

# In-Camp Electronic Voucher Programme in Turkey

Market Price Monitoring (PMM) and On-Site Monitoring (OSM), and Protection Report SAVING LIVES CHANGING LIVES

> Quarter 2 (April - June) 2021

#### **Photo Credits**

Cover Photo: WFP/Deniz Akkuş Photo page 5: WFP/Deniz Akkuş

#### **Suggested Citation**

World Food Programme. (2021). *In-Camp Electronic Voucher Programme in Turkey Market Price Monitoring and On-Site Monitoring Report (Quarter 2).* Ankara, Turkey: United Nations World Food Programme Turkey Country Office.

#### HIGHLIGHTS

- The food basket cost has fluctuated through Q2 2021 but eventually increased from 189 TRY in March to 196 TRY in June 2021.
- Vaccinations are on-going at the health centres in the camps on voluntary basis to all adults.
- The agricultural season has started, however the lockdown between mid-April and mid-May interrupted daily work of many residents, and hence their income generation.
- The beneficiaries struggle to meet their needs due to loss of purchasing power mainly driven by food inflation.
- Some camp markets were short of vegetable and fruit supplies between April and May, likely linked to

#### **Q2 2021 CONTEXT**

- Camp managements continue to implement the national regulations against the Covid-19 pandemic. The lockdown took place between April 29<sup>th</sup> and May 17<sup>th</sup>, 2021.
- The Turkish Red Crescent (TK) and donors have provided camp residents with ad hoc in-kind food delivery during Ramadan (between April 13<sup>th</sup> and May 12<sup>th</sup>, 2021).

lockdowns, but the stock problems were resolved as of June 2021.

- 5 protection cases, among which 4 being were related to medical needs and have been referred to relevant authorities during the reporting period.
- 134,909 SMS have been sent to camp beneficiaries between April and June 2021 regarding various issues including the sweep backs and Covid-19 sensitization.
- Posters focusing on the e-card programme and how to receive a HES code have been in place for sensitization.

 The prices slightly decreased in the markets in May, while the national food inflation rate was 17 percent

 perhaps due to Ramadan. Given that the food inflation reached 20% in June, higher price increases in the following months are expected.



BENEFICIARIES	APRIL	MAY	JUNE
	51,026	50,261	49,545
TOTAL VALUE OF ASSISTANCE (TRY)	6,123,120.00	6,031,320.00	5,959,400.00

#### **MONITORING ACTIVITIES**

Due to COVID 19 measures, monitoring activities are conducted remotely in the reporting period. In Q2 2021, thanks to WFP field teams' close coordination with the M&E unit, Turkish Red Crescent (TK), contracted shop managers, camp management and PDMM staff, implementation of the in-camp programme continues successfully.

In Q2 2021, WFP team has conducted three different types of activities shown in the table below. During the reporting period, WFP teams managed to conduct three physical courtesy visits to Adana Sarıçam camp to i) introduce WFP Deputy Country Director and Head of Gaziantep Area office to the newly assigned camp manager, ii) brief him on WFP programmes in Turkey, iii) exchange information about the camp and the residents, iv) officially welcome the new camp manager, and v) introduce newly assigned WFP field teams to the camp management. On-site monitoring visits include visits to the camp managements and the TK offices in the camps about the recent developments in the camps, and to the markets to evaluate the market conditions and food availability.

On-site monitoring visits include visits to the camp managements and the TK offices in the camps about the recent developments in the camps, and to the markets to evaluate the market conditions and food availability.

Month	APRIL	MAY	JUNE
Price-Market Monitoring (PMM)	12	13	9
Remote Camp Monitoring (On- Site Monitoring)	14	12	15
Courtesy visits	1	0	2
TOTAL	27	25	26

#### MONITORING ACTIVITIES—Q2 2021

#### **OBJECTIVES**

**Objective:** This report presents the main findings of incamp monitoring activities from April to June 2021. The market monitoring aims to:

1) Assess the performance of partially restricted<sup>1</sup> e-voucher programme;

2) Report on key issues identified and resolved in shops during the reporting period;

3) Analyse price trends in WFP contracted and non-contracted shops comparing to previous periods.

It also provides information on protection referrals, complaint and feedback mechanisms, and outreach activities conducted in the reporting period.

**Market Price Monitoring:** Every month, WFP/TK (Türk Kızılay – Turkish Red Crescent) jointly collect item prices from shops that have been contracted for the e-voucher programme, and from a similar number of non-contracted shops for comparison purposes. This allows WFP and TK to monitor the programme closely, ensuring that shops are honoring their contractual requirements, and that product prices in camps are aligned with local price trends.

**On-Site Monitoring:** On-site monitoring activities are conducted every month during camp visits to inform the programme about issues that are relevant to refugees and that might have a potential impact on the programme.

**Protection referrals:** Protection referrals system has been active since 2017 and aims to further address protection needs of refugees. The cases that require special attention are identified by WFP field teams during camp visits, and/ or by TK staff based in the camp and/or by the Camp Managements. The cases are referred by WFP to the relevant organizations or actors to resolve.

**Complaint and feedback mechanism:** Türk Kızılay's 168 Call Centre has 3 operators dedicated to the in-camp programme. Since August 2019 the Call Centre has been receiving complaints and feedbacks from the in-camp residents and addressing them to ensure smooth and effective implementation.

<sup>1</sup> Since December 2019, 80 percent of the assistance provided is restricted for food and 20 % is non-restricted. Q2 2021 | WFP Turkey – In-camp E-voucher Programme PMM, OSM and Protection Report

#### **METHODOLOGY**

WFP monitoring teams visit the camps every month without notice. Visits often happen during the week of payment. WFP staff consider the followings in shop visits:

- overall shop condition;
- availability of food items;
- quality of food items;
- prices of food items;
- issuance of itemized receipts to beneficiaries;
- shop staff practices/behavior towards beneficiaries;
- visibility of programme information material/posters;
- compliance with programme rules;
- programme awareness of shop employees;
- beneficiary feedback.

In Q2 2021, a total of 64 market monitoring activities were conducted. Due to the COVID-19 outbreak, WFP suspended all field activities starting from March 2020 and adapted modalities to the pandemic conditions. Close collaboration with Turk Kizilay (TK) enabled market price data collection from the contracted markets. WFP staff reached out to the non-contracted markets through phone calls or benefited from websites of the non-contracted markets that continued to operate online. For the On-site monitoring the data was collected through phone calls.

The table below shows the number of contracted and noncontracted shops monitored during the reporting period.

Month	CONTRACTED SHOP	NON-CONTRACTED SHOP	TOTAL
April 2021	12	10	22
May 2021	12	11	23
June 2021	12	7	19
TOTAL	36	28	64

#### NUMBER OF SHOPS MONITORED-Q2 2021



# **1. Market Price Monitoring**

Price monitoring activities help calculate the average food basket cost in camps. The standard food basket is comprised of specific commodities determined based on food consumption habits of refugees. The food basket provides 2,100 kcal per person/day, in line with Sphere standards (please visit 'In-Camp PMM and OSM Report Q1 2018' for more information on the methodology).

The food basket cost is monitored at four levels: The first is Turkish Statistical Institute (TurkStat) data at national level

ltem	Quantity	Unit
Bread	7.5	Kg
Rice	3	Kg
Bulgur	1.5	Kg
Beans	1.5	Kg
Eggs	30	Pieces
Yoghurt	1.5	Kg
White Cheese	1.5	Kg
Tomatoes	0.9	Kg
Cucumber	0.9	Kg
Sunflower Oil	0.75	Lt
Sugar	1.5	Kg
Salt	0.15	Kg
Теа	0.15	Kg

#### MONTHLY FOOD BASKET

(grey line in Figure 1); the second is TurkStat data for only South-east region of Turkey (yellow line); the third relies on data collected by WFP and TK field monitors in the contracted shops (blue line) where refugees redeem their e -vouchers; and the fourth is calculated with data collected by WFP staff from non-contracted shops (orange line) nearby the camps, which serves as the point of reference for comparison with the in-camp contracted shops.<sup>2</sup>

The food basket cost in the contracted camp markets reached its highest at 196 TRY as of June 2021 (Figure 1). In April 2021, the cost was 193 TRY, however, a 4 TRY decrease in May to 189 TRY was observed. The fluctuation in food basket costs is visible the beginning of the year. Yet still it reflects an increasing trend; compared to June 2020 the yearly increase of the costs in the contracted market is 23 percent. While the food basket costs were stable at the national level and in the Southeast at 244 TRY and 230 TRY respectively, there has been a decline in the food basket costs in the noncontracted markets, which narrows down the gap between contracted and noncontracted markets to 5 TRY. The assistance provided through the e-voucher programme is able to cover 61 percent of the food basket alone, excluding the cost of the non-food items that the 20 percent of the assistance is expected to cover.

#### FIGURE 1: FOOD BASKET PRICE (TRY) TRENDS BETWEEN JUNE 2020 - JUNE 2021



<sup>2</sup> TurkStat data is collected for higher quality products/brands, reflecting Turkish preferences: <u>http://www.turkstat.gov.tr/PreTablo.do?alt\_id=1014#</u>. WFP price data is collected for the commodities selected by refugees - usually the cheapest brands available.

The food basket costs in the contracted markets in the camps between June 2020 to June 2021 is shown in **Figure 2**. All the contracted markets indicated a decrease in May 2021. Given that Ramadan was observed between April 13th and May 12th followed by the Eid-ul Fitr holiday, the prices might be intended to be kept lower to ease the holiday season. Yet, the food inflation rate reached 20 percent in June 2021, perhaps creating a pressure on the food basket cost in contracted markets which already offer the lowest prices possible.

Among the contracted markets in the camps, the food basket cost ranged between 193 TRY in Osmaniye in June and 201 TRY in Sarıçam and Yayladagi camps. All the camps, except for Altınözü and Elbeyli camps there has been a decrease in May before increasing back in June 2021. While Elbeyli has been traditionally one of the cheapest camps, the 13 TRY steep increase in Altınözü between March and April might continued its impact through Q2 2021 without an additional increase in June.

#### FIGURE 2: FOOD BASKET PRICE (TRY) TRENDS IN CONTRACTED SHOPS IN ALL CAMPS, JUNE 2020 - 2021



# 2. On-site Monitoring

## A. Administrative/ management issues

#### **CAMP OVERVIEW**

At the end of April 2021, the market manager in Kahramanmaraş camp has changed after their noncooperation with the TK camp personnel. In May 2021, UN Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) opened a kindergarten in Kahramanmaraş which operates actively without any restriction as per the national regulations. TK management from Ankara and Gaziantep visited Elbeyli camp in June 2021 for general monitoring.

In the reporting period, 30 families have left the Kahramanmaraş camp to settle in Kahramanmaraş city centre and 2 families have moved to Sanliurfa. 16 families have left Adana camp, 15 of whom have moved to Kahramanmaraş and one family has moved to Iraq. In Kilis, 11 families have moved out of the camp and settled in Kilis city centre, Gaziantep, Kahramanmaraş and Mersin. Those who left, report that they have found better work

opportunities and housing. Many camp residents express their wish to move out of the camps, but they have yet not done so due to economic conditions, as noted during monitoring visits. The residents who are inclined to stay in the camps tend to be the elderly residents.

With the start of the agricultural season, there is an increase in the number of people leaving the camps daily for work. However, it depends on the available opportunities. For instance, in Kahramanmaraş daily entrance and exit has fluctuated between 2000 and 3000 throughout Q2 2021. In Kilis, the camp residents go to eggplant and pepper farms for work whereas in Adana, they mostly work in garlic fields for around 70 TRY per day.

In Kilis camp, some residents complain about insufficient space in the containers while some others raise concerns over inadequate sanitation and hygiene conditions in the camps given that they can use the public laundry place only once a week and they are not allowed to have washing machines in the containers.

#### **COVID-19 MEASURES**

The camp managements continue to implement Covid-19 measures across all camps and regularly disinfect the public areas. In line with national regulations, the camps complied with the lockdown between April 29th and May 17th, 2021, while giving permission to the people with work permit to leave the camps. The schools and child-friendly spaces were closed during this period. However, in Kahramanmaraş, the curfew was not very strict, allowing residents to be on the streets within the camp during the lockdown. In April, due to positive Covid-19 cases among the schoolteachers in Kahramanmaraş camp, the camp school was closed for two weeks. No Covid-19 case has been reported except for one family of 5 being quarantined in Kahramanmaraş in May.

The camp residents receive vaccinations on a voluntary basis including the young generation. The health centers in the camps continue to vaccinate by appointment and the nearby hospitals are also available for vaccination. The camp staff are also vaccinated.

Posters about HES codes and the in-camp programme are placed at the entrance of BIM market and TRC management office as of May 2021. In Hatay the posters have been hung in 5 markets during joint visits by WFP and TK teams.

#### **IN-KIND ASSISTANCE**

In Kahramanmaraş camp, TK teams distributed 150 food baskets to widowed and orphan families, along with 3756 baby biscuits and 1512 wafers to 759 families in April 2021. In May, they delivered 310 boxes of wafers, 1200 pairs of shoes and 700 pairs of socks, 600 packages of diapers before the Eid al-Fitr, between May 13th and 15th, 2021. In Kilis camp, TK has distributed food baskets and clothes to the most vulnerable camp residents for Ramadan and Eid al-Fitr.

In May 2021, a businessman donated 500 TRY to each of 700 families in the Kahramanmaraş camp, prioritizing widows, orphans, and families with disabilities.

#### **E-CARD RELATED ISSUES**

Overall, the only e-card related problem reported in Q2 2021 has been related to damage or loss of the cards. The TK staff have assisted camp residents in solving these issues by following up the cases with the Halkbank branches.

# B. Shop regulations, conditions and maintenance

In Q2 2021, the camp markets continue to implement Covid-19 measures. They have changed their working hours according to the regulations during the lockdown period (between mid-April and mid-May). Kilis camp market operated from 09:30 to 18:00 during the weekdays and between 10:00 and 17:00 on Saturdays, whereas the other camp markets have closed at 17:00 throughout the week.

The markets are in good conditions overall and are not crowded thanks to the high number of cashiers in the markets. The Sarıçam camp market has changed its supplier, making an agreement with a new bread factory and the beneficiaries express their satisfaction with the new products.

#### C. Availability of food items

Vegetables and fruits have not been available in the Kahramanmaraş camp market in April and May. The market management has been advised to balance its stock with demand both verbally and by an official letter. Similarly, Adana camp had fresh product shortage in May, which is resolved as of June 2021.

#### D. Purchasing power

The camp residents have raised their concerns about the reduced purchasing power. While being grateful, they state that the assistance is not enough against the increasing prices to meet their needs. The BIM market manager of the Adana camp state that the residents mostly buy cheap and filling food items like bread and potatoes. The manager also confirms that the residents rely on the assistance, there is almost no cash payment, and the residents struggle to cover their needs with their limited budgets.

The lockdown has restricted the camp residents from working for about 3 weeks. The camp manager in Adana has contacted all NGOs to ask for support for the beneficiaries in the forms of food basket or cash assistance to cover their income loss.

# **3. Protection and Referrals**

Since September 2017, a total of 183 cases with protection needs in the camps have been identified and referred to relevant protection actors. The cases are identified either by WFP monitoring teams during camp visits or are referred by the TRC staff based in camps and by the Camp Managements to WFP. Although WFP team has not accessed to the camps physically during Q2 due to Covid-19 measures, in-camp programme partners, TK and camp managements, have referred the cases by phone.

In Q2 2021, 4 protection cases are identified by the implementing partners and 1 case is identified by the WFP field team. All identified cases have been referred to protection actors. 4 of them are related to medical

equipment/medicine needs, referred to IOM and solved successfully, while the other case is related to PDMM. WFP team has been following the pending case closely.

Sarıçam camp cumulatively has the highest number of referrals (156 out of 183), followed by Kahramanmaraş camp while there have been no protection cases reported from Osmaniye or Altınözü camps since September 2017. Only two of the 183 cases are from Iraqi nationalities, while the rest are Syrians (**Figure 3**).

The majority of the cases are for medical equipment/ medicine needs (72%) followed by need for health services (**Figure 4**).

#### FIGURE 3: REFERRALS BY CAMPS AS OF Q2 2021





# 4. Accountability to the Affected Population (AAP)

# A. Received calls by the 168 Call Center

During the reporting period, 519 calls have been received by the 168 Call Centre. The highest number of calls are made by Adana Sarıçam Camp residents (341) followed by the residents of Kilis (69), Kahramanmaraş (55), Osmaniye (55), and Hatay (26) camps, respectively.

60 percent of the calls have been made by men. The share of calls made by women has slightly increased from 36 percent to 40 percent in Q2 2021 as compared to the previous quarter.

Beneficiaries call the 168 Call Center mainly to update their household information (66%). During the reporting period,

the call center has received 99 calls from beneficiaries requesting to check their card balance. In Spring season, some camp residents tend to call to check their residency status as they leave the camps for few days for the agricultural work.

In total 16 complaint calls were received: half of them (8) from the Sarıçam camp. The calls are related to the camp management's deactivating camp residencies or having difficulties for re-acceptance to the camp as residents were out of the camp due to hospitalization or work. Four of these camp related complaints are addressed and the TK follows the rest of the complaint cases. No fraudulent case is observed in this reporting period.

#### FIGURE 5: CALLS BY CATEGORIES Q2 2021



## **B.** Outreach Activities

During the reporting period, 134,909 SMSs have been sent to the camp residents. These include Covid-19 sensitisation and upload messages in addition to regular warnings about dormant accounts.

Also, the e-voucher programme and HES Code posters are designed and placed at WFP contracted markets, TK office and camp management offices to sensitize beneficiaries about the programme and how to obtain their HES Code, as required by the Ministry of Health.

#### FIGURE 6: SMS SENT BY CATEGORY IN Q2 2021



#### **OUTREACH SNAPSHOT**



#### **ANNEX 1**

The food basket is designed to be nutritionally balanced, corresponding with the consumption habits of the refugees in Turkey, and for the most affordable cost possible. With the increase in bread prices, the traditionally high share of bread increased from 20 percent to 22

percent between Q1 and Q2 2021. The share of cheese cost (19%) also increased by 2 percent. The share of the following three items rice, beans, eggs remained unchanged. The five top items reflect a dietary diversity.



**Figure 8** depicts the price trends for each item in the food basket since the beginning of 2021. While most items had stable price in the contracted markets, the prices of rice, yoghurt and bread increased in Q2 2021. The bread prices in contracted markets (5.49 TRY/kg) exceeded the price in the noncontracted markets (5.03 TRY/kg) for the first time.

Bulgur and bean prices are also slightly higher in the contracted markets at the end of June 2021. The tea prices have been traditionally higher due to type differences; refugees culturally consume Ceylon tea, which is more expensive than the Turkish tea available in the noncontracted markets as the cheapest alternative.



## FIGURE 8: DIVERGENT PRICE TRENDS (TRY/KG) FOR WFP REFERENTIAL FOOD BASKET ITEMS IN CONTRACTED AND NON-CONTRACTED SHOPS

#### Q2 2021 | WFP Turkey - In-camp E-voucher Programme PMM, OSM and Protection Report





















#### **ANNEX 2**



Q2 2021| WFP Turkey – In-camp E-voucher Programme PMM, OSM and Protection Report

#### World Food Programme Turkey Country Office

Rafet Canıtez Caddesi No: 107 Oran Şehri, 06450 Çankaya, Ankara, Turkey co.tur.m&e@wfp.org **wfp.org**