

Evaluation for evidence-based decision making | WFP Office of Evaluation

Evaluation Quality Assurance System (EQAS)

Template

Management Response from WFP Nigeria to the recommendations of the decentralized evaluation of Formative Evaluation of Livelihoods Activities in Northeast Nigeria (2018-2020) [DE/NGCO/2018/026] from October 2018 to August 2021

- 1. This document, finalized in July 2022 presents the management response to the recommendations of the evaluation Formative Evaluation of Livelihoods Activities in Northeast Nigeria (2018-2021).
- 2. The evaluation, which was commissioned by WFP Nigeria covers the livelihood interventions it supported between October 2018 and August 2021 in Borno, Adamawa, and Yobe (BAY) States of northeast Nigeria. The evaluation serves the dual purpose of accountability and learning and informed the design of the next CSP (2023-2027), to refine the design of WFP's livelihood interventions, and to support advocacy for continuing support to conflict-affected people in the BAY states.
- 3. The evaluation made six key recommendations with 15 actions. The matrix sets out whether WFP agrees, partially agrees or disagrees with the recommendations and sub-recommendations. It presents the planned (or taken) actions, responsibilities and timelines.

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
Priority: High Recommendation 1: : Refine the targeting approach to better ensure the inclusion of vulnerable groups (women, youth, elderly, persons with disabilities). (First quarter of new intervention)	WFP RAM, Gender and Protection Unit	Partially agreed. The targeting approach was already based on considerations of vulnerability and inclusion of groups such as women, female-headed households, elderly and persons with disabilities (PWDs). Nonetheless, the CO will explore opportunities to strengthen its targeting to ensure holistic inclusion of all vulnerable groups and	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
Sub-recommendation 1.1: Targeting is based partly on classification, and therefore classification of women and men (as married, unmarried, within nuclear and extended family units, young and older, widowed, divorced, disability type and elderly) should be understood and clarified to ensure best approaches towards targeting and sustained participation. For example, targeting of youth	WFP RAM, Programme, Gender and Protection Units.	Agreed The CO agrees that its targeting approach can benefit from better understanding of the intra- household dynamics, hence the recommendation will be considered and taken forward accordingly.	1.1.1 The CO will review and revise its targeting approach to better understand intrahousehold dynamics.	CO RAM unit (RBD RAM)	June 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
requires an understanding of the community definition of female youth and the best manner of benefitting this group.					
Sub-recommendation 1.2: explicitly define the category of the elderly and PWDs, to determine those who should be exempted from conditional transfers and kept on unconditional transfers and to determine the most suitable livelihood activities. Due care is	WFP RAM, Programme, Gender and Protection Units.	Partially agreed Programme design for livelihood activities is planned around the household as the unit to benefit. Elderly persons and PWDs are already included in FFA activities, and do receive	1.2.1 Continued sensitization and training of CPs on FFA guidelines regarding the participation of PWDs and the elderly in livelihood activities.	CO Programme [RAM and and Protection units]	June 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
required while targeting this group, without excluding persons with disabilities from participation, and ensuring that in a targeted household, any adult member may participate. WFP and its partners do not implement both conditional and unconditional approaches in the same community, and therefore there is no flexibility to move between both approaches at the community level. It is possible to include abled members such as youths living in the same households with the elderly in		household assets (e.g., IGAs, Livestock – SHOATs, etc). However, for labour intensive activities requiring the use of physical strength, they are advised to nominate an alternate (due to protection concerns). The alternate provides labour only, but cash/food assistance still goes to the PWDs/Elderly where they are the primary recipients. This has been the practice.	1.2.2 Implement complementary livelihood activities under SO1. This means that PWDs under unconditional transfers can still receive some livelihoods support appropriate for their condition.	CO RAM, Programme and Protection units	June 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
livelihoods activities, thus ensuring that such households are included. The challenge will be households that solely have PWDs and elderly, that are clearly vulnerable, and do not have members that could meet conditionality criteria for participation in livelihoods activities. In such cases, special attention or concession might be layered into the targeting approach to cater for such situations.					

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year - not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
Sub-recommendation 1.3: Ensure that community sensitization clearly explains the selection criteria and selection process, to address misconceptions especially from non-beneficiaries.	WFP RAM, Programme, Gender and Protection Units.	<i>Partially agreed.</i> Community sensitization is already a critical part of the targeting process and greater emphasis will be put on community sensitization during targeting	1.3.1 Comprehensive community sensitization during targeting to be re- emphasized and enforced.	CO RAM, Programme, Protection and Gender units	June 2023
Sub-recommendation 1.4: Targeting women in male-headed households as beneficiaries should be examined further given the project was largely empowering to married women	WFP RAM, Programme, Gender and Protection Units.	<i>Partially agreed</i> Male and female members are collectively engaged through the CBPP process and community targeting.	1.4.1 Continued sensitization on the CBPP process and community targeting tools in FFA implementation.	CO RAM, Programme and Gender units	June 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
who participated, but that there was also some negative backlash among some husbands due to women's participation in the project. Engage men in the planning process to mitigate any misconceptions.		Further, there is community and gender sensitization especially at the beginning of the targeting process to avoid misconceptions about the objectives of the intervention and for the targeting of women.	1.4.2 The CO will improve gender sensitization among men in implementation communities throughout project implementation.	RAM, Programme and Gender units	June 2023
Sub-recommendation 1.5: Revisit the current approach of engaging PwDs through third parties and use as vulnerability criteria qualifying households. PwDs and the elderly can be engaged to	WFP RAM, Programme, Gender and Protection Units.	<i>Partially agreed</i> The current targeting approach adopted by the CO takes into account, minorities, including elderly	1.5.1 Continued sensitization/ training of CPs on FFA guidelines on the participation of PWD and the	RAM, Programme, Protection	June 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
make their own livelihoods choices where possible based on disability type, age etc.		and PWDs, from the constitution of the Community Targeting Committees (CTCs),	elderly, including the kind of activities that may be suitable for these groups.		
		development of the eligibility criteria and actual targeting. This will further be addressed through strengthening of the targeting process in the CO to ensure holistic inclusion of all vulnerable groups.	1.5.2 In CSP 2.0, the CO introduced complementary livelihoods under SO1. This means that PWDs under unconditional transfers are eligible to receive some livelihoods support	RAM, Programme, Protection	June 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
			appropriate for their condition.		
Priority: High Recommendation 2: : Strengthen gender-responsiveness in programming. (First quarter of new intervention)	WFP Programme , Gender and Protection Units	Partially agreed The CO has continued to strengthen gender responsiveness in its programming, through capacity strengthening and ensuring the gender consideration are taken on board during programming – This says partially agreed as this is already on going but the CO agrees that this is	2.1.1 CO to develop gender mainstreaming guidelines and checklist specific to the context for all strands of WFP's operations	Gender, Protection and Programme units	March 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
		continuous process that would be sustained to harness the gender transformation agenda of the CO.			
Sub-recommendation 2.1: Involve the Gender and Protection Unit during the CBPP process to understand gender dynamics and household decision making to help identify potential gender and protection-related risks in livelihood interventions and the	WFP Programme , Gender and Protection Units	<i>Partially agreed</i> The CBPP process already include Gender and protection considerations to ensure that Gender and protection issues are addressed or plans for risk mitigation are identified	2.1.1 Carry Out CO Gender Analysis	Gender, RAM, Programme, Protection	March 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
suggested mitigation measures during project implementation.					
Sub-recommendation 2.2: specifically, increased attention should be paid to assignment of communal livelihoods activities, to ensure they are gender	WFP Programme , Gender and Protection Units	<i>Partially agreed</i> Special considerations are made specifically for PLWs, PWDs and the elderly under		Gender, RAM, Programme, Protection	March 2023
appropriate. Due to women's mobility constraints, consideration should be given to livelihood activities and/or design of activities, which women may	ation	communal activities, they nominate alternates because communal activities in most cases have to be in a particular location considered	2.2.1 Continued sensitization/ training of CPs on FFA guidelines on the participation of Women, PWD and	Gender, RAM, Programme, Protection	March 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
undertake at/or very near home, if needed.		suitable by community members.	the elderly in communal activities.		
Sub-recommendation 2.3: Given women's high workloads, the following are recommended: 1)	WFP Programme , Gender and Protection Units	Partially agreed WFP already uses the identified strategies in the	2.3.1	Gender, RAM, Programme, Protection	March 2023
I labour-saving technologies should be prioritized for women; 2) strategies that will give women free time, such as community childcare, customized support, and women-friendly spaces; and 3) more education and sensitization around the flexible terms of the communal work activities (e.g., can work in several hour increments		implementation of livelihood activities -labour saving technologies -Provision of childcare at work sites -Flexible terms at communal work -Grouping women based on familiarity etc.	2.3.1 Training of CPs on FFA guidelines and monitoring CP implementation to ensure conformity with the guidelines.	Programme unit (<i>Livelihoods and</i> Partnership units)	March 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
and can be paid for portion of days per month worked). 4) Revisit the randomly selected communal group participants and perhaps, even if with a few trials introduce grouping based on familiarity in business or kinship, to assess the likelihood of a growth in groups' ability to pool strengths and grow businesses.		These strategies will continue to be enhanced.			
Sub-recommendation 2.4: Gender-related trainings should entail: - Broad capacity building on promotion of gender-	WFP Programme , Gender and Protection Units	<i>Partially agreed</i> The CO already has a Gender mainstreaming training plan for CPs based on key gap	2.4.1 CO to enhance Gender mainstreaming induction for staff and CPs and have	Gender, Programme	January 2023 (ongoing)

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
transformative change through sensitization (focusing on issues such as gender roles, leadership, or power), which have positive changes in attitudes of both men and women on gender equity and perceptions of gender (USAID Feed the Future 2016). Given the relative success of the gender sensitization training on the PMC's and ongoing tensions among some households due to involvement with the program, continuing gender sensitization would help ameliorate immediate feelings of resentment and		areas identified by the CPs during the capacity assessment and based on the key areas of interest identified by the CPs through an online poll. The CPs had a two-day full Gender training session. The CPs already have Gender, Protection and AAP sensitization sessions for PMCs and all other related committees. WFP provided referral information for psychosocial support as there	systematic capacity development process for WFP staff and CPs		

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
 backlash among men, while potentially transforming gender attitudes and beliefs in the long- run. Increasing the training period for women, particularly those who have never worked outside the home, so that women may be on more equal footing with men in regard to business success. Among the topics covered should be psychosocial support and financial inclusion for all women trained. 		are nationally established referral procedures and guidelines for GBV related issues. Financial inclusion for women (training and interventions) is on-going WFP will continue to improve and make these interventions more effective.			

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
Priority: High (due to seasonality of many livelihoods) Recommendation 3: Increase the timeframe for livelihoods activities.(First year of new intervention)	WFP Programme, RAM	<i>Partially agreed</i> The period of transfers would remain the same, but the CO will explore opportunities to provide capacity strengthening activities for a longer duration, resources permitting	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable
Sub-recommendation 3.1: Aim for longer spans of engagement of around 4 years to address the common theme that the duration of the activities was	WFP Programme, RAM	Agreed The duration of support for livelihood activities in the next CSP is proposed to three years, asbased on	3.1.1 Continued advocacy for multi- year resources for livelihoods interventions.	Programme unit; Partnerships and OIM and CO management.	August 2022 This has started already with resources from BMZ and MCF; and will

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
too short, and considering that partners and beneficiaries		recent funding trends. The main challenge hampering			continue throughout the CSP.
generally acknowledge the long- term benefits of engaging in the activities to develop skills and asset management		the duration of livelihood activities is funding, and the CO will continue to explore innovative funding mechanisms to support multi-year programming. The CO will also incorporate plans to have the beneficiaries graduate to self-reliance by continuous mentorship, close monitoring and measurement of progress using clear indicators.	3.1.2 Re-defining the country office livelihood strategy	Programme	March 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
Sub-recommendation 3.2: The time frame for agricultural activities should continue to be equal to the length of the production cycle or growing season. For other livelihood	WFP Programme, RAM	Partially agreed The CO has already started receiving multiyear funding for implementation of the livelihood activities this will ensure partners are on	3.2.1 Implementation of livelihoods activities as designed in the 2.0 CSP.	Programme, RAM, Supply Chain	March 2023
activities, the timeframe should encompass the market season or access for a product, the length of time for a phased training, and availability of raw materials for the livelihood activity		ensure partners are on ground to support beneficiaries throughout the agricultural cycle. Trainings have been designed to support the full production cycle of the project from pre-	3.2.2 Continue advocating for multi- year funding for livelihood activities	Programme unit; Partnerships and OIM and CO management.	August 2022 This has started already with resources from BMZ and MCF; and will

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
		planting to post-harvest. The CO will continue to ensure quality trainings are delivered by reviewing the manuals and content used and ensuring that relevant State ministries and Departments are engaged. The new CSP has categorized livelihoods beneficiaries into FFA and SAMS. FFA – will receive in-kind/CBT conditional transfers to cover the lean season- for they have food shortages. The			continue throughout the CSP.

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
Sub-recommendation 3.3: In addition, the likelihood of sustainability may be enhanced if the WFP Livelihoods Team works with communities in partnership	WFP Programme, RAM	support duration can extend but with only CS interventions. SAMS beneficiaries will be supported throughout the agricultural season. These will not receive transfers- only CS. All these are subject to resource availability <i>Partially agreed</i> The CO already has some good Partnerships with other UN agencies and government and would strive to even	3.3.1 Strengthening existing joint projects while developing new ones.	Programme, Partnerships and OIM, RAM and CO management.	December 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
with other agencies such as FAO and IFAD, with support from state and federal governments to map out livelihoods business models with a strong focus on integration and layering and including areas such as youth enterprises, small and medium scale agri-food businesses, and livestock development. Investments to increase sustainability may also be encouraged through pilot thrift and credit groups where		strengthen and expand on such existing partnerships. Some of such partnership includes -Twin track approach with FAO -Resilience and social cohesion with UNICEF -Restoring and promoting sustainable agri-livelihoods with FAO Similarly, Village Savings and Loans Associations are being	3.3.2 Designing interventions using food systems approach- leveraging on complementary partnerships, to support resource mobilization. Implementation will be based on the level of funding.	Programme / Partnerships	December 2024
beneficiaries can deposit and save		implemented as well as the businesses mentioned.	3.3.3 Advancing the VSLAs model and	Programme/IT /Finance	March 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
from their harvests and loan to each other.		In addition, the State Ministries, Departments and	(digital) financial inclusion.		
		Agencies have been engaged throughout in providing technical support throughout implementation. ADP, Yobe Livestock Development programme and the Ministry of Women Affairs have been providing training and support at the community level.	3.3.4 Prioritization of businesses to be supported –all the way to markets, including niche markets	Programme, Supply Chain	March 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
Priority: High Recommendation 4: Capacity building should be sufficiently comprehensive to enable beneficiaries gain adequate technical knowledge to grow sustainable and viable businesses. (First year of new intervention)	WFP Programme	Partially agreed Capacity building (training and NFIs) is embedded in livelihoods interventions and is delivered by CPs to both communities and state level government counterparts. The CO conducts capacity assessment of the CP at the beginning of CP engagement, where capacity gaps are identified. WFP the works with the CPs to address these gaps. This is done to ensure	4.1 Developing clear training plan, with outcome deliverables to be monitored throughout the implementation. CO through the CPs will incorporate continuous mentorship strategies to reinforce the skills acquired.	Programme, RAM, Gender units	June 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
		the CPs have capacity to transfer appropriate knowledge and skills, including gender mainstreaming, to beneficiaries.			
Priority: Medium Recommendation 5: Evaluate the livelihoods activities. (Before activities are redesigned or scaled up)	WFP RAM, Programme, Gender, Protection	Partially agreed The findings and recommendations from the current DE were taken into consideration in the design of the CSP 2.0 which is scheduled to commence in	CO will evaluate the Mastercard Foundation resilience programme	RAM (CO), [Evaluation (RBD and HQ), Programme, Supply Chain, Gender, Protection]	June 2026

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
		the first quarter of 2023. It is therefore impractical to have another evaluation ahead of the redesign and scale up of livelihoods activities, which has been synchronized with the CSP 2.0 rollout. Notwithstanding, the CO is exploring opportunities to implement an evidence generation exercisefor its Mastercard flagship resilience programme for smallholder farmers on postharvest loss management and increased market access.	5.2 Gender analysis carried out to inform scale up or redesign	Gender, RAM, Programme, Protection	March 2023

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
Priority: HighWFP Programme, RAM, Gender, ProtectionRecommendation 6: Scale up livelihoods activities with flexibility to build on the progress and lessons learnt from the current livelihoods' activities, maintaining the design elements that strengthened peace and social cohesion, and adjusting for local context and type of beneficiaries.WFP Programme, RAM, Gender, Protection	<i>Partially agreed</i> The CO builds on lessons learnt to design and implement livelihoods	6.1 Implementation of livelihood activities under 2.0 CSP.	Programme, Protection and gender units.	December 2025	
		interventions. For example, livelihoods interventions in 2.0 CSP, the new multi-year projects (BMZ and MCF), were	6.2 . Continue advocating for multiyear resources for livelihood activities.	Programme, Partnership/OIM and CO Management.	August 2022

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
(Immediately; the plan and action for sustainability must start immediately for up-scaling to succeed)		designed based on the lessons learnt so far. In 2022 the CO has scaled up livelihood activities with multi-year funding from the MCF and BMZ. While the CO plans to scale up livelihood activities, as presented in the new CSP, the actualization depends on availability of funds. CO will continue to mobilize resources, including from non-traditional donors.	6.3. Conduct conflict sensitivity assessments to inform the design on interventions that will not exacerbate conflict drivers. The biannual food security outcome monitoring, which also includes proxy measures for peace and social cohesion within communities,	Protection, Programme, Gender, RAM.	December 2023 (Ongoing)

Recommendations and related Sub- recommendations (Deadline) [as per evaluation report – one (sub-) recommendation per row, deadline in brackets.]	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division (/possibly external stakeholder in the case of Joint Evaluation). Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed? If Partially agreed or Not agreed, provide a brief reason for this.]	Actions to be taken [Briefly state what action(s) will be taken to address each sub- recommendation – one action per row.]	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions) [Name of responsible WFP office/division/unit. Names of supporting WFP offices/divisions and/or external stakeholders if any in brackets.]	Action Deadline [Month and year – not to exceed related (sub-)recommendation deadline.]
		WFP activities all have built in CS interventions as part of the sustainability plan.	will be further refined as necessary.		