysed or reported on, and the importance of doing so is not widely acknowledged. Data disaggregation, wherever it exists, is limited to the sex of the head of household. However, MoFA key informants shared future plans by the ministry to assess whether it is necessary to expand gender analysis and establish what specific data in areas of interest should be analysed. At the time of the interview, the SRID team was actively working with WIAD on this challenge and had prioritised identification of gender indicators for SRID surveys as the first priority. According to the SRID Gender Focal Desk, the next step is a discussion with key management to determine what information is needed on gender dynamics and, from there, develop tools and an analytical framework which address identified information needs.

While government-led market and food security assessments remain largely gender-blind, WIAD gender analysis activities are also limited in terms of data collection and analysis in market and agricultural value chains. As noted, WIAD has begun the process of working with SRID to improve data collection and analysis. However, it is still in the design stages and only limited changes have thus far been implemented. The WIAD, while not directly collecting or analysing gender-responsive market data, does make use of the available price data to the empowerment of predominantly women smallholder farmers and vendors. Specifically, the programme uses radio messaging and public reporting to communicate prices for key

⁵⁹ WFP. Purchase4Progress Global Gender Strategy. 2011; WFP. Examining Protection and Gender in Cash and Voucher Transfers. 2013; WFP. ENVAC Conceptual Framework (submitted to DFTAD). Accra, Ghana. 2016.

⁶⁰ <u>Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection (MoGCSP). Ghana National Gender Policy. Accra, Ghana. 2015</u>; Ministry of Food and Agriculture (MoFA). Gender and Agricultural Development Strategy II (GADS II). WIAD (MoFA). Accra, Ghana. 2015.

commodities of interest. While there is not at this time evidence to assess to what extent such activities do empower women smallholder farmers, women make up the majority of smallholder farmers and small-scale vendors and are disproportionately vulnerable to limited access to price information in the country.⁶¹

The described lack of data and analysis makes it difficult to assess the success of efforts in adding value to products and communicating prices which are intended to promote women's empowerment. Furthermore, the lack of a clear definition or understanding and categorization of which indicators could constitute women's empowerment further hinders analysis on whether and how price information and increased profit margins in fact promote women's empowerment. At the same time, current government capacity to implement more sustainable women's empowerment-promotion activities is limited, making more in-depth data analysis unfortunately unnecessary. Another possible explanation proposed during the WIAD interview is the fact that most government data on gender dynamics in markets and value chains is collected and analysed by WIAD in the context of project monitoring and reporting, and thus is directly tied to pre-determined project focuses. In other

words, because most activities focus on women smallholder producers, it is unlikely that information will be collected and challenges identified for other groups, such as market queens for example. Similarly, data collected on gender equality is typically limited to gender balance in participation to activities and programmes. It does not reflect information on the quality of participation, which women and which men are participating, and whether all participants are equally able to subsequently apply and benefit from developed skills and knowledge.

Tracking Empowerment

Beyond reinforcing women's economic inclusion in value chains, it is also critical women are sustainably empowered, either through social, economic or institutional means. Assessments that fail to go beyond examining economic roles and challenges, and responses that are limited to profits, economic sustainability and capital, miss the main target of addressing how WFP can use its activities and mandate to promote equality and empower women.

The WIAD staff interviewed provided an example of such a risk:

When a female-dominated product or activity such as processing becomes comparatively profitable —for example, when WFP P4P targets a commodity for purchase that is primarily female-controlled— male actors who have a greater production capital are likely to move into the industry as the valueadded of the product increases. Due to the gender disparities in access to credit and productive resources, among other factors (as outlined in section 4), men tend to be more capable than women to move into an industry and edge female actors out. Because they have greater control over capital, and thus access to storage, financial services or technologies and inputs, they are able to overtake female competition in a growing market or market activity. Such disparities also make products disproportionately more profitable for men than women, where men are able to purchase in bulk, access storage facilities, and subsequently better control their supply and pricing.

⁶¹ Aniaku, V. WIAD (MoFA). Interview. April 2016.

Considering these factors, development activities to promote gender equality which solely aim to increase profit margins for women-dominated commodities may, if successful, only lead to the edging out of women from the market. Instead of targeting a particular women-dominated commodity value chain, projects that address women's fundamental socio-economic constraints and challenges, both in market activities and in their households, are significantly more sustainable in promoting women's empowerment, gender equality and equitable human development. To do this however requires critical investigation and analytical tools to understand what defines empowerment in the Ghanaian agricultural value chains for female and male actors, and where can WFP and its partners contribute to women's empowerment through humanitarian action.

In response to this challenge, the VAM team at RBD developed a set of pilot questions on women's empowerment in markets, adapted from the WEAI data collection tools, and integrated these questions into market questionnaires for the 2016 Ghana EFSA. The questions were intended to primarily assess decision-making on key market activities and on control over resources among women and men traders. Results show a high level of decision-making controlled by women traders, compared to men traders, as well as a significantly higher level of comfort among women traders to speak up publicly. However, results do not align with descriptions of women's control over decision-making from key informant and expert interviews. Results are more accurate, except in the case of market queens and much less so for the average women producer or retailer.⁶² About 37.7% of male traders reported making decisions alone concerning which product to sell, compared to more than half of women traders (55.1%). As for the price to sell products at, again just 37.7% of male traders reported making their own decisions compared to 53% of women traders. With regard to where or from whom to purchase a product, 39.6% of male traders make their own decisions compared to 53.1% of women traders. About 53.8% of women traders surveyed also report being very comfortable speaking up in public, compared to 43% percent of their male counterparts. The decision to take out credit to finance trade activities and decision on how generated income will be spent were also primarily made by the trader themselves, and more often so for women traders than men traders, as shown in the charts below.

Based on results from the gender and markets case study conducted in Burkina Faso, a similar pattern emerged in the data, which was equally unaligned with qualitative interviews. In that case, analysis showed that women market actors enjoyed greater independence in decision-making largely because they worked with significantly smaller financial capital which decreased their need to pool risk with others. Male actors, on the other hand, were more likely to share decision-making control in market activities with another adult household member (typically male) in order to pool risks. For example, male market actors are more likely to take out larger amounts of credit than female actors in Ghana, making it more necessary for them to involve a second party to share financial risks. Because women do not have access to the same amount of credit, such risk-pooling may not be a concern, which in turn gives them more freedom to take decisions on their own.63

⁶² Kaye, N. Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.

⁶³ Henry, P. Gender and Markets: Burkina Faso Case Study. WFP (Accra, Ghana). 2016.



Figure 21. Decisions on taking out credits, % of traders, by gender



Source: WFP Ghana EFSA 2016

These questions were part of the first pilot effort to test such adaptations in different country contexts. As such, they carry a high possibility for errors. To assess the plausibility of the above figures in terms of women's decision-making power, figures on intrahousehold decision-making from the World Bank databank are included below. There is a notable divergence with World Bank figures for 2008 which show that 36.6% of surveyed women between 15 and 49 years of age reported that the decision on major household purchases was made mainly by the husband. This is compared to 42% who reported decisions were made jointly by husband and wife, and 20.3% who said the wife mainly makes such decisions. Furthermore, interviews with partners, experts and relevant WFP staff working in Ghana were more in line with the data reflected by the World Bank than EFSA results on women's empowerment.



Figure 22. Decision Making on Major Household Purchases (2008)

Source: World Bank Databank – Gender Statistics

The EFSA results on women's empowerment in markets, World Bank data on empowerment within the household, and stakeholder interviews on the inferior social status and comparatively poor economic position of women to men reflect clear divergences. The incongruence of results reflects the need for more work on developing tools to assess and track women's empowerment. Based on interviews with relevant VAM staff, it was noted that some enumerators and respondents were unclear on the meaning or intention of the questions, again decreasing the validity of the results drawn.

As shortcomings in VAM assessments of the past five years and gaps in government tools and approaches demanded further work towards developing a framework for assessing empowerment, the "Gender Analytical Framework for Assessing Value Chains" in Ghana was developed. The Framework is further detailed in section 5 and is included in Annex IV. This tool is informed by the gaps identified and responds to the particular assessment and monitoring approach planned for the ENVAC.

The Framework also takes into consideration the following principles of gender analysis and empowerment in value chains:

- Empowerment varies depending on the stage of the value chain
- Empowerment varies between productive income-earning activities and household reproductive activities
- Economic improvement (i.e. increased profits) does not necessarily lead to empowerment
- Decision-making and control are not alone sufficient indicators of empowerment
- Empowerment is cross-sectional; its assessment requires consideration of gender, age, class, ability, ethnic group, and other social stratifiers which influence or determine an individual's role and status at any given stage of agricultural value chains
- Empowerment is not a term with a universal meaning understood by all and, to analyse it, contextual and linguistic adaptions are often necessary and sufficient training of enumerators is essential



4. Role of Market-queens in high-value food commodity supply, distribution, and pricing

Market queens, according to UNDP, are *"leaders of* product associations at the market centres. They head smaller trader units and ensure that trading rules are adhered to. They are major wholesalers who buy food directly from field suppliers and sell to retailers. They have the power to set and control prices."⁶⁴ The table below, extracted from a report by UNDP on inclusive markets in Africa, shows a diagram of the relationship between market queens

and smallholder producers and processors, as well as other agricultural value chain actors operating in Ghana and neighbouring countries. Ultimately, market queens are middle persons in agricultural value chains and particularly for women traders, they play a key role in influencing market commodity prices by exercising control over supply and distribution.⁶⁵.

Figure 23. Role of market queens in agro-food value chain



Source: UNDP African Facility for Inclusive Markets 2012

Marketplaces in Ghana are spatially categorized by commodity, and within each product section, a "market queen" generally controls the commerce, price, and supply of her commodity. According to Esoko —a private market data-collection firm that

works with market queens to gather information on agricultural markets— Ghana has a market queen for each commodity, and merchants work under one "main queen".⁶⁶ If a new vendor wants to enter the market to sell a certain product, he or she will need

⁶⁴ UNDP. The Roles and Opportunities for the Private Sector in Africa's Agro-Food Industry. UNDP African Facility for Inclusive Markets. 2012.

⁶⁵ Kabutha, C. Gender Assessment – Ghana Agricultural Development and Value Chain Enhancement (ADVANCE) Programme. USAID; VOCA. Accra, Ghana. 2010.

⁶⁶ Belachew, T. ICTworks Profile of Esoko: Bringing the Market to African's Fingertips. ICTworks.org. 4 October, 2011.

to request permission from the market queen for that product. At which point, he or she will either be rejected and have to wait, or will be accepted and from there, be required to pay a tax to the market queen on all sales for that product, or sell that product directly to the market queen.⁶⁷

Market queens deal largely in agricultural industries, with some exceptions. Powerful women traders may move into other industries where potential profit margins are higher. Interviews with experts produced examples of market queens participating in informal international trade, at times traveling as far as China or India to purchase such non-food items as clothes, shoes, hair products, and jewellery to be resold in Ghana.⁶⁸ Market queens are also found in countries bordering Ghana, specifically Burkina Faso, Togo and, while formally unconfirmed but likely, Cote d'Ivoire.⁶⁹

The main factors which allow a women vendor to become a market queen are: 1) historical presence in the community, that is, she was born in or has been part of the community in which the market operates for a significant period; 2) high level of capital to be able to buy and store products, allowing for market manipulation; and 3) be at the top of the hierarchy of the relevant association or informal group involved in the trading of their commodity in the area they operate in. Whether the deciding factors relate to ownership or management of private enterprises (engaged in food or non-food items) or political affiliations, they tend to be representative of a given community in which they belong.⁷⁰

Market queens in Ghana are powerful actors in agricultural markets and value chains, including in the participation to cross-border trade.⁷¹ By managing suppliers, transporters, wholesale and in-

market purchases and sales, they tend to exercise control over several stages of the value chain of their product. They decide and set market prices daily and, unlike other female market actors, they rarely consult with a male figure to make key business decisions or receive market information. In spite of their comparatively strong and wide-reaching influence and their mobility in trading, they often only speak their local language.

According to Professor Sarpong of the Department of Agricultural Economics at the University of Ghana, market queens are thought to: (a) control the supply and demand of commodities in marketplaces, thereby helping in setting better prices for market retailers; and (b) improve efficiency by ensuring some form of standards on produce in the market. In an informal market context, the market-queens are locally labelled as marketing "gate-keepers" in the (a) and (b) domain mentioned above.⁷² Market queens thus have the power to function as market regulators by manipulating prices using supply-side control. This is true for most agricultural products, and market queens tend to trade largely in food products which do not involve processing.

There are pros and cons to this informal market regulation by market queens in Ghana, according to expert, partner and colleague interviews, and secondary sources. The key disadvantage, according to partners at WIAD, is that market queens are able to create artificial commodity shortages to increase the price of their product and thereby increase their profit margins.⁷³ Market queens can pose a direct threat to official market structuring and regulations where informal market systems such as theirs constitute a serious economic shortfall for the country.⁷⁴ Esoko has recorded incidences of market problems arising in Ghana from market queen

⁶⁷ Aniaku, V. WIAD (MoFA). Interview. April 2016.

⁶⁸ It is worth mentioning that in comparing interviews with experts and partners, there was some disagreement on whether these female traders of non-agricultural commodities would qualify as 'market queens', particularly in the traditional sense.

⁶⁹ Aniaku, V. WIAD (MoFA). Interview. April 2016; Asare, C. Department of Gender (MoGCSP). Interview. April 2016.

⁷⁰ Kaye, N. Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.

⁷¹ Kabutha, C. Gender Assessment – Ghana Agricultural Development and Value Chain Enhancement (ADVANCE) Programme. USAID; VOCA. Accra, Ghana. 2010.

⁷² Sarpong, D. B. Department of Agricultural Economics (University of Ghana). Written Interview. April 2016.

⁷³ Aniaku, V. WIAD (MoFA). Interview. April 2016; Asare, C. Department of Gender (MoGCSP). Interview. April 2016.

⁷⁴ Kaye, N. Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.

regulatory behaviour. For example, a market queen in Kumasi provoked a "renegade onion street trade" by consumers trying to avoid the high price of onions in markets, which the market queen had provoked by putting high taxes on imported onions from Burkina Faso.⁷⁵ In 2011, Esoko also recorded an incident with tomato farmers in the Upper East region of Ghana who reported mistreatment by market queens whom they accused of fixing commodity prices to decrease producer profits. According to the farmers surveyed, the market queens involved were buying most of their produce from Burkina Faso, and were unwilling to purchase from local producers unless produce was sold at a significantly lower price than the established market price.⁷⁶ Conversely, according to a partner working with METSS on assessing gender and market dynamics in Ghana, market queens play a critical role in the movement of fresh produce from farms to the market, and have thus been identified as potentially useful partners for USAID gender activities. Ultimately, whether market queens negatively or positively impact markets and value chains appears to be a matter of context and perspective.

There is limited analysis on market queens in Ghana. The main information gap on market queens is on process and it is necessary to bridge this gap to understand how much of a product goes into formal versus informal markets and take actions to ensure the constant supply of certain products. While reliable record keeping is unlikely, according to WFP staff working on the ENVAC project, quantifying the impact and influence of market queens on markets in which they operate would be ideal.⁷⁷ It is also important that price data collection takes into account the influence of market queens as informal market regulators. For example, Esoko includes comments on pricing data to describe the contributing factors that lead to price fluctuations for a particularly commodity. To gather market data, Esoko enumerators are often required to approach market queens immediately upon entering a market and present to them the benefits of their allowing Esoko entrance into the market to encourage their approval of its enumerators and operators.⁷⁸ According to interviews with WFP Ghana colleagues, teams have not actively worked with market queens as of yet, though implementing partners do sometimes engage with them. As acknowledged by the interviewed METSS partner and reflected in Esoko's developed approaches to data collection, market queens can be important informants and allies in understanding how to best open up agricultural value chains to more women, and implement projects which support women's economic empowerment.

There are different reasons why market queens may not be as often engaged as one would expect considering their significant position. According to WFP staff operating in Ghana, this may be because it can be difficult to obtain information from them due to the general reluctance to share business details. There are also gendered stigmas surrounding the institutions of market queens, which may dissuade practitioners from seriously considering them as partners. Applying a critical gender analysis of language used to describe market queens during interviews and in secondary sources produced at times highly gender-biased results. It seemed that the terminology used to describe market queens and the term "market queen" itself sometimes overshadowed and rendered trivial the presence of very powerful women operating and controlling trade in a key economic sphere. Furthermore, descriptions of what might otherwise be considered rational economic practices were described in a negative light, and qualified for example as "deceptive" or "conniving" and on multiple occasions were compared to organized crime.⁷⁹

Vilifying successful women economic actors is not unique to the case of market queens. During the 1950s in Ghana, a rise in cocoa prices on the world market apparently led to a witch-hunt movement

⁷⁵ Belachew, T. ICTworks Profile of Esoko: Bringing the Market to African's Fingertips. ICTworks.org. 4 October, 2011.

⁷⁶ Boafo, O. Wheat prices fall in key markets. Modern Ghana. 5 February 2011.

⁷⁷ Kaye, N. Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.

⁷⁸ Belachew, T. ICTworks Profile of Esoko: Bringing the Market to African's Fingertips. ICTworks.org. 4 October, 2011.

⁷⁹ Ghana News Agency. Retail margins push up prices. GNA. 24 August 2014.

sponsored by local businessmen concerned about competition of well-organized women traders, viewing their economic success as a threat to male authority in the household.⁸⁰ In Nigeria, more recent studies found accusations of witchcraft to be most strongly correlated with gender and socio-economic status, particularly women's power and control relative to that of men. In other words, accused women tend to be comparatively stronger traders than their male counterparts, and in one such study, the head of a women traders' association -similar to the role of a market queen in the Ghanaian context— was labelled as a "chief-witch".⁸¹ While these are extreme examples, it is important to consider the impact of gender-related prejudices when considering market queens, and to acknowledge that this can influence individual perceptions and established research —the main pillars of this case study. Such perceptions, whether conscious or unconscious, may also influence the decisions of WFP staff and implementing partners to actively engage with such women market and agroeconomic leaders, and should thus be addressed in analysing markets and value chains.

In conclusion, market queens can pose a direct threat to official market structuring and regulations, where informal market systems constitute a serious economic shortfall for the country. At the same time, creating a policy or a strategy to integrate market queens as actors and managers in supply chains may open up space for market structuring and regulation authorities to enforce rules and regulations that work for all parties. While risky, this may also work positively as they prevent severe shocks and market price drops, and their stocks help ensure stability of the product supply.⁸²

⁸⁰ Apter, A. Atinga revisited: Yoruba witchcraft and the cocoa economy, 1951. Comaroff and Comaroff eds (pg 111-128) 1993.

⁸¹ Sambe, N. et al. 2014. Analysis of Factors Precipitating Witchcraft Accusation among the Tiv. Anthropologist, 18 (3): 1077-1087 (2014).

⁸² Kaye, N. Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.



5. Programmatic solutions and value-added opportunities for women in associated markets

To support the ENVAC project, it is necessary to identify and assess value-added opportunities for women and market outlets for soybean in the Northern, cowpea in the Upper West and millet in the Upper East regions. Small-scale and communitybased opportunities for more active engagement in the value chains of these three commodities, primarily in selling and marketing raw grains and processed flours, are of particular interest in this context. According to expert inputs from Professor Sarpong of the University of Ghana, increased women economic inclusion in food markets and value chains requires the opening up of economic opportunities in legumes and cereal markets to more women through both formal and informal markets. These opportunities include: (a) capturing larger shares in market gains by increasing women access to and control over market infrastructure (storage, processing); (b) increasing women participation in value-chain activities; and (c) increasing access to gender-focused institutional support systems (credit, extension services, governance, etc.). Unfortunately, as Professor Sarpong points out, such opportunities are also the key challenges faced by women operating in these value chains. The focus then is to understand how institutions, markets and training systems can extend opportunities to women and through which activities and programs can women's economic inclusion in food markets and value chains be best promoted.83

There are already a few good practice examples of programmatic actions in response to identified constraints and challenges for female agricultural value chain actors. For example, land leases were given out and land sharing was promoted as part of a women-targeted value-chain development project of the MoGCSP focused on yams in Ghana.⁸⁴ Similarly, in response to the challenge of women's limited access to storage, a World Bank, USAID and

Ghana's MoFA project was implemented to build and make available commercial warehouses.⁸⁵ Furthermore, the WIAD targets actions aligned with three priority objectives of supporting female actors in agricultural value chains which are: 1) decrease post-harvest losses; 2) increase income of producers and market actors; and 3) add value through improvement of communication networks and marketing of products. Its main activities relevant to gender and markets are efforts to add value to agricultural products and provide information on pricing around the country.

WFP programmatic solutions to address identified challenges and gaps.

At the time of this study, the WFP Ghana CO is in the process of finalizing a budgetary extension to the 2012-2016 Ghana Country Programme for an additional fiscal year to include 2017. In this revised budget proposal, ENVAC is featured as a new initiative that supports nutrition activities targeting pregnant and lactating women, girls, and smallholder farmers. However, in initial drafts of the Country Programme budget extension document there was no inclusion of activities related to targeting women smallholder farmers, women small-scale processors, or other women engaged in agricultural value chains. Gender equality and women's empowerment are major cross-cutting aspects under all components of the ENVAC project, particularly in value chain development and women increased economic inclusion. As such, planned interventions include financial and technical support to smallholder farmers which include women-run FBOs and, in the targeting of community-level food processors, the emphasis is primarily on women-run milling and processing activities. Thus, the lack of reference to the gender aspects of ENVAC in the Country Programme document is a clear example of the gap between gender analysis and programme implementation.

⁸³ Sarpong, D. B. Department of Agricultural Economics (University of Ghana). Written Interview. April 2016.

⁸⁴ Asare, C. Department of Gender (MoGCSP). Interview. April 2016.

⁸⁵ Adams, S. METSS/USAID. Interview. April 2016.

CONCLUSION

Before it is possible to move forward with concrete programmatic recommendations, the gaps in information and analysis on gender and markets and in women's empowerment in agricultural value chains must be addressed and resolved. ENVAC creates the opportunity to achieve this, particularly in the planned baseline survey and needs assessment with gender, markets and women's empowerment as the foundation for the WFP team to build and track progress. The Gender Analytical Framework for Assessing Value Chains was developed for this purpose in partnership with RBD VAM and CO Ghana. The Framework supports the ENVAC team in performing the necessary data collection and analysis, and informs the regional Gender and Markets Initiative (see Annex IV for the Framework). After the Framework is presented to and finalized with key partners and stakeholders in Ghana, the tools it includes will be used to support the ENVAC baseline assessment. The ENVAC baseline survey and consultation with implementation partners and stakeholders during the upcoming ENVAC Inception Workshop will contribute to further define and quantify interventions and ways to measure and evaluate impacts on beneficiaries.⁸⁶ The ENVAC baseline assessment should include: key informant interviews to inform analytical design; household surveys with smallholder farmers and interviews with FOs; and focus group discussions with smallscale processors. The proposed Framework thus focuses on what information is most relevant to identify gender dynamics and assess empowerment, but it also identifies and analyses key status and empowerment indicators among producers interacting with agricultural value chains.

This Framework supports the mapping of gender roles, responsibilities, challenges and capacities throughout value chains for the three ENVAC target commodities: cowpea, soybean, and millet. It includes guidance for collecting preliminary value chain information, integrating gender and empowerment into questionnaires and data collection, and working with a gender-responsive analysis plan. This product is based on the interviews conducted with key partners in Ghana, and the working group meeting with ENVAC team members. The Framework is composed of guidance on: 1) preliminary interviews to collect key information on gender aspects of agricultural value chains; 2) data collection using tailored indicators and survey questions to identify gender dynamics and empowerment in value chains; and 3) working with a gender-informed analysis plan which factors in smallholder farmers, FBOs or other commodity groups, processors and consumers. The table below provides a simplified overview of the kinds of indicators included in the Framework to assess women's empowerment in markets.

Dimensions of Women's Empowerment	Indicators
Economic empowerment	Decision-making on value chain activities Decision-making over use of income Access to and decision-making power over credit/ financial services Access to and decision-making power over productive resources
Capacity and skills empowerment	Skills/capacity Access to information on production/markets/etc.
Social empowerment	Institutions Mobility Time use Self and gender perceptions Leadership and public speaking in markets

Table 3. Framework indicators

⁸⁶ Kaye, N. Purchase-for-Progress Country Coordinator (World Food Programme—Ghana). Expert inputs. August 2016.

The listed indicators reflect the main areas of empowerment within agricultural value chains and markets. The Framework provides examples of possible questions for each recommended indicator to assess gender dynamics and empowerment. Questions can be adjusted and integrated into questionnaires for smallholder farmers and other value chain actors such as aggregators, small-scale processors and market traders. They can also be integrated into discussions of focus group separated by sex of participants. The Framework is adapted from the WEAI in accordance with findings from the preliminary assessment of ENVAC gender-specific information needs, and results from the 2016 Ghana EFSA.

Beyond ENVAC and the Ghanaian context, this tool should be adopted as an analytical model to support preparedness, and recovery and rehabilitation stages of the Humanitarian Programme Cycle to minimize the need for emergency response and support early recovery through resilience-oriented and market-based activities.

At the government level, efforts should also be taken by WFP to collaborate with authorities to develop government capacity to collect, analyse and report on key gender figures. Many of the objectives outlined in the 2015 Gender and Agricultural Development Strategy II (GADS II) focus on market access, value-chains, and empowerment. Efforts are under way between WIAD and SRID to develop a framework for disaggregating all data by sex and age, and conducting appropriate gender analysis. This new gender-responsive data collection and analysis approach within the MoFA constitutes an important opportunity for WFP Ghana to help responsible teams go beyond the minimum standards and look at gender dynamics and women's empowerment in value chains and markets in support of the GADS II implementation. This should also include coverage of empowerment dynamics vis-à-vis men's and youths' participation in value chains and markets.

Finally, within WFP, a space should be established for programmes to clearly communicate to VAM their gender-related information needs before an assessment or intervention is designed. Such information needs in areas as nutrition, procurement, production and actor sales capacity, etc., are generally clear to VAM staff and, thus, are integrated into all CFSVAs and EFSAs. The same is not true for gender in spite of the fact that all WFP activities are accountable for providing evidence that gender aspects have been considered and integrated into activity design and implementation.

ANNEX

Annex I – Partner organizations and WFP staff surveyed

EXTERNAL PARTNERS INTERVIEWED			
Organization	Respondent		
University of Ghana	Professor, Department of Agricultural Economics		
Food Research Institute	Director		
rood Research institute	Senior Researcher		
Monitoring, Evaluation and Technical Support Services (METSS, collaboration between Kansas State University and USAID)	Project Director, Monitoring & Evaluation		
Ministry of Gender, Children and Social	Head, Department of Gender		
Protection (MoGCSP)	Policy Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation unit (WFP focal point)		
Statistical Research and Information	Agricultural Data Analyst, Markets Services unit		
Directorate (SRID), Ministry of Food and	Gender Focal Desk		
Agriculture (MoFA)	Assistant to Gender Focal Desk		
Women in Agricultural Development (WIAD), Ministry of Food and Agriculture (MoFA)	Senior Agriculture Officer		

INTERNAL STAFF CONSULTATIONS		
Team/Unit	Position	
Programmes	Head of Programmes	
Programmes	Senior Programme Associate & Gender Focal Point	
Purchase for Progress (P4P)	Country Coordinator	
Cash-based Transfers/Purchase for Progress (P4P)	Programme Officer	
Purchase for Progress (P4P)	Programme Officer	
VAM	Food Security Analysis Officer (sub-office)	
Monitoring & Evaluation	M&E Officer	

Annex II – Literature Review

INTERNAL TOOLS
P4P Trader Survey baseline and Follow-up survey
P4P Farmer Organization Follow-up Survey
P4P Farmer Livelihood and Agricultural Production Baseline survey
P4P Farmer Organization Record keeping template
VAM-West Africa Market questionnaires (Trader, Market, Transport questionnaires used in 2016 Ghana
EFSA).

INTERNAL PROJECT DOCUMENTS			
Title	Year(s)	Partners	Documents
Tackling Malnutrition in Northern Ghana	2010- 2012	UNICEF/ CIDA	2010 leaflet 2012 WFP-UNICEF Progress and Utilization Report No. 3 for 2009-2011 Work plan Scale-up I of community-based milling and fortification & re-bagging and sale of iodised salt: Community/group profiles (2009) Scale-up I – New beneficiary groups Scale-up II – Proposed list Scale-up III – Proposed list Scale-up III of community-based milling and fortification in Northern Ghana Scale-up III of community-based milling and fortification sites
Profiling smallholder farmers in Ghana with special emphasis on women	2011- 2012	WFP Gender Innovation Fund (GIF)	GIF proposal
Enhancing Women Empowerment through dry season gardening to improve dietary diversity in Northern Ghana	2012	WFP Gender Innovation Fund	GIF proposal
Enhanced Nutrition and Value Chains in	2015	DFATD, as	Funding proposal to DFATD - Executive Summary
Ghana		donor	Funding proposal to DFATD - Conceptual Framework

RESOURCE DOCUMENTS

African Development Fund (ADF). Ghana Country Gender Profile. 2008.

African Economic Outlook. Market Structure, Country Profiles: Ghana. Accessed June/July 2016.

Agricultural Learning and Impacts Network (ALINe). 2011. P4P Global Gender Strategy. World Food Programme Purchase4Progress. Rome, Italy.

Farm Gate. 2015. Farm-Gate Price Monitoring in Selected Impact Countries – Ghana. Accra, Ghana.

Food Research Institute. 2015. Adoption of Composite Flour technology by flour users for bakery and pastry application in the Volta, Eastern and Ashanti regions in Ghana. World Food Programme & CSIR Food Research Institute. Accra, Ghana.

Hagan, E. N. & Opare, J. A. Rapid Gender Analysis of the Ghana Commercial Agricultural Project (GCAP) – Accra Plains and the Savannah Zone. Government of Ghana; World Bank. 2011.

Kabutha, C. Gender Assessment – Ghana Agricultural Development and Value Chain Enhancement (ADVANCE) Programme. USAID; VOCA. Accra, Ghana. 2010.

Manoff Group. Defining social and behaviour change communications (SBCC) and other essential health communication terms - Technical Brief.

Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection. 2015. National Gender Policy. Republic of Ghana. Accra, Ghana.

Statistical Research and Information Directorate (SRID) *in use as of* 2016. Marketing Services Unit - Protocol Training Manual. Ministry of Food & Agriculture. SRID Markets Services Unit. Accra, Ghana.

WFP. 2010. Practical Actions to Enhance the Participation of Women in P4P Pilot Programme, P4P Second Occasional Paper. World Food Programme. Purchase4Progress Programme/Gender Service. Rome, Italy.

WFP. 2012. Ghana P4P Gender Assessment. World Food Programme Purchase4Progress Pilot. Accra, Ghana.

WFP. 2012. P4P Case study on women's empowerment: Contribution of P4P to the economic empowerment of women smallholder farmers in Ashanti and Northern Regions of Ghana. World Food Programme Purchase4Progress Pilot. Accra, Ghana.

WFP. 2013. P4P Gender Action Plan. World Food Programme Purchase4Progress pilot. Rome, Italy.

WFP. 2014. P4P's Women's Empowerment Pathways: Roadblocks and Successes. World Food Programme Purchase4Progress pilot. Rome, Italy.

Women in Agricultural Development (WIAD). 2015. Gender and Agricultural Development Strategy II (GADS II). Ministry of Food & Agriculture (MoFA) WIAD. Accra, Ghana.

Annex III – Mission Plan

Gender and Markets Regional Study: Mission to CO Ghana April 18-22, 2016 (5 working days)

Background: In September 2015, the Regional Bureau for West and Central Africa (RBD) launched a Gender and Markets study to reinforce the collection and analysis of gender-informed data on the roles of women and men in markets in the region, as well as their challenges and their empowerment. Following the first phase consisting in a desk review of current practices and available information in the region, a second phase of this project has been implemented. This phase is made up of case studies to test and build on findings across a range of contexts and sub-regions. The primary objective is to develop a set of practical examples of common gender and market information needs and constraints, and tools to respond to them.

The case studies are conducted along a set of common guidelines to respond to the key research questions developed by the RBD VAM Gender and Markets study:

- What are the roles of women and men in food markets in West Africa?
- What specific challenges do women face in their economic inclusion in food markets?
- What are the current gender gaps in WFP market-based responses and assessments?
- What are the current gaps and challenges in gauging and tracking women's empowerment in markets?
- What are the opportunities for women in the value chains of food products (soybean in the Northern, cowpea in the Upper West and millet in Upper East) and their market outlets?
- What role do market-queens play in controlling high-value food commodities supply and distribution channels and pricing?
- What are potential programmatic solutions to address the identified challenges and gaps?

Rationale: The Enhanced Value Chains (ENVAC) project in Ghana CO is a gender-responsive market-based approach. It also includes focus on small-trader local procurement which represents a new and increasingly popular direction for WFP food assistance where tools to collect the right gender-responsive information are comparatively lacking. This provides an opportunity for the Regional Gender and Markets study to identify WFP programmatic information needs on gender dynamics and empowerment in food markets, and tools and approaches to tailor assessments to such needs.

Objectives: The two key objectives of the mission are:

- to work with ENVAC team and relevant staff and partners in Ghana to develop market analysis tools for conducting gender and empowerment analysis which will be used to inform the ENVAC Implementation plan in June/July 2016, and;
- to develop a case study report using the experience to respond to the research questions outlined above.

Annex IV – Output Gender Analytical Framework for Assessing Value Chains

WFP RBD VAM/CO Ghana ENVAC

This product was developed in partnership with RBD VAM, as part of the study, *Gender and Markets: Empowering Women in West African Food Markets*, and CO Ghana to support the development of the *Enhanced Nutrition and Value Chains (ENVAC)* project.

After the product is presented to and finalized with key partners in Ghana, the tools will be used to support the ENVAC baseline assessment. The ENVAC baseline assessment should include: key informant interviews to inform analytical design; household surveys with smallholder farmers and interviews with FOs; and focus group discussions with small-scale processors. The following framework thus focuses on what information is most relevant to identify gender dynamics and assess empowerment, as well as identifying and analysing key status and empowerment indicators among producers interacting with the value chains.

This toolset provides a framework for the mapping of gender roles, responsibilities, challenges and capacities throughout the value chains of the three ENVAC target commodities: cow pea, soy bean and millet. It includes guidance for collecting preliminary value chain information, integrating gender and empowerment into questionnaires and data collection, and working with a gender-responsive analysis plan. This product is based on interviews with key partners in Ghana, and a working group meeting with key ENVAC team members.

1. Preliminary interviews

Key information on gender aspects of commodity value chains

Before beginning systematic data collection, building a foundation of key information can help to focus survey questions and identify key gender and empowerment concerns in commodity value chains. Key informants who can provide this information may include researchers, government bodies, implementing partners and university bodies, as well as actors directly involved in agricultural value chains and knowledgeable about multiple levels of the chain (i.e. FO/association leaders, "market queens"). The following are the information points which should be investigated before embarking on the data collection and analysis stages of an assessment.

- a) Description of value chain for priority commodities: cowpeas, soy beans, millet
 - i. Description of value chain stages (key actor characteristics, activities involved, relative profit margins at each stage)
 - ii. Who are the main producers of this commodity? (primarily women/men/both)
 - iii. Who are the main processors (specify small- or industrial-scale) of this commodity? (primarily women/men/both)
 - iv. Who are the main retailers (who sell to consumers) of this commodity before/after processing? (primarily women/men/both)
 - v. Who are the main wholesalers (selling to other traders) of this commodity? (primarily women/men/both)
 - vi. How is the selling price at different stages of the value chain generally set for the commodity?
- b) Are there different value chains for the same product? If so, why?
- c) What are the regional specificities for each commodity?

- d) Is this a capital-intensive value chain? If so, at what stage(s)? If so, how does this impact gender dynamics at different stages?
- e) Explain if/how land ownership, transportation, storage facilities, quality control facilities, technological agricultural inputs, and financial services are important (or not) to the commodity value chain (at what stage(s), main challenges, gender disparities in access to and control over these productive resources)
 - i. Are there gender disparities in access to, and ability to operate quality control equipment?
 - ii. Are there gender disparities in knowledge and use of quality and food safety (among smallscale processors)?
- f) What, if any, is the role of FOs or other (agricultural) community groups in the value chain?
 - i. Are there challenges for women to participate in key decision-making as members?
 - ii. Are there key facilitating actors in the FO (by sex, age, etc.)?
- g) Do market queens play a role in regulating the market for this commodity? If so, in what respects?
 - i. Do they have demonstrated or potential influence over factors such as: quality control; standardization of goods/packaging; introduction of new commodities; etc.? If so, to what extent?
- h) What are the main sources of credit and financial inflows at different levels of the value chain?
 - i. Do some actors finance the activities of others (e.g., aggregators providing credit to small-scale producers)?
- i) Are there other demographic factors which influence the value chain (i.e., ethnic group, customary practices, language, religion, age, etc.)?
- j) What are the primary consumer groups of the commodity (i.e., industrial processors, small-scale processors, individuals for household consumption, etc.)?
- k) Additional information on the roles of women and men throughout the value chain
- Opportunities and strategies for reducing gender-based challenges to improve actors working conditions

2. Data collection

Indicators and survey questions on gender dynamics and empowerment in value chains

Empowerment is defined as a series of processes and changes whereby women and men's agency is expanded; it is the processes by which the capacity to make strategic life choices and exert influence is acquired by those who have so far been denied it.⁸⁷ Empowerment is thus a multifaceted concept which requires a complex analytical approach for assessment.

The tool proposed below reflects the P4P categories of empowerment and areas for action, as stipulated in the P4P Global Gender Strategy. ENVAC is a new initiative but it retains the same fundamental commitments to women's empowerment and gender equality as the prior P4P pilot. For this reason, the approach to assessing and monitoring women's empowerment in value chains is influenced by the following P4P women's empowerment framework.

⁸⁷ WFP P4P Global Gender Strategy.

P4P-defined categories of empowerment and areas for action

Categories of empowerment	Leverage areas for promoting empowerment through ENVAC	Sources of information	
	Gender awareness training	Key informant discussions with partners/FOs/other community groups	
Women's social empowerment through the promotion of:	Institutional mechanisms that foster women's active group participation	KI discussions with institutional partners, FOs/community group discussions; producer/trader/market surveys	
	Labour/ time-saving technologies to address women's time constraints	Producer/trader/market surveys; multiple	
	Functional literacy training for women smallholder farmers	Producer and trader surveys; multiple	
Women's capacity and skill empowerment through	Agriculture extension workers	Multiple	
promotion of access to:	Agricultural and market information	Multiple	
Women's economic empowerment through the promotion of:	Access to credit	Multiple	
	The rights of women to retain decision-making control over their income, savings and assets	Adapted WEAI; proposed empowerment indicators above	

Indicators and sample questions on empowerment in agricultural value chains

The following indicators reflect the main areas of empowerment within agricultural value chains and markets. The questions are recommended to assess gender dynamics and empowerment in value chains. They can be adjusted and integrated into questionnaires for smallholder farmers and other market actors, including aggregators, small-scale processors and marketers. They can also be integrated into focus group discussions separated by sex of participants. The tool below is adapted from the Women in Agricultural Development Index (WEAI) in accordance with findings from the preliminary assessment of ENVAC gender-specific information needs.

Indicators	Questions	Included in 2016 Ghana EFSA Market Assessment
	Who exerts leadership in your commercial activities (whether buying or selling)?	
Decision- making on value chain activities	Who decides, most of the time: -whether you will sell? -what products to sell? -in what quantity? -at what price you will sell product(s)? -where to sell? -to whom to sell? -where product(s) will be sourced from (if you do not produce them yourself)? -to take out credit to finance market/trade activities?	X: Who decides whether you will sell this product most of the time? ; Who decides at what price you will sell this product most of the time? Who decides from whom/where you will purchase this product most of the time?
Access to and	Who, if anyone, in your household has access to productive capital (financial, land, other)? - Who decides, most of the time, how productive capital will be used?	
decision-	Who in your household has access to the market (buying and selling)?	
making power over	Who, if anyone, in your household has access to financial services?	
productive resources	Who decides, most of the time, whether financial services will be used (and from which sources)?	

	 Who, if anyone, in your household has access to and knowledge of agricultural technologies/equipment? Who decides, most of the time, whether technologies/equipment will be used? 	
	Do you have access to storage facilities?	
	Literacy rate between female and male actors	
	Ability to operate agricultural input technology/equipment	
Skills/capacity	Knowledge and use of quality and food safety (among small-scale processors)	
	Access to, and ability to operate quality control equipment	
	Who has individual or shared ownership of assets in order to undertake market	
	activities?	
Control over use of income	Who decides, most of the time, how income will be used, both in market activities and in the household	
	Who decides, most of the time, how much of your generated income will be spent on food for your household?	
Leadership in	Do you feel comfortable speaking up in public (i.e. in commodity associations, other local groups) to decide on marketplace issues?	X: in Trader questionnaire
markets	Do you participate in a FO or market-based community group? If so, do you participate in the main decision-making body?	
	Do you regularly have time available to dedicate to market activities outside the home?	
Time use	How much time do you spend on domestic tasks, including child care?	
	How does your time-use impact your scale of agricultural activities (production, aggregating, marketing, processing, etc.)?	
	How far do you travel to sell your product(s)? How often?	
Mahilita	Do you have access to multiple selling points?	
Mobility	Do you have access to safe (i.e. vehicle/road quality) and efficient transport?	
	Is security a concern for you in transporting commodities?	
	What process is necessary to have access to market floors (for selling)?	
Institutions	Who controls the market? (Government body, market association, market queens, etc.)	These questions may be best used in key market informant interviews.
	Do women have equal rights to men related to food markets?	
	What will be the biggest challenge/obstacle for your business in the future?	X: in Trader questionnaire
	In the future (6 months – 1 year) how do you think the situation for this product will evolve?	X: in Trader questionnaire
Self and	What does it mean to have market power?	
gender	Do you associate your market activities with market power?	
perceptions	To you, what is important to know when considering women's access to, and power in markets?	
	What other demographic information about marketplaces can inform power and gender relations?	
Value chain	Do you or someone in your household produce what you sell? -If not, from whom and where do you get your product(s)?	
	Who do you sell to? (i.e. wholesalers, aggregators, market queens, direct to consumers)	
	Where do you sell most of your product? (i.e. Farm gates, wholesalers, local markets, other)	
	Do you receive or provide credit to actors producing or trading in the same commodity?	

Note for enumerators on asking empowerment-focused questions: Where possible, it is recommended that enumerators devote time to running a trial of questions in a community before conducting the full-scale survey. Empowerment questions are very context-specific. USAID METSS staff for example recommend enumerators spend some time in a community (less than one day) observing patterns and practices which can be integrated into questionnaire wording to make questions more applicable and comprehensive to respondents.

3. Analysis Plan : Working with a gender-informed analysis plan⁸⁸

Asking the right questions is only half the challenge in conducting a gender analysis to support better programming. The tool above provides clear indicators and associated survey questions to assess gender dynamics and empowerment in value chains. To ensure information is adequately and appropriately used and translated into programmatic reporting, a gender-responsive approach to the analysis plan is critical. To assess the conditions for key groups (based on the main ENVAC beneficiary groups), the responsible team should use collected data and information to respond to the questions below.⁸⁹

Remember: A minimum requirement for a strong analysis plan is the consistent sex and age disaggregation of population figures, and identification and analysis of significant disparities.

Smallholder farmers

Context (socio-cultural)

- a) Are there cultural aspects in the surveyed area which impact gender-entitlements and restrictions for women and men (i.e. land ownership, inheritance, norms about physical vs. domestic labour)?
- b) What are the key gender inequalities in the surveyed area?
- c) In what way(s) could these inequalities differently affect women and men and development in general?
- d) In what way(s) could these inequalities undermine performance of target commodities (i.e., reduce productivity, volumes and incomes)?
- e) Describe roles of women and men in production of target commodities (i.e., in land preparation, planting, weeding, pest management, harvesting, marketing).
- f) Describe workloads for women and men on target crop and the implications of these workloads on production and productivity.
- g) Propose opportunities/strategies for reducing workload inequalities between women and men.

Access to and control over resources and profits/benefits

- h) What are the key resources needed for commercialization of target crops (i.e. land, labour, skills/training, farm implements, seed, etc.)?
- i) What is the relative access to these resources by women and men (including ability to use) and what are related differential constraints?
- j) What is the relative control over these resources by women and men (power and authority) and what are related differential constraints?
- k) Describe any disconnect between those who do the work and those who control resources.
- I) How do differentials/constraints affect production and productivity?
- m) What is the relative access to (use), and control over (power/authority) benefits accruing from the target crops (i.e. food, income, fodder, etc.) by women and men, and differential constraints?
- n) Describe any disconnect between those who do the work and those who control benefits.

⁸⁸ The analytical questions below build the approach used in the Monitoring and Evaluation Technical Services Support (METSS) ADVANCE programme assessment.

⁸⁹ Note that these questions are meant to guide analysis, rather than dictate it. The questions are extensive to cover many possible areas of interest, but not all will be relevant all of the time.

- o) How do differentials/constraints affect production and productivity?
- p) Propose opportunities/strategies for reducing constraints and increasing productivity of women and men.
- q) Describe current levels of production costs and impacts on women and men producers.
- r) Is value chain development of the target crops likely to impact women and men differently (i.e. in adoption, productivity, labour etc.)? If so, how?
- s) Propose opportunities/strategies for managing the cost in a way that men and women can effectively participate in ENVAC.

Participation and leadership

- t) Provide summary of membership of men and women in local agricultural committees (i.e., generally, what proportion of FOs have gender-specific membership? In mixed FOs, are women and men equally represented? Etc.)
- u) In mixed membership groups, are women and men equally represented in leadership of these committees (i.e. Chair, Vice Chair, Treasurer, Secretary, Committee membership etc.)?
- v) Describe any disparities/inequalities in representation and reasons.
- w) Describe any instances (identified or potential) where lack of representation/participation in these institutions (could) negatively impacted production and productivity.
- x) Propose opportunities/strategies for building equity in local institutions.

Note: women who would otherwise be included in this target group, may not meet the traditional criteria for "smallholder farmer" as formal ownership tends to be held by men. As noted in the P4P Global Gender Strategy, it may be helpful to use the categories of producers/marketers, unpaid family workers, producers/petty traders and casual agricultural labourers.⁹⁰

Farm organizations, or other commodity groups

- a) Is membership in the organization gender-exclusive? Are there other social stratifiers, including ethnic group, age, religion, other?
- b) What are the requirements for membership? Are they different for women and for men?
- c) Provide a summary of gender issues (if any) within the organization: leadership, yield, land sizes etc.
- d) What benefits accrue from the FO and how are benefits shared (identify and describe any disparities)?
- e) Describe women's and men's representation and engagement in main leadership bodies.
- f) How (if at all) is the organization addressing the gender issues?
- g) Describe any identified challenges in addressing gender issues and how the institution could be strengthened to effectively address gender issues, in line with ENVAC activities.

Processors

- a) Describe operations: what they process, where acquired, and reasons for choice of business, etc.
- b) How many employees/members: number by sex, and at different levels (general, management, top management)?
- c) Describe roles of women and men in process, and challenges encountered.
- d) Are there differentials in remuneration for female and male staff/members with similar qualifications and skills?
- e) Do social protection policies exist (i.e. child care, sick leave) and, if so, are they equally accessible to female and male staff?
- f) What are the organization's/association's support systems (considering capital, market, training, information, etc.)?

⁹⁰ WFP P4P Global Gender Strategy.

- g) Describe the overall capacity of the processor (considering machinery, other infrastructure, skills etc.).
- h) Who operates what in terms of machinery and infrastructure? Who has most valued skills?
- i) Levels of business skills available within the firm and kinds of business risks taken and results.
- j) Has the company/association faced gender-related challenges? If so, how have these been addressed?
- k) Propose opportunities/strategies for reducing gender-based challenges to raise profits.

Consumers

A key component of ENVAC is enhanced promotion of good nutritional practices and behaviours among pregnant and lactating women, and children. While this tool focuses on agricultural value chains and markets, three key areas of inquiry are recommended to support this component:

- a) Gender disparities in knowledge of, control over, availability/access to good nutrition practices and behaviours;
- b) Primary information sources, by sex and age (radio, cell phones, television, newspapers, social media, etc.)
- c) Key institutional providers of nutritiously rich foods (i.e. clinics, schools), with location.



