

World Food Programme Programme Alimentaire Mondial Programa Mundial de Alimentos برنامج الأغذية العالمي **Executive Board** Annual session Rome, 10–14 June 2019

Distribution: General Date: 3 May 2019 Original: English Agenda item 7 WFP/EB.A/2019/7-D Evaluation reports For consideration

Executive Board documents are available on WFP's website (https://executiveboard.wfp.org).

Implementation status of evaluation recommendations

Draft decision*

The Board takes note of the document entitled "Implementation status of evaluation recommendations" (WFP/EB.A/2019/7-D).

Introduction

- Reports of all the centralized evaluations managed by WFP's Office of Evaluation (OEV) and management's responses to them are presented to the Executive Board for consideration. WFP is committed to providing management responses to all evaluation recommendations and to following up on the implementation of recommended actions.
- 2. This is the tenth annual report on the implementation status of actions taken by all WFP offices in response to evaluation recommendations. It covers recommendations from evaluations presented to the Board from 2008 to the end of 2018. It is recommended that this report be read in conjunction with the 2018 annual evaluation report prepared by OEV.¹

Focal points:

Ms J. Pearce Director Performance Management and Monitoring Division tel.: 066513-2525

Ms C. Kireeva Monitoring and Evaluation Officer Monitoring and Evaluation Liaison Unit tel.: 066513-3808

World Food Programme, Via Cesare Giulio Viola, 68/70, 00148 Rome, Italy

^{*} This is a draft decision. For the final decision adopted by the Board, please refer to the decisions and recommendations document issued at the end of the session.

¹Annual evaluation reports include findings, lessons and recommendations from evaluation reports and annual updates on developments in WFP's evaluation function.

In line with the Evaluation Policy (2016–2021) (WFP/EB.2/2015/4-A/Rev.1), to respect the integrity and independence of evaluation findings the editing of this report has been limited and as a result some of the language in it may not be fully consistent with the World Food Programme's standard terminology or editorial practices. Please direct any requests for clarification to the Director of Evaluation.

Evaluation management response

3. Management response is a formal mechanism that helps to ensure that evaluations are used, contributing to organizational effectiveness, learning and accountability. Evaluation management response determines specific actions that will be taken to implement each recommendation, the units responsible for taking the actions and the timelines within which the actions must be taken.

Methodology

- 4. WFP's Performance Management and Monitoring Division (RMP) coordinates and tracks management's responses to evaluation recommendations and related actions to determine the extent to which recommendations are being implemented, to determine whether follow-up may be required and, ultimately, to promote accountability for results. The formal management response process includes:
 - An indication of whether management agrees, partially agrees or disagrees² with the recommendations in an evaluation report;
 - A written formulation of time-bound action-plans for responding to evaluation recommendations and those responsible for ensuring their implementation; and
 - The monitoring and tracking of progress in the implementation of recommendations until all recommended actions are taken or cancelled.³
- 5. Implementation status categories (for recommendations with which management agrees) are defined as follows:
 - > Implemented: Action completed by 31 December 2018.
 - > **Outstanding**: Action not completed by 31 December 2018.
 - Not applicable: Action not implemented because of changing circumstances or contexts.

Evaluations presented to the Board

- 6. Since 2008, 107 evaluation reports with management responses have been presented to the Board.⁴ The seven evaluation categories outlined in the Evaluation Policy (2016–2021)⁵ are:
 - policy evaluations;
 - strategic evaluations;
 - country portfolio evaluations
 - regional portfolio evaluations;
 - operation evaluations;

² In the event that management disagrees with a recommendation and does not intend to implement it the reason for its disagreement must be stated.

³ The management response tracking system documents management's responses and follow-up actions to all evaluations managed by RMP. It provides a written record of the actions planned in response to evaluations and of what has already been done. In so doing it strengthens not only organizational accountability for results, but also transparency in the process for determining how results will be achieved.

⁴ In 2008, management responses were prepared for the recommendations in strategic evaluation reports only; since 2009, all evaluation reports presented to the Board have been accompanied by management responses.

⁵ An eighth category, joint evaluations, is not included because no joint evaluation were conducted between 2008 and 2018.

- impact evaluations; and
- > evaluations of corporate emergency responses.
- Of the 107 evaluation reports, 20 percent were operation evaluations (22 evaluations), 30 percent were strategic and policy evaluations (32), 30 percent were country portfolio evaluations (32), 1 percent were regional portfolio evaluations (1), 15 percent were impact evaluations (16), 1 percent were strategic evaluations (1), 2 percent were policy evaluations (2) and 1 percent were corporate emergency responses evaluations (1) (table 1).

	TABI	.E 1: NUN	MBERS (OF EVALU	JATION	REPORTS	S SUBM	ITTED TO	THE EX	ECUTIVE	BOARD	AND PE	RCENT	AGES OF	RECOM	MENDED	ACTION	NS, BY TY	'PE OF E	VALUAT	ION (2008	-2018)		
Evaluation type	20	008	20	009	20)10	20	011	20)12	20)13	20)14	20)15	20)16	20	017	20	18	Т	otal
	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	No.	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions
Operation	n/a	-	9	65	10	67	1	10	1	3	n/a	-	n/a	-	1	11	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	22	20
Strategic and policy	4	100	2	27	2	7	4	28	6	35	1	5	3	33	7	68	n/a	-	3	60	n/a	-	32	30
Strategic	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	1	10	1	1
Policy	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	2	20	2	2
Country portfolio	n/a	-	2	8	2	20	5	40	3	36	5	53	2	29	2	21	4	100	2	40	5	50	32	30
Regional portfolio	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	1	15	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	1	1
Impact	n/a	-	n/a	-	1	6	3	22	2	26	5	42	4	23	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	1	10	16	15
Evaluations of corporate emergency responses	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-	1	10	1	1
Total	4	100	13	100	15	100	13	100	12	100	11	100	10	100	10	100	4	100	5	100	10	100	107	100

Quantity and geographical distribution of recommendations

8. In response to the recommendations issued between 2008 and 2018, WFP's management agreed to implement 1,551 actions, of which 189 are from 2018. Table 2 lists all the actions from the 107 evaluation reports approved by the Board since 2008 irrespective of their planned completion dates. Of these actions 60 percent pertained to field offices and 40 percent to headquarters. The geographical breakdown shown in table 2 indicates that more actions pertained to headquarters than to any individual field office. This can be considered acceptable, as headquarters is where most corporate functions are coordinated and corporate policies are established.

п

					TABL	E 2: NUN	/IBERS A	ND PERC	ENTAGE	S OF REC	OMMEN	DED ACTI	ONS, BY	GEOGRA	PHICAL	AREA (20	08-201	8)						
Area	20	008	20	009	20)10	20	011	20	012	2	013	2	014	20	015	2	016	2	2017	20	18	тот	AL
	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No	% of actions	No.	% of actions
Asia	-	-	13	9	75	36	30	16	36	19	40	21	-	-	22	13	-	-	6	11	7	4	229	14
Middle East, North Africa, Eastern Europe and Central Asia	-	-	-	-	34	16	16	8	-	-	46	25	-	-	-	-	19	40	-	-	19	10	134	8
West Africa	-	-	18	12	22	10	44	23	-	-	27	14	11	6	-	-	9	19	5	9	51	27	187	12
Southern Africa	-	-	40	27	-	-	-	-	19	10	17	9	35	20	9	5	-	-	-	-	-	-	120	7
Eastern and Central Africa	-	-	-	-	34	16	56	29	53	27	-	-	19	11	-	-	16	34	17	32	28	15	223	14
Latin America and the Caribbean	-	-	18	12	28	13	10	5	-	-	-	-	31	17	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	87	5
Headquarters	69	100	58	40	18	9	36	19	84	44	57	31	83	46	140	82	3	7	26	48	84	44	658	40
Total	69	100	147	100	211	100	192	100	192	100	187	100	179	100	171	100	47	100	54	100	189	100	1 638	100

Г

Implementation rate of actions due by 2018

9. Management is expected to implement evaluation recommended actions by agreed completion dates. Progress on the implementation of management responses is tracked by RMP. The annual target for implementation of recommended actions is 100 percent. In 2018, implementation rates averaged more than 81 percent (table 3), varying from 92 percent of actions defined in corporate emergency response evaluations to 37 percent in policy evaluations. None of the nine actions assigned in impact evaluations were implemented, but eight were in progress and one was pending. This reflects the relative complexity of implementing agreed actions arising from impact and policy evaluations produce broader recommendations with longer-term perspectives. Timelines for implementing such actions tend to underestimate the external factors that affect implementation.

TABLE 3: IMPLEMENTATION RATES FOR RECOMMENDED ACTIONS, BY TYPE OF EVALUATION (completion due by end of 2018)									
Evaluation type	Number of actions implemented	2018 target	Implementation rate (%)	Number of actions to start	Number of actions in progress				
Strategic	98	109	90	8	3				
Policy	7	19	37	5	7				
Country portfolio	86	100	90	9	4				
Impact	0	9	0	1	8				
Corporate emergency response	12	13	92	1	-				
Total	203	250	81	24	22				

Implementation status of actions from 2008 to 2018

- 10. Of a total of 107 evaluation reports presented to the Board since 2008, 81 are considered closed as all the related recommended actions have either been implemented or are deemed no longer applicable. The analysis shown in table 4 covers 250 actions from 24 evaluation reports with deadlines for full implementation by 31 December 2018.¹ Of these, on 31 December 2018, 203 were implemented, 24 were due to start, 22 were in progress and one was no longer applicable. (Actions are reattributed or deemed no longer applicable when, for instance, there are changes in units' responsibilities or in the alignment of country offices with regional bureaux.)
- 11. As indicated in table 4, on 31 December 2018, the highest implementation rates by region were 97 percent of 32 actions due in Asia; 95 percent of 19 actions in the Middle East, North Africa, Eastern Europe and Central Asia; and 92 percent of 12 actions in West Africa. As in previous years the implementation rate for headquarters was lower than the average for country offices and regional bureaux. Considering the large number of actions for which headquarters is responsible, however, an implementation rate of 78 percent can be considered acceptable. Annex II shows implementation rates by WFP office.

¹ As of 31 December 2018, 26 reports had actions to be implemented. Of these, two reports included actions to start in 2019 and so have been excluded from this analysis.

TABLE 4: IMPLEMENTATION RATES BY GEOGRAPHICAL AREA (completion due by end of 2018)									
Geographic Area	Number of actions implemented	2018 target	Implementation rate (%)						
Asia	32	33	97						
Middle East, North Africa, Eastern Europe and Central Asia	19	20	95						
West Africa	11	12	92						
Southern Africa	-	-	-						
Eastern and Central Africa	24	35	69						
Latin America and the Caribbean	-	-	-						
Headquarters	117	150	78						
Total	203	250	85						

Summary and conclusions

- 12. By 31 December 2018, 85 percent of the recommended actions from 27 evaluation reports presented between 2008 and 2018 and due for completion were implemented; 58 actions were still pending and 2 were deemed not applicable. To improve WFP's performance in implementing actions from evaluation recommendations approved by the Board, the feedback and reporting process has been enhanced in recent years. RMP conducts follow-up exercises twice a year, collating updates from individual offices into the corporate tracking system for evaluation recommendations, which documents management's responses to all evaluations and provides a written record of planned actions and the status of their implementation. RMP, OEV and regional monitoring teams have access to the system for tracking the implementation of recommended actions.
- 13. In 2018, in close collaboration with OEV, RMP developed standard operating procedures that clarify roles and responsibilities in the preparation of management responses to evaluations and their presentation to internal and external stakeholders; and outline the internal process for timely completion of management responses to centralized evaluations, including their clearance by WFP leadership.

ANNEX I

IMPLEMENTATION S	TATUS OF ALL	ACTIONS, 31 DEC	EMBER 2018	
Management response document	Actions (number)	Implemented actions (%)	Outstanding (%)	Not Applicable (%)
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Annual Evaluation Report 2012 (WFP/EB.A/2013/7-A/Add.1)	18	100	0	0
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Report of the Evaluation of the Impact of Food for Assets on Livelihood Resilience in Nepal (2002–2010) (WFP/EB.2/2013/6-B/Add.1/Rev.1)	15	100	0	0
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report – The Republic of Congo Country Portfolio (2009–2012) (WFP/EB.2/2013/6-D/Add.1)	17	100	0	0
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report of the WFP Gender Policy (2008–2013) (WFP/EB.1/2014/5-A/Add.1)	26	100	0	0
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Annual Evaluation Report 2013 (WFP/EB.A/2014/7-A/Add.1)	6	84	16	0
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Synthesis Report of the Evaluation Series on the Impact of Food For Assets (2002–2011) (WFP/EB.A/2014/7-B/Add.1*)	11	100	0	0
Management Response to the Recommendations Summary Evaluation Report – Central America Regional Portfolio (2007–2011) (WFP/EB.A/2014/7-C/Add.1)	26	96	0	4
Management Response to the Summary Evaluation Report – Uganda Country Portfolio (2009–2013) (WFP/EB.2/2014/6-B/Add.1)	17	94	0	6
Management Response to the Recommendations of the FAO/WFP Joint Evaluation of Food Security Cluster Coordination in Humanitarian Action (2009–2014) (WFP/EB.2/2014/6-A/Add.1)	27	81	19	0

IMPLEMENTATION S	TATUS OF ALL	ACTIONS, 31 DEC	EMBER 2018	
Management response document	Actions (number)	Implemented actions (%)	Outstanding (%)	Not Applicable (%)
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report on WFP's Cash and Voucher Policy (2008–2014) (WFP/EB.1/2015/5-A/Add.1)	32	100	0	0
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report of WFP's Use of Pooled Funds for Humanitarian Preparedness and Response (2009–2013) (WFP/EB.1/2015/5-B/Add.1)	18	94	6	0
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Report of the Strategic Evaluation of WFP's Pilot Purchase for Progress Initiative (2008–2013) (WFP/EB.1/2015/5-C/Add.1)	8	63	38	0
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report of Indonesia Country Portfolio (2009–2013) (WFP/EB.1/2015/5-D/Add.1)	23	100	0	0
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report on WFP's Response to the Syrian Crisis (2011–2014) (WFP/EB.A/2015/7-C/Add.1)	19	100	0	0
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Evaluation WFP's Preparedness and Response Enhancement Programme (WFP/EB.A/2015/7-B/Add.1)	28	100	0	0
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report on Nutrition Policy (2012–2014) (WFP/EB.2/2015/6-A/Add.1)	15	93	7	0
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Synthesis Report of the Evaluations of WFP's Emergency Preparedness and Response (WFP/EB.2/2015/6-B/Add.1)	6	100	0	0

IMPLEMENTATION S	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF ALL ACTIONS, 31 DECEMBER 2018										
Management response document	Actions (number)	Implemented actions (%)	Outstanding (%)	Not Applicable (%)							
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report – United Republic of Tanzania Country Portfolio (2011–2014) (WFP/EB.2/2015/6-D/Add.1)	12	100	0	0							
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report – State of Palestine Country Portfolio (2011 to Mid-2015) (WFP/EB.1/2016/5/Add.1* and Corr.1)	5	100	0	0							
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report – Mauritania Country Portfolio (2011–2015) (WFP/EB.A/2016/7-B/Add.1)	9	100	0	0							
Management Response to the Recommendations to the Summary Evaluation Report – Burundi Country Portfolio (2011–2015) (WFP/EB.2/2016/6-A/Add.1)	16	100	0	0							
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report – Iraq Country Portfolio (2010–2015) (WFP/EB.2/2016/6-B/Add.1)	15	93	7	0							
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report of WFP Policy on Capacity Development (WFP/EB.1/2017/6-A/Add.1)	9	33	67	0							
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report of WFP's Ebola Crisis Response: Guinea, Liberia and Sierra Leone (WFP/EB.1/2017/6-B/Add.1)	13	92	8	0							
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report – Sri Lanka Country Portfolio (2011–2015) (WFP/EB.1/2017/6-C/Add.1)	6	100	0	0							
Management Response to the Recommendations of the Summary Evaluation Report of the Corporate Partnership Strategy (WFP/EB.A/2017/7-B/Add.1/Rev.1)	6	60	40	0							

IMPLEMENTATION S	TATUS OF ALL	ACTIONS, 31 DEC	EMBER 2018	
Management response document	Actions (number)	Implemented actions (%)	Outstanding (%)	Not Applicable (%)
Management response to the recommendations of the summary evaluation report of the South Sudan country portfolio (2011–2016) (WFP/EB.2/2017/6-A/Add.1)	18	39	61	0
Management response to the recommendations deriving from the Cameroon country portfolio evaluation (from 2012 to mid-2017) (WFP/EB.1/2018/5-A/Add.1/Rev.1)	2	50	50	0
Management response to the recommendations deriving from the Cambodia country portfolio evaluation (2011–2017) (WFP/EB.1/2018/5-B/Add.1)	4	75	25	0
Management response to the recommendations deriving from the synthesis report on four evaluations of the impact of WFP programmes on nutrition in humanitarian contexts in the Sahel (WFP/EB.1/2018/5-C/Add.1)	9	0	100	0
Management response to the recommendations deriving from the evaluation of the WFP humanitarian protection policy for 2012–2017 (WFP/EB.A/2018/7-B/Add.1)	2	50	50	0
Management response to the recommendations deriving from the evaluation of WFP's policies on humanitarian principles and access in humanitarian context for the period 2004–2017 (WFP/EB.A/2018/7-C/Add.1)	3	0	100	0
Management response to the recommendations deriving from the evaluation of the Central African Republic country portfolio for the period 2012–mid 2017 (WFP/EB.A/2018/7-D/Add.1)	10	100	0	0
Management response to the recommendations deriving from the summary evaluation report of the strategic evaluation of the pilot country strategic plans (2017–mid-2018) (WFP/EB.2/2018/7-A/Add.1)	1	100	0	0

IMPLEMENTATION S	STATUS OF ALL	ACTIONS, 31 DEC	EMBER 2018	
Management response document	Actions (number)	Implemented actions (%)	Outstanding (%)	Not Applicable (%)
Management response to the recommendations deriving from the summary report on the evaluation of the Somalia country portfolio (2012–2017) (WFP/EB.2/2018/7-D/Add.1)	1	100	0	0
Management response to the recommendations in the summary report on the evaluation of the WFP regional response to the Syrian Crisis (January 2015–March 2018) WFP/EB.2/2018/7-B/Add.1	19	0	0	0
Management response to the recommendations deriving from the evaluation of the Mali country portfolio 2013–2017 WFP/EB.2/2018/7-C/Add.1	17	0	0	0
Total	453	83	17	0

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF ALL ACTIONS DUE BY 31 DECEMBER 2018, BY WFP OFFICE									
WFP office	Total actions	Implemented actions	Outstanding actions	Not applicable					
Asia	31	30	0	0					
Cambodia	4	3	1	0					
Indonesia	21	21	0	0					
Sri Lanka	6	6	0	0					
Middle East, North Africa, Eastern Europe and Central Asia	18	17	1	0					
Iraq	12	12	0	0					
State of Palestine	5	5	0	0					
Sudan	1	0	0	0					
West Africa	23	15	7	0					
Cameroon	2	1	1	0					
Chad	2	0	2	0					
Central African Republic	10	10	0	0					
Guinea	1	1	0	0					
Liberia	1	1	0	0					
Mali	2	0	2	0					
Niger	2	0	2	0					
Sierra Leone	1	1	0	0					
Regional Bureau in Dakar	2	1	1	0					
Southern Africa	-	-	-	-					
Eastern and Central Africa	33	24	9	0					
Burundi	16	16	0	0					
Somalia	1	1	0	0					
South Sudan	16	7	9	0					
Latin America and the Caribbean	-	-	-	-					
				_					

ANNEX II

Total

Headquarters