



**WFP EVALUATION**

## **Thematic Evaluation of Supply Chain Outcomes in the Food System in Eastern Africa from 2016 to 2021**

Supplementary Report: Somalia Country Case-Study

Final Report  
WFP Regional Bureau Nairobi

**23 June 2022**



**World Food Programme**

**SAVING  
LIVES  
CHANGING  
LIVES**

# Key personnel for the evaluation

## **WFP REGIONAL BUREAU NAIROBI**

Aude Mommeja, Evaluation Manager

Nikki Zimmerman, Regional Evaluation Officer

Wanjiku Guchu, Regional Logistics Evaluation Focal Point

## **PREPARED BY**

Stephen McDowell, Team Leader

Faysal Mataan, National Expert

Noura Mahmoud, National Expert

# Acknowledgements

The Evaluation Team expresses its gratitude to the WFP Regional Bureau staff in Nairobi for their support to this evaluation, particularly our Evaluation Managers, Aude Mommeja and Nikki Zimmerman, as well as Wanjiku Guchu, the focal point from the Regional Supply Chain Unit for this evaluation, and those sitting on the Evaluation Reference Group, particularly Barbara Van Logchem (WFP RBN Logistics) and Robert O'Neill (WFP RBN Procurement). We thank Madga Jurkowiecka (Head of Supply Chain, Somalia) who was the WFP evaluation focal point for the Somalia case-study and provided important technical and logistical support to the Evaluation Team, along with the Somalia County Office team. We also extend our thanks to all WFP staff in Somalia, as well as WFP supply chain partners and sectoral experts, and beneficiaries, who gave their valuable time as key informants to the Evaluation Team.

## Disclaimer

The opinions expressed in this report are those of the evaluation team, and do not necessarily reflect those of the World Food Programme. Responsibility for the opinions expressed in this report rests solely with the authors. Publication of this document does not imply endorsement by WFP of the opinions expressed.

The designation employed and the presentation of material in maps do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of WFP concerning the legal or constitutional status of any country, territory or sea area, or concerning the delimitation of frontiers.

# Table of Contents

1. Introduction .....	1
2. Overview of Country and WFP Context.....	1
3. Process/Methodology/Limitations for Country Study .....	2
4. Findings .....	3
5. Discussion and Conclusions.....	12
Annex 1. Fieldwork overview .....	17
Annex 2. Bibliography.....	20
Acronyms .....	21

## List of tables

Table 1	Stakeholders that have been affected by Micro & Small Businesses Around Berbera Port .....	4
Table 2	2021 Movements at Berbera Port.....	5
Table 3	Stakeholders that have been affected by transport contracts around Berbera Port.....	6
Table 4	Stakeholders that have been affected by e-shop and delivery initiatives around Dollow .....	9
Table 5	Assessment against evaluation questions.....	12
Table 6	Scope & Scale of changes (outcomes) linked to WFP Supply Chain actions .....	16
Table 7	Scale and Scope of changes related to WFP Supply Chain Activities .....	16
Table 8	List of people interviewed, Somalia.....	17
Table 9	Somalia fieldwork agenda .....	18

## List of boxes

Box 1	Stakeholders that have been affected by Micro & Small Businesses Around Berbera Port .....	4
Box 2	Stakeholders that have been affected by transport contracts around Berbera Port.....	6
Box 3	Stakeholders that have been affected by e-shop and delivery initiatives around Dollow .....	9

# 1. Introduction

1. This Somalia case study was intended to support the thematic evaluation of supply chain outcomes in the food system in Eastern Africa. This report is a supplementary publication to be read in conjunction with the regional Evaluation Report.
2. The primary objective of this evaluation was to identify and assess the nature and extent of the effects of supply chain activities on food systems and their components, to differentiate effects according to gender or other groups when appropriate, and thereby to achieve greater awareness of these effects that can inform the design of future interventions. To this end the evaluation focuses on clearly discernible outcomes that are well supported by available evidence. The evaluation spans the period from January 2016 to December 2020 and covers all nine country offices (COs) supported by WFP Regional Bureau in Eastern Africa (RBN), namely Burundi, Djibouti, Ethiopia, Kenya, Rwanda, Somalia, South Sudan, Sudan and Uganda. It includes urban, peri-urban and rural areas where supply chain activities have been implemented. A broad regional-level assessment was complemented by three focal country case studies in Kenya, Somalia and South Sudan.
3. By conducting a deeper dive into selected thematic areas in Somalia, it was expected that the underlying causes and key factors affecting the most common food system outcomes would be revealed in greater detail. This would lead to a better understanding of the ways in which supply chain interventions affect food systems across the whole region. The case study would also provide comparisons with results from other countries and thus highlight the extent to which outcomes might be affected by country context. The Somalia case study examines WFP work in: Berbera, Somaliland and Dollow, Somalia. WFP work in Berbera is almost exclusively related to Supply Chain and Logistics (Berbera port is the gateway of WFP commodities to Ethiopia, Somaliland and parts of Somalia). The second location, Dollow, came to prominence for humanitarian interests with the displacements of 2011. WFP assistance to those populations has been through commodities and increasingly, cash. For the last five to six years, WFP has been complementing cash assistance (via Scope card) with the e-Shop initiative.

## 2. Overview of Country and WFP Context

4. Somalia is a low-income, food deficit country located in East Africa. Somalia has experienced extreme challenges across recent decades, including insecurity, climate-related disasters and fragile governance, and is undergoing the difficult transition from 'failed' state to 'fragile' state.
5. WFP has been operating in Somalia since 1967 supporting efforts to achieve food security. In 2020 WFP reached 4.5 million women, men, girls and boys across Somalia providing cash-based transfers, food assistance and capacity strengthening. This represents approximately 28 percent of the total population in Somalia. 90 percent of the entitlements were received in the hands of women and girls.
6. During the period of this evaluation, the Somalia CO have implemented an interim Country Strategic Plan (iCSP) 2019-2021 and from the 1 January 2022 the CSP 2022-2025 has been operationalized, which aims to WFP humanitarian mandate whilst sustainably moving affected populations onto a resilience path through five fully integrated and interrelated strategic outcomes that focus on: crisis response, including the treatment and prevention of malnutrition; resilience building in urban and rural settings; providing solutions that make food systems more sustainable; providing capacity strengthening and technical assistance to government entities; and providing mandated and on-demand services to the humanitarian community through the United Nations Humanitarian Air Service, the WFP-led logistics cluster and WFP bilateral service provision. The Somalia CO have articulated a Sustainable Food Systems Strategy (2021)<sup>1</sup>, which aims 'to systematically leverage its extensive supply chain, transfer systems capacity, and programmatic footprint to enhance food

---

<sup>1</sup> WFP Somalia (2021). WFP Somalia Sustainable Food Systems

systems performance, preventing and reducing the impact of man-made and natural shocks on Somalia's vulnerable population, while ensuring access to healthy and nutritious diets'.

7. Since 2016, WFP work on gender in Somalia has been guided by a Country Gender Action Plan (CGAP). The CGAP defined priorities and needs across activities and operations for the country until 2020 with regards to gender. Developing the capacity of staff, partners and the government on gender and mainstreaming protection was specified as a priority.
8. The WFP Somalia CO is based in Mogadishu, Somalia. WFP has a deep field presence through 12 area and field offices throughout the country and a liaison office in Nairobi, Kenya.

### 3. Process/Methodology/Limitations for Country Study

9. This case study was guided by the overarching evaluation methodology set out for the regional evaluation. A mixed methods approach was used, centred around open-ended enquiry in alignment with the learning perspective of the Terms of Reference. The evaluation is required to answer twelve Evaluation Questions, with associated sub-questions, as set out in the regional Evaluation Report. The evaluation uses the evaluation criteria of relevance/appropriateness, effectiveness, efficiency, impact (contribution) and sustainability.
10. The Somalia case study combined remote scoping and data collection with in-country field work in Berbera and Dollow. The Somalia evaluation team worked with the WFP Somalia CO to identify issues of relevance to the study and from those to select the ones which would eventually be evaluated. Three issues and associated changes were identified for the evaluation:
  - Increased revenue and income for micro and small businesses due to WFP contracted lorries parking outside the Berbera Port.
  - Increased business for Somaliland registered transporters due to WFP contracting changes and negotiated travel permissions in Ethiopia.
  - Financial gains and transforming retail and supply norms in Dollow as a result of the e-Shop and delivery initiative.
11. The evaluation team spent 11 days conducting field level work in Berbera and Dollow. In total 63 participants were interviewed during the case-study data collection of 22 percent were female (see Annex 1). Key participants in Berbera included: representatives from municipal government; those working in the transport industry, including truck drivers; retailers; and private sector port operators. In Dollow, key participants included: retailers; users of retail services; wholesalers; transporters. WFP field staff were also interviewed and provided important, granular information and insights.
12. **Limitations:**
  - Any conclusions of findings in this case study must only be considered either indicative or suggestions. They are based on very limited samples and exposures to actors within different fields or food systems.
  - Evidence was collected primarily through interviews. There was limited data looking at the impacts to food systems and the role of supply chain. As a result, much of the analysis draws on anecdotal evidence.

# 4. Findings

## Key Areas of Change: Berbera

13. The findings from the Berbera case study are presented in this section. The discussion is structured under thematic areas and by outcomes. Four areas of outcome were identified for the Berbera operations as follows:
  - Outcome 1: Micro & Small Businesses Around Berbera Port – revenue & income
  - Outcome 2: Somaliland Transporters – revenue, profit or income
  - Outcome 3: Employment: The Unanticipated Outcome.
14. Each outcome is discussed below highlighting the nature and the process behind the change, the stakeholders that were affected, any unintended changes that were identified, and reflections on the likely sustainability of the change.

### *Thematic area 1: Transport*

#### *Outcome 1: Micro & Small Businesses around Berbera Port – revenue & income*

15. Consistently, businesses operating outside the port in the area where lorries congregate reported a significant increase in business over the past few years. These businesses were principally restaurants and shops. Small repairs were seen to be made, but these were small and being undertaken by the drivers themselves<sup>2</sup>. The restaurants and shops serve almost exclusively truckers (it is not a residential area). We observed 40 to 60 lorries over the two days we conducted interviews in that parking area. We also noted about 25 to 35 local restaurants and the busy ones serving about six to eight clients. The number of small kiosks were fewer, perhaps 10 to 15. There were also a small number of larger retail shops nearby (not in the actual parking area).
16. Restaurants reported a daily revenue of about USD 120 to perhaps USD 400. It was estimated that of that revenue, the owner may take home USD 20 to 80 per day. We also had the impression that with the level of competition, business growth may be a function of not only demand by truckers, but also relative advantages of one business over another. Kiosks reported daily revenues of USD 40 to 70 per day, and profits of USD 5 to 9 per day.
17. Steady or increasing revenues lead to modest improvements to the facilities (i.e., new plastic chairs or wooden tables, bigger refrigerator for cold drinks), product lines (bananas, milk powder or homemade juices) but the researchers felt that profits were largely channelled into the family, supporting elders, educating children, or paying rent.
18. These businesses were supplied by a number of wholesalers/wholesalers who also reported steady increases in their businesses. These businesses were dry goods/foods wholesalers, and fish mongers/fishermen. The wholesaler estimated that from one shop, they may earn USD 200 per day. Fishmongers estimate sales between USD 30 and 100 per day, with considerable variation seasonally and in customer demand.
19. The wholesaler interviewed now has five branches. The store that was visited had been expanded. It was selling buckets, kitchen items, diapers, cleaning materials and more. Prior to the current period of growth, they had been selling sacks of rice, sugar, flour, oil, and pasta, cartons of drinks (milk powder, sodas, juices and water). The shop has increased their staff by two and now has a total of six employees. Two fishmongers were also interviewed. They too have seen increases in revenue. They had not modified their shops, nor businesses but rather had invested in more freezer chests (approx. 75L). They do not have employees.
20. Dahabshil (a financial services provider) reported increases in numbers of clients (personal and small businesses) and financial activity. They attribute the changes to increased port activity that coincided with the change in management of the Port (i.e., since DP World began managing the port). They report that services most demanded by their clients are: DahabPay (mobile money), savings accounts, currency exchange (salary or payments are in Somali Shilling which are converted to USD), consumption loans (housing, furnishing,

---

<sup>2</sup>Larger repairs were reportedly done in Berbera, but outside the lorry parking area.

vehicle, construction materials for home construction), business loans (i.e., ovens). Repayment rates are excellent. Clients must have national ID, be taxpayers and businesses are required to have a business license.

21. Dahabshil's Microfinance unit has seen a growing number of clients over the last four to five years. Their clients use DahabMicro's real estate services (house rentals), small and medium-size enterprises business loans (bakery ovens, butchery tools), real estate loans (for better off clients such as those employed by DP World staff), house construction loans, savings accounts, E-dahab account as well as SoMTel SIM cards. Loan sizes have increased from USD 5,000 to 7,000 for the DP World staff and USD 500 to USD 4,000 for small businesses. Repayments are monthly and repayment rates are high.
22. Municipal authorities echoed Dahabshil's observations. In the last ten years, the Municipal government has seen an increase in schools, water supply, urban beautification (sidewalks, rubbish removal) and importantly, the Berbera Corridor Road construction. The authorities attribute the increases to an overall economic improvement which while driven by port activities, has extended down to the common citizens. They note growing and vibrant economic activity amongst small or micro businesses and the example of restaurants (small and big) was given. The critical change factor for this change, according to the Deputy Mayor, was DP World.
23. **Timeframe:** Interviewees generally reported the increases have been ongoing for the last three or so years, essentially since DP World began operations (2018-19).

#### **Box 1 Stakeholders that have been affected by Micro & Small Businesses Around Berbera Port**

Not only have the primary services – restaurants and kiosks – benefitted, but improvements are reported by the wholesalers – wholesale, fish and finance – to these businesses:

- Restaurant/Kiosk owners (primarily women owned/operated, generally 30 to 40 years old)
- Clients: Lorry Drivers (men, 20 to 50 years of age – with the average between 30 and 40)
- Families of Owners: primarily children in primary school (girls and boys)
- Wholesalers: Male/Female owners 30 to 40 years
- Importers: principally major importers based in Hargeisa (men – likely 30 to 50 years)
- Fishermen/Fish Mongers: men, 20 to 40 years of age
- Financial Services: Dahabshil Commercial and DahabMicro
- Men – particularly younger men – are employed casually or longer term in port related activities.

The Municipal Authorities did not report an increase in tax revenue due to the growing number of registered businesses (i.e., restaurants). Rather, the Deputy Mayor celebrated the economic improvements of small businesses, port employees and casual labourers, as it enabled them to independently care for family members, improve their conditions and create opportunities for the future.

Staff: Kiosks and restaurants were reported to be owned, managed and operated by the same individual. Some reported assistance from family members (children) in one case, there was a single employee to help with serving.

24. All interviewees attributed the increases in business revenue and incomes to the port and specifically DP World. DP World employs a large number of people but also, under their management, the volume of port activity has expanded considerably. DP World reports that since they assumed management responsibilities for the port, container traffic has increased 32 percent and general cargo has increased 63 percent (much of the casual labour demand is likely to relate to general cargo). With that increase in traffic, there has been an increase in demand for related services (port services, transport, etc.). One wholesaler has observed that her revenues surge monthly and correspond with periods when DP World staff is paid. Berbera Customs recognized the role of key importers in changing economic activity around the port (there is felt to be about 10 such businesses, headquartered out of Hargeisa, such as Omaar Company but also WFP). He observed how their volume of imports leads to large scale employment to offload ships and that employment is in turn invested in local shops, local restaurants as well as to meet other family obligations. Ships and ship staff themselves bring important levels revenue, as was observed by the Fishmongers. Restaurants and kiosks say the source of their revenue are port workers and truck drivers.



25. The Municipal government, Dahabshil Bank and DahabMicro shared these views. The Deputy Mayor considers the port as the driver of the local economy, making important contributions to the nation. Import and export related businesses are seen to drive taxes, investment, business revenue, employment and incomes. Similarly, Dahabashil and Dahabmicro both attribute changes they see in their businesses to the port as well as port related services and businesses. Dahabshil traces their increases in revenue and clientele with the arrival of DP World.

*In Somaliland, the port is a cornerstone of the economy and by 2035 is expected to facilitate trade equivalent to nearly 27 per cent of GDP and 75 per cent of total trade, supporting indirectly 53,000 jobs in Somaliland.<sup>3</sup>*

26. Customs at the port reported 26 percent increase in revenue in 2021, despite reductions in customs rates to mitigate the impacts of COVID-19. In 2021, customs revenue at the port was reported as approximately USD 850,000. The ten top traders such as Omaar Company, constitute the majority of customs revenue (WFP imports are not taxed). They now take advantage of the new automated system where the complete forms online and make their customs payments through mobile money.
27. **Role of WFP:** If lorries and port workers are driving small and micro business around the port, we can assume that WFP contributes to this economic activity. Transporters of WFP goods and young men unloading WFP ships likely contribute. Their level of contribution may reflect their proportion of overall port activity.
28. **Significance and sustainability:** Reports from restaurants and kiosks, suggests the annual economic activity per for small and micro businesses around the port to be in the neighbourhood of USD 2M (or profit USD 10,000 and 2,000 respectively). Their income may have increased 50 to 100 percent over the last 2 to 4 years. In terms of significance, while this benefit accrues to the approximately 40 to 50 micro and small businesses around the port, their revenue, of possibly USD 2M is indeed significant, and in terms of this evaluation, perhaps more so as it is reinvested locally. It may match and exceed the amount of customs realized by the port.
29. In terms of sustainability, port activities are expected to increase in coming years. As well, there are plans for a warehouse zone and a duty-free trade zone, which transform the commercial landscape in Berbera and certainly around the port.

**Table 1 2021 Movements at Berbera Port**

	Container MT	General Cargo MT	TOTAL MT
Berbera Port <sup>4</sup>	3,375,000	1,200,000	4,575,000
WFP Berbera <sup>5</sup>	48,318	212,731	261,049
<b>WFP as percentage of total</b>	<b>1%</b>	<b>18%</b>	<b>6%</b>

*Outcome 2: Somaliland Transporters – revenue, profit or income*

30. Despite the agreement between the Governments of Ethiopia, Somaliland and WFP in place, efforts to have 50 percent of WFP goods using the Berbera corridor to be carried by Somaliland lorries may not be leading to improved incomes. Rather, anecdotally at least, lorry owners and drivers feel that WFP contracts are not profitable.
31. The volume of traffic at the port has been increasingly enormously since DP World assumed management responsibilities. They report increases of container traffic of 32 percent, bulk cargo of 63 percent and the number of container ships per annum has doubled in the four years since they took over. As much as 20 percent of Ethiopian imports, have relocated from Djibouti Port to Berbera port. Of these goods, they estimate that possibly 80 to 90 percent are destined for Ethiopia via the Berbera Corridor (the Ethiopian government is a 19 percent shareholder in the Berbera port). Port Customs estimates that 60 percent of WFP imported goods are destined for Ethiopia. The evaluation work conducted in Dollow, Somalia even found Somaliland businesses (Omar), transporting and supplying dry and packaged goods from Berbera Port to the Dollow,

<sup>3</sup> <https://www.cdcgroup.com/en/story/port-of-berbera/>

<sup>4</sup> 125,000 TEU at estimated weight of 27MT per container. Data provided by DP World.

<sup>5</sup> Data provided by WFP Berbera

Somalia (a 2,500km round trip for which duty must be paid on goods entering Ethiopia). Dollow retailers said it was cheaper to buy from Omar, rather than procuring out of nearby Mendera (Kenya), Baidoa or Mogadishu.

32. In addition to WFP 50 percent commitment, they also negotiated with the Ethiopian government that Somaliland registered lorries, carrying WFP goods, can travel to nearby Jijiga, Dire Dawa and Shinile as well as far as Nazret (outside of Addis). In spite of this commitment, Port Customs reports that approximately 80 percent of WFP goods are transported by Ethiopian lorries, as there are not enough Somaliland lorries.
33. Most Somaliland, lorries are reported to be owned by businesses importing goods, such as Omar. There are also independently owned lorries. Independent lorries are required by law to register with Tawfiq, a union of sorts, established by the Somaliland Government. As such, WFP must contract Tawfiq registered lorries. Tawfiq also has contracts with 12 Somaliland logistics companies and two Ethiopian companies to regularly transport goods to Ethiopia (Somaliland Region, primarily).
34. Despite intentions of WFP and the governments of Somaliland and Ethiopia, new contracting arrangements do not appear to be increasing income of lorry owners or drivers. Tawfiq and drivers interviewed rather said that outside of WFP contracts, business may be improving but for lorry owners and drivers who accept WFP contracts are either not making money and, in some cases, losing money (note: Losses however would be for a single trip, and may not impact the overall revenue, profit or income situation over the course of a year).
35. Truckers as well as Tawfiq reported issues with the rates paid by WFP, delays at the border (Wacale) and delays at final destinations. They reported that rates being paid by WFP are lower than in the past.

*"In 1998 fuel was USD 33 per barrel and we were paid USD 45/MT to Jigjiga. In 2022 fuel is USD 165-180 per barrel and we get USD 35/MT to Jigjiga" (Trucker interviewed outside Jigjiga) <sup>6</sup>*

36. It may be argued that improvements to the roads and administrative efficiencies, may have decreased transporter costs. The evaluation was not in a position to assess claims on reduced rates. The more substantive issue for drivers and Tawfiq were delays. They said lorries can wait days at Wacale to clear customs or weeks at WFP warehouses, waiting to discharge.

#### **Box 2 Stakeholders that have been affected by transport contracts around Berbera Port**

- Not only have the primary services – restaurants and kiosks – benefitted, but improvements are reported by the Lorry owners (primarily men 30 to 50+ years old).
- Lorry Drivers (men, 20 to 50 years of age – with the average between 30 and 40).
- Families of Owners or Drivers.

37. **Timeframe:** There is no clear timeframe in which this change in perception of WFP has occurred.
38. Generally, there appears to be an increase in demand for transporters in response to increasing activity in the Berbera Port - attributed (by lorry drivers, restaurant owners, Tawfiq, Customs and Dahabshil) to DP World. WFP Ethiopia estimates<sup>7</sup> that *another 10,000 trucks are needed to effectively meet annual supply chain demands. Currently the Government has ordered only about 2,000.*
39. **Role of WFP:** It appears that WFP contracting arrangements may partially explain why new commitments to Somaliland lorries is not translating into additional income. It does not explain delays at Wacale or WFP destination warehouses. It may be useful to speak to other drivers drawn from 7,000 lorries contracted by WFP in 2021.
40. The WFP office in Berbera said it was aware of delays. They said delays can be a function of congestion if a large number of lorries arrive at the same time, or if stores are too full to receive the goods, or possibly other administrative factors. When these issues come to the attention of WFP Berbera, they speak with their colleagues in Ethiopia. They also added that there are moments when a large number of lorries converge on the port to offload ships which equally leads to congestion and delays as well.

<sup>6</sup> Key Informant Interview at Tawfiq Offices.

<sup>7</sup> The estimate refers to the lorries required to serve imports from Djibouti and Berbera Ports.

41. **Significance and sustainability:** While disappointing, claims losses due to low prices and delays, they may not be significant. Individual losses are not reported to be catastrophic (i.e., no reports of bankruptcy or destitution). Moreover, given the scale of demand for transportation out of Berbera and Djibouti ports, Somaliland lorries may see business and income growth in the long run.
42. This lost opportunity could be redressed. There are opportunities for Tawfiq, lorry owners and WFP to review pricing and contracting arrangements and delays at the border and WFP warehouses.

*Outcome 3: Employment: The Unanticipated Outcome*

43. No definitive evidence was found of income improvements for casual labourers with knock-on effects to the local economy. However, interviews with Municipal Government, Dahabshil Commercial Bank, Dahabshil Microfinance bank, Berbera Customs, forwarding agents, food wholesalers and even restaurant owners, all referred to increasing activity at the port that has led to increases in employment and commensurate increases in local economic activity. Casual employment opportunities move in tandem with port activity, so increases in employment opportunities may be 30 - 60 percent in the last four years. Currently, DP World employs 1,300 staff. They also report a pool of about 2,500 casual labourers, of which 1,300 are employed daily. It was not possible to estimate their changes in income. Interviewees believe casual labourers earn approximately USD 20 per day<sup>8</sup>. DP staff, it is believed, would earn significantly more over the course of the year. Changes in income levels are reflected in changes in Dahabshil Micro's loans, which have increased from USD 5,000 to 7,000 for DP staff and from USD 500 to 4,000 for micro-businesses.
44. The evaluation team observed that during visits, port labourers were almost entirely men between 25 and 45 years. Assumptions from interviewees was that the majority of their earnings were spent on families - nuclear and extended - for housing, food, education, health and entertainment (i.e., restaurants near the port).
45. Increases in port employment are a function of port activities, perhaps bulk cargo, more so than container traffic which have grown 62 and 34 percent respectively since 2017/18. Currently, a very approximate estimate suggests annual expenditure on port labour might be USD 10 – 15 million. 2017 marked the beginning of a tripartite agreement by DP World, and the Governments of Somaliland and Ethiopia to improve and manage the port.
46. **Role of WFP:** WFP Berbera contracts port service agencies to unload their ships. These agents in turn contract casual labour to unload bulk cargo from ships into waiting lorries on the pier at the port. In 2021, they received 1,937 containers (1,788 TEU), 14 ships (8 bulk, two break bulk, and four WFP time charter), 312,000MT of food of which 246,000MT was moved by road. WFP Berbera reported that it spent approximately USD 4 million in 2021 on port services (stevedoring). WFP Berbera's Port Logistician commented that unloading WFP ships is labour intensive. If labour were to comprise 70 percent of the stevedoring expenses implies a contribution of approximately USD 2.8 million to wages in 2021. It may be that WFP alone accounts for perhaps 20 percent of the engagement of casual labour (based on DP World provided number of casual labourers working at the port). Somaliland customs ranked WFP as one of the main single customers of the port, responsible for perhaps five to seven percent of the volume of cargo passing through the port.
47. **Significance and sustainability:** The overall change in employment, income and local economic activity is significant. WFP in turn makes a considerable financial contribution to that change every year. Moreover, Dahabshil (and particularly the microfinance unit) and the Deputy Mayor believe that employment income is largely (if not exclusively) invested towards long-term objectives that better conditions for the family such as education, health, family support and small business development. Dahabshil Microfinance reports that many port workers – formal and casual – are clients, who save and make productive loans (principally) but also consumption loans. They also demonstrate very high levels of repayment. WFP is making a significant investment into and reinforcing this system. Interestingly, WFP is not at the centre of this change, the system and the process of change would withstand the withdrawal of WFP.

---

<sup>8</sup> The casual labourers earn USD 20 per day as they unload/load each sack of food for 1,000 Somali Shilling (USD 0.1) and they usually unload about 3 trucks per day so it is around 20 bucks per day. DP world labourer's salaries depend on the number of ships that come per month. So, it is not fixed, sometimes they get paid with USD 1,000. And other times less than USD 500 in total. Saed Ahmed, Mokoro Field Assistant.

## Key Areas of Change: Dollow

48. The findings from the Dollow case study are presented in this section. One outcome was identified for the Dollow operations as follows:

### *Outcome 1: Retail Growth, Profitability and Evolution*

49. The outcome is discussed below highlighting the nature and the process behind the change, the stakeholders that were affected, any unintended changes that were identified, and reflections on the likely sustainability of the change.

## Thematic area 2: Retail Food

### *Outcome 1: Retail Growth, Profitability and Evolution*

50. The evaluation team found that many of the intended or anticipated changes related to e-Shop had occurred. E-Shop is an initiative to have WFP scope card clients use a phone-based app to order food. Retailers, registered with e-Shop, deduct purchases from client's scope card. They are in turn reimbursed monthly by WFP (into the retailer's bank account). Retailers in the scheme report increases in revenue and profits. Retailers also made improvements to their retail facilities; offer a greater variety of products; have bank accounts with Amal Bank and are registered with local authorities and pay taxes. Wholesalers to these retailers also reported increased levels of business. Not all the hoped-for changes occurred. The two delivery agents who had been contracted by WFP reported good profits while under contract. Since the end of the contract, that revenue has disappeared, and the contractors have left the food delivery business. Drivers for the agents report there had been change in their incomes nor a change in demand for their services.
51. There are 14 retailers in Dollow who have been contracted by WFP to participate in the e-shop programme. Five shops are female owned and nine are male owned. Four of those shops were interviewed as well as one shop which does not take part in the e-Shop programme. E-Shop retailers have been working with WFP for three to six years. They have seen increases in profits of 7 to 40 percent. The non- e-Shop retailer said she has not seen a change in profits but rather has lost customers. E-Shop retailers have increased the size of their shops (now up to 10m<sup>2</sup>). One shop reported diversifying their product lines to include fruits and fruit juices. Another provided a detailed description of changes she has seen:

*"It (her shop) used to be very small and made of metal sheet and now it is made bricks and stones and big ones. I also increased the number of staff. I even have bank account ever since the WFP intervention. I even take loans and paid them back. I took the loan from Amal Bank and Nawaal. I borrowed a lot of money such as USD 10,000. Before WFP, there were no financial investments or loans." (e-Shop owner at Dollow)<sup>9</sup>*

52. All four shops said their profits are invested in their families and specifically to improve living conditions and education. Their children are in "good" private schools, some in university and one has sent her children to university in Kenya (where education is better). In contrast, the non-e Shop retailer says that she has not been able to expand her business and the revenue is only enough to cover school fees and the children's needs.
53. Retailers say that the app has reduced queues in the shops. Before, when WFP made disbursements, there could be queues of up to 50 people. The queues were chaotic, difficult to service and led to losses. Beyond queues, retailers had mixed views about the app. They reported that it "promoted" their shop and its products, but it also advertised their prices, did not allow for negotiation nor permit them to have a personal relationship with their clients. Retailers interviewed don't or can't "use" the app. Rather they hire young people as their *agents*. Their agents take biometrics of WFP clients and transfer the client's funds to the shop. Shop owners pay USD 1 per transaction for this service.
54. Three **wholesalers** were interviewed. All reported gains in revenue and profits due to their clients' contracts with WFP<sup>10</sup>. Of the three wholesalers interviewed, one provides fresh foods, another provides dry goods and the third provides the vehicles used by the two companies who got delivery contracts.

---

<sup>9</sup> Key Informant Interview in Dollow with female retailer

<sup>10</sup> One e-Shop retailer reported 'My wholesalers ...benefit a lot too ...I order USD 7,000 to USD 13,000 monthly...'

- The fresh foods supplier reported a 50 percent increase in business. His main clients are WFP retailers, and schools in WFP feeding programmes. With his proceeds he has purchased a second farm, a small, men's clothing store and a currency exchange business.
  - The dry good wholesaler reports that he receives orders for USD 30,000 each time WFP distributes money but sales were decreasing over the last year. His main shop is in Dolo Ado, Ethiopia, which is twice the size of the Dollow operation. They opened the Dollow branch as "*business there was so good*". They import their goods from Berbera, not Mogadishu as it is cheaper.
  - The supplier of vehicles is the main mechanic and supplier of spare parts in Dollow. He hires out his vehicles to Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO), operates them as taxis in town, or uses them as mini buses to Baidoa or Mogadishu. He also provided vehicles and drivers for the two companies that had the e-Shop delivery contracts. He has not benefited directly from WFP contracts since they stopped the delivery agent business, but he says he benefits considerably from the humanitarian business in Dollow.
55. Retail shops and wholesalers (dry & packaged goods) all purchase from Berbera. Goods are ordered through family members and payment is made through Dahabshil or hawalas. Goods are transported on the Berbera Corridor, charged duty at Wacale, and pass through to Gode, Dolo and finally Dollow. They say that purchasing from Berbera is less expensive than from Mogadishu and or duty at Wacale is less than the taxes paid along the Mogadishu-Baidoa-Dollow road.
56. WFP has issued two contracts for **delivery agents** since the start of COVID-19. The second of the two contracts ended seven months ago. No contract has been issued since. Delivery agents reported good revenue and profits, whilst they were contracted by WFP. The two firms who received the contracts were based elsewhere in Somalia. One firm, Somar (Somali Online Market) is an online shopping firm (for higher end consumer goods, phones, watches, phone covers etc. and they deliver Hargeisa, Galkayao, Garowe, Bosaso) which had developed their own online ordering and delivery arrangements, prior to bidding for the WFP contract in Dollow. The second Wagera is a large business based in SouthWest, Baidoa. They have multiple businesses, but the core business is contracting (construction) and sales of high value construction materials. Both hired vehicles and drivers from the same supplier in Dollow. Since their contracts ended, neither has continued home delivery services nor used the e-Shop app. Since WFP stopped contracting delivery agents, retailers report having paid for home deliveries (approximately USD 1) for WFP clients, whom they felt were needy.
57. **Drivers**, directly hired to do e-Shop deliveries by the delivery agents, said there has been no change in their levels of income either with WFP or without it. They say that they exist from one day to the next.
58. **Schools** which are part of the WFP school lunch programme are required to use the e-Shop application. As they are the majority of the 20 percent of Dollow beneficiaries with smart phones and the ability to use the app, they are satisfied with it. They order monthly but are supplied daily/weekly (avoiding issues of spoilage, storage and theft).
59. **Financial services** have observed improvements for WFP contracted retailers, and Dollow more generally. Amal, the bank where retailers are required have accounts, reported that their business has improved. They said that before WFP, they were unknown in Dollow. They have now increased their Dollow branch staff from one to three people. Their savings business has increased by 70 percent in four years. Their main clients are WFP food retailers. They also provide loans to 30 women of USD 500. Dahabshil, said that they do not directly benefit from WFP. However, due to the cash programmes and the UN/NGO presence in Dollow, they have seen their business grow. Profits are up 24 percent. The branch has gone from one to three staff. They went from 100 to 300 accounts. Services demanded by their clients include payments to wholesalers in Berbera or Mogadishu, E-dahab accounts, SoMTel SIM card sales and currency exchange. They also note that WFP retailers, after receiving payments from Amal, come to Dahabshil to save, send or exchange (USD to Ethiopian Birr). Deposits to their accounts has generally increased from USD 5,000 to USD 20,000.

### Box 3 Stakeholders that have been affected by e-shop and delivery initiatives around Dollow

Those benefitting from the e-Shop & delivery initiatives include:

- 14 retailers in the e-Shop programme (5F / 9M, all middle aged) and their families
- Wholesalers of fresh food and dry/packages goods

- Headmasters of schools with WFP supported school feeding programmes.

Beneficiaries interviewed appreciated that because of the e-Shop app, they no longer wait in queues, but they did not know how to use the app and prefer shopping in person.

60. **Timeframe:** Most interviewees indicate working with WFP for three to four years and some for as long as six.
61. **Role of WFP:** In almost all interviews, WFP is credited with the changes observed. Moreover, and very simply, benefits accrue to those with direct and indirect contracting arrangements with WFP.
62. Beyond the e-Shop, the presence of international agencies and their activities impacts on the local economy. Opportunities in Dollow attract businesses and individuals. Many businesses and individuals came to Dollow to take advantage of the economic boom, (including WFP retailers, wholesalers, delivery agents and drivers). Cost of food and rental accommodation in Dollow is much higher than in Mogadishu or Hargeisa. Many businesses are owned by Reeinwayn although Dollow is historically a Marehan location. Building contractors from other parts of Somalia have begun coming to Dollow to meet growing demand for construction. There are regular buses/taxis to and from Baidoa and Mogadishu (USD 50 one way). The municipal authorities commented on the high demand for cheap skilled labour which has attracted a lot of Ethiopians. One of the most striking anecdotes, reflecting the economic boom in Dollow, is that highland Ethiopian women come to work as maids in Dollow. They earn on average USD 100 per month which is twice as much as they earn in Hargeisa. It was reported that the economic driver in Dollow is the significant inflow of humanitarian funds.
63. **Significance and sustainability:** The level of change seen in e-Shops is financially significant. The e-Shop retailers send their children to good schools and even university in Kenya. A rough estimate may put their income at USD 20,000 per annum. The 14 e-Shop retailers annually order goods worth USD 1.5 – 2M. These orders are in turn the revenue for a smaller number of wholesalers.
64. While there is significant financial change, there does not appear to be significant change in how business is done. E-shop is a requirement of WFP contracts with food retailers and has not been mainstreamed into the e-Shop retailers' businesses. It has not been adopted by other retailers (nor could it be). Formalization of the retailers, including bank accounts and registration with government, is a positive change, but alone, not transformative.
65. The scale changes observed is limited to the 14 e-Shop retailers and their main wholesalers. It has not modified the food system, rather requirements to use Scope cards at specific food retailers together with the sheer volume of funds they disburse have effectively created parallel food system. The existing food system continues to serve Dollow's non-WFP beneficiaries.
66. In terms of sustainability, all interviewees felt that the e-Shop initiative is entirely dependent on WFP. If WFP were to withdraw, the e-Shop app would be redundant. Beyond the app and e-Shops, interviewees felt that if WFP stopped its cash-disbursements (CBTs) and left Dollow, WFP retailers said they would lose 50 to 80 percent of their business overnight and would be unable to recover. Wholesalers said they would lose 70 to 90 percent of their business. Amal Bank estimates that 80 percent of the local economy is directly or indirectly dependent on WFP CBT. Dahabshil, would expect to lose 40 percent of its business. Similar local economies in Dadaab and Kakuma have been financed by the international humanitarians for over 30 years. In contrast, Lokichoggio, Kenya, once vibrant and growing and entirely dependent on Operation Lifeline Sudan, all but disappeared overnight.

## Assessment of Processes within WFP

### *Knowledge sharing and collaboration*

67. Knowledge sharing, and collaboration varies depending on the category of work. For example, the e-Shop is a WFP led and designed intervention. Within that design, supply chain has been assigned clear tasks. Within those tasks, supply chain invokes their internal norms (i.e., requirements for contractors to have bank account and register with authorities), which in this case were complementary to the programmatic aims. It may not be a true collaboration as intended by the research question, but nonetheless demonstrates teamwork.
68. The COVID-19 pandemic, however, led to modifications to the e-Shop which demonstrate more strongly notions of collaboration. Programme and supply chain both recognized normally that the large queues formed

in shops on days when money was disbursed, presented a risk of COVID-19 transmission. So, together they agreed that e-Shop should be made mandatory to avoid queues. Also, they recognized that a service provider must be contracted to assist beneficiaries to use the app and that it would be necessary to engage a delivery service. To a limited degree, there is communication around these issues and learning is taking place (for example, procurement is looking for a better solution for delivery).

69. The work examined in Berbera illustrates a second form of collaboration. Activities were entirely situated in the domain of supply chain. Despite not having links to program, they generated important outcomes that affected systems and food systems and benefitted poor people. There is no learning or sharing information on these issues perhaps as they are outside of or on the periphery of WFP Somalia's core programming. As such, the team did not find documentation or data about these collaborations. Rather, this RBN commissioned evaluation may have been the first time these issues have been raised. Despite limited formal recognition of these points of teamwork or issues, a strong, constructive relationship was observed between supply chain and programme staff. There is an appreciation of each other's work, skills and knowledge and a sincere interest to collaborate.

### *Data collection and analysis*

70. Data which is available and used appears to be either operational/financial or addressing programme priorities. Performance of private sector partners, changes to food systems and how those systems relate to different cohorts of the population, are not captured. These are questions which are only now being asked by the RBN.
71. If the questions posed by this evaluation will form part of a new normal for WFP, new information and means of collecting this information will be necessary. Examples might include:
- Looking at the business metrics to assess the performance and growth of contracted retailers (reflecting the "outcome" of any WFP support or contracting arrangements).
  - Looking at the place of (i.e., market share) or influence (changes in norms) that WFP contracted retailers have in a market system (i.e., not a specific market or even location, but the wider interconnected system).
  - Periodically, looking at how changes in market performance helps or hinders specific cohorts of a population (i.e., poor people, or WFP prioritised populations).
  - Assessing consequences of WFP contracting arrangements i.e., expenditures on port services in Berbera or expenditures of WFP contracted lorries on routes. Equally, such investments could be considered within larger issues, such as the influence on the Berbera port and wider economic changes (the team noted that Berbera port now plays an important role in the food system that serves Dollow for example).
72. The skills and expertise to collect that information is already available in Supply Chain, Finance and Programme (see the evaluation recommendations within the main evaluation report).

## 5. Discussion and Conclusions

73. The table below provides an overview of the 12 Evaluation Questions (EQ) and the evaluation team's assessment against each.

**Table 2 Assessment against evaluation questions**

EQ	Summary and conclusion
1. To what extent are supply chain interventions informed by programmatic nutrition priorities, market assessments, climate change risks and gender analyses?	There is not strong evidence to indicate that within the four issues examined, the role of supply chain is informed by nutrition priorities, market assessments, climate change risks and gender analyses. Those issues in part may be evident in the e-Shop work but do not shape the role assigned to Supply Chain.
2. To what extent are supply chain interventions relevant and appropriate to local food systems across the different country contexts?	<p>The Category 2 activities evaluated such as contracting Port Services, describe supply chain (procurement) actions as highly relevant. Their contracts led to substantive investments in the local food system and economy by those employed by port service agencies.</p> <p>The Category 1 activities, such as the e-Shops or delivery service, provided a role for the supply chain that was very relevant to the food system. That food system however is the construct of programme and exists to serve goals laid out by programme. The role of supply chain was not relevant outside of that food system.</p>
3. What are the most significant outcomes of supply chain activities?	<p><b>Employment of casual labour at Berbera Port:</b> By contracting Port Services at Berbera port, a significant number of casual labourers were employed by WFP. The income of these casual labourers is reported to have been reinvested locally – in restaurants, food shops as well education or health for the family. The impact of employment of casual labourers at the port on the local economy was recognized in most interviews: businesses as well as municipal authorities. Their expenditures are likely to have been made with smaller and informal actors within the food system. Dahabshil commented that they have seen improvements in the situation of individuals as well as small businesses.</p> <p><b>Adaptations to the e-Shop</b> initiative driven by supply chain that required WFP clients to exclusively use the e-Shop app and their contacting of delivery services had mixed consequences in terms of inclusiveness or advancing an enabling environment. They were modifications that affected how food was accessed within the WFP food system, but without impacting the wider food system in Dollow.</p> <p>The evaluation was not able to measure outcomes against reduced food losses and improved competitiveness and resilience, and so can only make suggestions based on the evidence which was found.</p> <p>If incomes of casual labourers at the port is indeed expended on local businesses and those local businesses in turn grow and evolve, it could be argued that competitiveness within the food system, and particularly the segment affecting poor people, has also improved. Inasmuch as those changes are sustained and</p>



EQ	Summary and conclusion
	<p>progressive, it could be argued that they contribute to the “resiliency”<sup>11</sup> of those businesses.</p> <p>The e-Shop app (if not the procurement actions themselves) may have led to reduced losses. Retailers said they carried little of their advertised stock, but rather ordered it upon demand. Equally, schools in the feeding programme received fresh food on a daily/weekly basis. E-Shop created competitiveness amongst the 14 wholesalers, by posting their goods and prices. As the gains associated with e-Shop are bound in WFP payments, these may not be sustained changes, which brings into question how “resilient” these shops may be in the long run.</p> <p>Improvements to operations at Berbera port introduced by DP World, have dramatically modified the volume and type of traffic passing through the port. One reflection of those improvements is that Dollow depends on food imported from Berbera rather than Mogadishu. It is cheaper. Supply chain purchases and use of port facilities could be argued to contribute to that wider systemic change.</p> <p>E-shop has clearly added to efficiencies within its food system. There is close collaboration between retailers and wholesalers. Ordering, supply, and payment are closely coordinated to maximize benefit for all, with WFP clients benefitting from fresh, diverse foods and fair prices.</p> <p>Questions on the role of internal versus external factors responsible for changes provides for interesting reflection. Outcomes related to the contracting of port services are entirely dependent on external factors. Supply chain never intended to influence or shape the performance of the food system. It nonetheless may be able to argue that its input led to a wider and significant change.</p> <p>The design approach of e-Shop describes a system which has been designed to perform and serve clients as per the intentions of the programme. The system is insulated from external forces in that WFP infuses the money upon which all elements of the system depend. It, however, could not be insulated from COVID-19. Supply chain and programme responded by requiring that e-Shop would be obligatory, a “Shasha” agent was hired as was a delivery service.</p>
<p>4. To what extent do outcomes demonstrate inclusion and representation of women, youth, and vulnerable actors across the supply chain?</p>	<p>Generally, we may consider all of the Supply Chain actions to be neutral with regards to women, youth and vulnerable actors. The activities themselves work within existing social norms. Outcomes which were evidenced, did not accrue benefit to youth, nor vulnerable (nor marginalized ethnic) groups. Direct benefits predominantly accrued to men – except for retailers, where women represent slightly less than half of the shop owners and restaurant owners. Generally, direct benefits were seen to accrue to poor people.</p>
<p>5. What routine data or other evidence may help strengthen and inform supply chain activities moving forward towards greater effectiveness, impact, inclusion, and sustainability?</p>	<p>If WFP seeks synergies that impact food systems or at least complementarity from programme and supply chain units, the RBN’s EQs, will become increasingly relevant. However, existing information captured by WFP does not adequately answer those questions. New information and means of collecting this information will be necessary. Examples might include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Using business metrics to assess the performance or growth of contracted retailers (reflecting the “outcome” of any WFP support or contracting arrangements).</li> </ul>

<sup>11</sup> The term “resilience” in this context is a rhetorical device denoting a broad concept which often means different things to different people. Without clear, measurable attributes of a “resilient” system we cannot more claim a change in resilience than another person could claim the opposite.

EQ	Summary and conclusion
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Metrics measuring changes in market systems. These might be market share of WFP contracted retailers have in a market system or evidence that their changing business norms, catalysed changes in other actors in that market.</li> </ul> <p>Periodically, looking at how changes in markets as a result of WFP Supply Chain actions help or hinder specific cohorts of a population (i.e., poor people, or WFP prioritized populations).</p>
<p>6. To what extent is there collaboration between supply chain, engineering, and programme units?</p>	<p>Good-will rather than collaboration might be descriptive of relations between units. They seemed to operate in silos. While perhaps that may generally be the case, the example of e-Shop modifications to COVID-19, illustrate how good will can translated into meaningful collaboration.</p> <p>The following typology might describe collaboration across supply chain and programme units as observed in the evaluated issues/outcomes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Service Provision: Work designed by programmes, and within the design a specific task is assigned to supply chain</li> <li>Silos: Work where supply chain operates independent of programme, in tasks which are not perceived to be “programmatic” and of which, programme is not cognizant.</li> </ul> <p>The service provision form of collaboration is illustrated in the e-Shop initiative. Within the current e-Shop design, supply chain is assigned clear tasks such as contracting e-Shop retailers for example. If not intentional in the design, Supply Chain imposes contracting norms on retailers bidding for contracts (i.e., having a bank account and registration with local authorities) which are seen as complementary to WFP Somalia’s wider programmatic aims including their commitment to Somalia’s National Development Plan.</p> <p>The service provision relationship evolved through an unintentional co-creative process. To avoid large queues in shops on days when money was disbursed (which presented a risk of COVID transmission) it was agreed that the e-shop would be made mandatory; a service provider would be contracted to assist beneficiaries to use the app and another service provider would be contracted to provide delivery services.</p> <p>The work examined in Berbera illustrates a silo arrangement. WFP Berbera has no substantive relationships with programmes. Rather, the work seen in Berbera was entirely in the domain of supply chain or logistics. Interestingly, it generated important outcomes affecting food systems and benefitted poor people.</p>
<p>7. Are supply chain capacities and capabilities effectively leveraged to achieve desired outcomes and contribute to wider systems level change? What, if any, efficiency gains have been realized through WFP supply chain interventions? How or why?</p>	<p>Based on the very limited sample, the answer is both yes and no to this evaluation question.</p> <p>In the case of the Berbera Port, the answer might be, “yes”. Existing capacities and capabilities are effectively leveraging changes to the wider food system. Perhaps, if WFP continues its interest in food systems, it might look more closely at this example to investigate where existing supply chain approaches might add greater value in the future.</p> <p>In the case of the e-shops, the answer might be, “no”. Creating a parallel retail supply chains may be more efficient than providing food, but its gains do not appear to impact on the wider food system. The concept remains valid, but perhaps there might be more impact on the food system if i) other retailers could register and ii) in artificial economies like Dollow (i.e. camps or settlements of displaced persons who remain due to resources made available by humanitarian interests) programming could look more broadly at food systems. Aiming to</p>

EQ	Summary and conclusion
	influence the wider eco-system in which beneficiaries live, may provide business growth, diversity and robustness as well as integrating those populations with host populations.
<p>8. To what extent have supply chain activities and identified outcomes contributed to wider food system impacts (including intended and unintended effects on local economies, upon resilience and inclusiveness of food systems, and upon access and availability of affordable nutritious foods)?</p>	<p>WFP Contracted lorries are likely to have contributed to sales and profit of the small and micro businesses around Berbera port. This growth was linked to part of the increases noted by their wholesalers and may have contributed to growth of the wider, local economy (even if modestly). The contribution of WFP is likely to be commensurate with their proportion of Berbera Port lorry business.</p> <p>WFP contracts for Port Services are related to incomes of day labourers hired by Port Services agents. The level of employment was significant, as were the wage levels for the labourers. In turn, this is likely to have contributed to growth in the local economy as wages were spent both to improve immediate conditions and long-term prospects (education, health and support to extended family), with potentially transformative benefits.</p> <p>Contracting activities also led to significant gains by retailers and wholesalers in the e-Shop programme in Dollow. These gains are limited to the e-Shop food system without evidence suggesting impacts on the wider food system in Dollow.</p> <p>WFP contributed to existing local transport and lorry businesses, but the driver of growth appears to be related to improvements to the port in Berbera appear made by DP World together with investments by the Government of Somaliland and Ethiopia.</p> <p>In Dollow, humanitarian funds channelled through WFP and their scope card initiative appear to drive and sustain the e-Shop food system.</p>
<p>9. How do the outcomes of supply chain interventions vary with the scope and scale of the interventions?</p>	<p>We found that scope and scale, more than other factors, were critical to assess changes or outcomes. Table 3 summarizes the four issues examined by scope and scale.</p> <p>The e-Shop generated the greatest level of direct benefit per person, but for the fewest individuals. Contributions of WFP contracted lorries to business near the port generated the least revenue per person. Casual labour employed as a result of WFP port services contracts benefitted the greatest number of people, provided the second largest benefit per person and was the largest single interventions by Supply Chain.</p> <p>When putting these changes in context of wider systems, (including food systems), a different lens is provided by which to understand these changes or outcomes.</p> <p>At the port WFP is a contributor to wider systems. The situation is the inverse for the e-Shop activities in Dollow where WFP is effectively the system, which is does not affect the wider retail or food system. See Table 3 below.</p> <p>All of the issues contributed to competitiveness in the food system but there is no indication that they are responsible to reducing prices. While the e-Shop app was reported to be influential in pricing amongst e-Shop users, there is no indication that it affected prices in the non-e Shop controlled food system.</p>
<p>10. How have the dynamics between different stakeholders within food systems been affected by WFP supply chain activities? Any differential effects for</p>	<p>See EQ4.</p>

EQ	Summary and conclusion
women and youth supply chain actors?	
11. To what extent are results from supply chain interventions sustainable?	In terms of sustainability, the changes where WFP plays a contributory role, rather than a predominant one, are more likely to be sustained (i.e., benefits seen in Berbera at and around the port). The changes unlikely to withstand the withdrawal of WFP and its CBT programme are e-Shop revenue and income for the 14 retailers, and their wholesalers involved in the programme.
12. In what ways are WFP interventions strengthening capacity of key government institutions and supply chain actors as reported by stakeholders?	<p>WFP secured agreements with the governments of Somaliland and Ethiopia that 50 percent of their lorries will Somaliland registered and permission to travel as far as Nazaret. It was a strong reinforcement of these governmental collaborations. Also, through the contracting requirements, they ensure their wholesalers or contractors have formal bank accounts, are registered with local authorities and as such pay taxes. Municipal authorities in Dollow also recognized the contribution of the WFP School Feeding programme to help them ensure children attend school.</p> <p>Youth were not found to be direct beneficiaries of WFP supply chain interventions. Middle aged women, to a limited degree, benefited from WFP supply chain interventions.</p>

**Table 3 Scope & Scale of changes (outcomes) linked to WFP Supply Chain actions**

Issue	Scope (USD total)	Scale (people)	Scope Per Person (USD)
<b>Business Near Port</b>	20,370	55	370
<b>WFP Contracted lorries</b>	0	100	0
<b>Casual Labour at port</b>	1,207,500	780	1,548
<b>E-Shop</b>	252,000	14	18,000

**Table 4 Scale and Scope of changes related to WFP Supply Chain Activities**

Issue	Total Change (USD)	USD change attributed to WFP	Percentage contribution of WFP (percent)
<b>Business Near Port</b>	234,900	16,443	7
<b>WFP Contracted lorries</b>	0	0	100
<b>Casual Labour at port</b>	6,525,000	1,207,500	19
<b>E-Shop</b>	252,000	151,200	60

# Annex 1. Fieldwork overview

Table 5 List of people interviewed, Somalia

Name (sex)	Position
1. Ahmed Aadan Omer (M)	Truck Driver, Berbera
2. Saxan Abdi (F)	Shop, Doolow
3. Nur Abdi Jamma (M)	Deputy Mayor, Berbera
4. Abdirasaaq Cali Abdilahi (M)	Bank, Berbera
5. Kassim Abdisheikh (M)	Field officer, Doolow field office, WFP Somalia
6. Ali Abdulahi Abririzak (M)	Deputy Manager Dahabshil, Berbera
7. Deqa Hersi Abokor (F)	Service/Retail, Berbera
8. Saynab Ali Adan (F)	User Of Retail Services, Doolow
9. Hawo Bashir Adan (F)	User Of Retail Services, Doolow
10. Hassen Ali Adan (M)	Car, Doolow
11. Jama Mohamed Ahmed (M)	Service/Retail, Berbera
12. Adan Hashi Ahmed (M)	Supplier, Doolow
13. Abdikadir Ali (M)	Port Logistics, Berbera
14. Abdifatah Ibrahim Ali (M)	Shop, Doolow
15. Mohamed Omar Ali (M)	Driver, Doolow
16. Mubaarig Yasin Axmed (M)	Truck/Transport, Berbera
17. Madiina Axmed (F)	Hotel, Berbera
18. Yuusuf Maxamed Axmed (M)	Supplier, Doolow
19. Abdi Najax Cabdi (M)	Driver, Berbera
20. Xadiyo Barre Cilmi (F)	User Of Retail Services, Doolow
21. Otavio Costa (M)	Logistics Officer, WFP Somalia
22. Axmed Adan Cumar (M)	Driver, Berbera
23. Abdulkadir Dahir (M)	Logistics Officer, Doolow field office, WFP Somalia
24. Abdi Osman Dhakad (M)	User Of Retail Services, Doolow
25. Muhammed Ejaz (M)	Logistics Officer, Berbera field office, WFP Somalia
26. Maxamed Ali Faarah (M)	Shop, Berbera
27. Abdiqadir Fartaag (M)	Truck/Transport, Berbera
28. Ahmed Mahamed Habane (M)	Port, Berbera
29. Abdirahman Mohamed Hashi (M)	Shop, Doolow
30. Maryan Aadan Ibrahim (F)	User Of Retail Services, Doolow
31. Sahra Abdi Isaq (F)	User Of Retail Services, Doolow
32. Casha Abdi Ismacil (F)	Hotel, Berbera
33. Nuur Abdi Jamac (M)	Municipal, Berbera
34. Abdilahi Xusen Jamac (M)	Driver, Berbera
35. Magda Jurkowiecka (F)	Head of Supply Chain, WFP Somalia
36. Aboubakry Kane (M)	Head of Logistics Operations, WFP Somalia
37. Ann Kathrin Landherr (F)	Logistics Officer, WFP Somalia
38. Chama Mahmood (M)	Operator, Berbera
39. Deka Abdi Mohamed (F)	Shop, Doolow
40. Hawo Hassen Mohamed (F)	User Of Retail Services, Doolow
41. Abdirisak Cali Mohamed (M)	Shop, Doolow
42. Mawliid Mohamed Farah (M)	Truck Driver, Berbera
43. Ahmed Mohamed Habane (M)	Customs Manager, Berbera
44. Yussuf Mohamed Hassan (M)	Truck Driver, Berbera
45. Mohamed Abdullahi Mohamud (M)	Truck/Transport, Berbera
46. Maxmed Baashe Mubaarig (M)	Food, Berbera
47. Abdihakim Ali Muhumed (M)	Driver, Doolow
48. Musatafe lidle Qodax (M)	Service/Retail, Berbera

Name (sex)	Position
49. Francis Reyes (M)	Operations Manager, SP World
50. Axmed Abdilahi Saed (M)	Manual, Berbera
51. Marwa Nuur Saleban (F)	Shop, Berbera
52. Yusuf Macmed Xasan (M)	Driver, Berbera
53. Faarax Jaamac Xasan (M)	Driver, Berbera
54. Saleeban Yasin Ahmed (M)	Truck Driver, Berbera
55. Deqa Caydid Yusuf (M)	Shop, Berbera
56. Xamse Adan Yusuf (M)	Food, Berbera
57. Abdulkadir (M)	Director, Taufique East African Transportation Union (Berbera)
58. Abdusalaam (M)	HR/Communications, Taufique East African Transportation Union (Berbera)
59. Maulid (M)	Finance, Taufique East African Transportation Union (Berbera)
60. Mubarak (M)	Director, Taufique East African Transportation Union (Berbera)
61. Ciddin (M)	Municipal, Berbera
62. Mawliid (M)	Truck/Transport, Berbera
63. Abdirahman (M)	Truck/Transport, Berbera

**Table 6 Somalia fieldwork agenda**

Date	Activities	Stakeholders Interviewed	Evaluation Team Members Responsible <sup>12</sup>
<b>Somalia</b>			
Sunday 6 <sup>th</sup> February	International consultant travel to Hargeisa		SM
Monday 7 <sup>th</sup> February	Travel to Berbera, fieldwork	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Opening meeting with Head of Berbera Field Office</li> <li>Interviews with Businesses, or self-employed individuals around lorry parking areas</li> <li>Interviews with lorry owners</li> </ul>	SM; NM
Tuesday 8 <sup>th</sup> February	Berbera Fieldwork	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Interviews with port authority, bank, Berbera Municipality,</li> <li>Additional interviews with individuals/businesses around lorry parking area – also key wholesalers/wholesalers to those businesses</li> <li>Interviews with local clients of businesses</li> <li>Interviews with WFP Berbera staff</li> <li>Interviews with Hotel Owner</li> </ul>	SM; NM
Wednesday 9 <sup>th</sup> February	Berbera Fieldwork; Travel to Hargeisa	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Additional interviews with individuals/businesses around lorry parking area</li> <li>Interviews with local clients of businesses</li> </ul>	SM; NM

<sup>12</sup> Somalia team members: SM - Stephen McDowell (case study lead); Noura Mahmoud (Somalia consultant); Faysal Mataan (Somalia consultant)

Date	Activities	Stakeholders Interviewed	Evaluation Team Members Responsible <sup>12</sup>
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Closing meeting Berbera Field Office</li> </ul>	
Thursday 10 <sup>th</sup> February	International consultant travel to Nairobi; National consultant travel to Mogadishu		SM; NM
Friday 11 <sup>th</sup> February	National consultant in Mogadishu, wait for UNHAS flight to Dolo		NM
Saturday 12 <sup>th</sup> February	National consultants travel to Dolo; Dolo fieldwork	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Opening meetings with WFP Dolo Office</li> <li>Interviews: Shop owners, Delivery service providers,</li> <li>Evening: debrief, methodology review, upload recordings, prepare interview summary notes</li> </ul>	NM; FM; SM remote (evening debriefings)
Sunday 13 <sup>th</sup> February	Dolo Fieldwork	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Interviews Dolo Municipality, Banks, food wholesalers/wholesalers to shops</li> <li>Interviews with clients, delivery service providers, and transporters</li> <li>Interviews with Shop owners and delivery agents</li> </ul>	NM; FM; SM remote (evening debriefings)
Monday 14 <sup>th</sup> February	Dolo fieldwork	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Meetings with WFP Dolo</li> <li>Interviews with banks, food wholesalers/wholesalers to shops</li> <li>Interviews with clients, delivery service providers, and transporters</li> <li>Interviews with shop owners and Delivery agents</li> </ul>	NM; FM; SM remote (evening debriefings)
Tuesday 15 <sup>th</sup> February	Dolo fieldwork	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Interviews with banks and food wholesalers/wholesalers to shops</li> <li>Interviews with shop owners and Delivery agents</li> <li>Debrief with WFP Dolo Office</li> </ul>	NM; FM; SM remote (evening debriefings)
Wednesday 16 <sup>th</sup> February	Travel back to Mogadishu		NM; FM; SM remote (evening debriefings)

## Annex 2. Bibliography

Short reference	Full reference
Daniels and Anderson, 2018	Daniels and Anderson (2018). Evaluation of the 2018 Somalia Cash-based response. Commissioned by the Somalia inter-agency cash working group.
Global Hunger Index, 2021f	Global Hunger Index (2021) Somalia. Available at: <a href="https://www.globalhungerindex.org/somalia.html">https://www.globalhungerindex.org/somalia.html</a>
Government of Somalia, 2019	Government of Somalia (2019) Somalia, Ministry of Planning, Investment and Economic Development. 2019. Somalia National Development Plan 2020 to 2024.
IPC, 2022	IPC (2022) Somalia: Acute Food Insecurity Situation January 2022 and Projections for February - March 2022 and April - June 2022. Available at: <a href="https://www.ipcinfo.org/ipc-country-analysis/details-map/en/c/1155438/?iso3=SOM">https://www.ipcinfo.org/ipc-country-analysis/details-map/en/c/1155438/?iso3=SOM</a>
Maunder et al, 2018	Maunder et al (2018). Somalia: An evaluation of WFP's Portfolio (2012-2017). Evaluation Report: Volume I. September 2018.
UNHCR, 2022d	UNHCR (2022) CCCM Cluster Somalia. Available at: <a href="https://data2.unhcr.org/en/situations/cccm_somalia#:~:text=IDP%20Situations,-COVID%2D19&amp;text=Given%20the%20conflict%2C%20insecurity%2C%20drought,urban%20areas%20across%20the%20country.">https://data2.unhcr.org/en/situations/cccm_somalia#:~:text=IDP%20Situations,-COVID%2D19&amp;text=Given%20the%20conflict%2C%20insecurity%2C%20drought,urban%20areas%20across%20the%20country.</a>
UNOCHA, 2022b	UNOCHA (2022) Somalia Humanitarian Bulletin: February 2022
UN Somalia, 2020	UN Somalia (2020) Progress towards the 2030 Agenda in Somalia.
UN Women, 2022	UN Women (2022) Somalia. Available at: <a href="https://data.unwomen.org/country/somalia">https://data.unwomen.org/country/somalia</a>
WFP Somalia, 2018	WFP Somalia (2018). Somalia interim country strategic plan (2019–2021). Executive Board Second regular session Rome, 26–29 November 2018
WFP Somalia, 2020	WFP Somalia (2020). Somalia Annual Country Report 2019, Interim Country Strategic Plan 2019-2021.
WFP Somalia, 2021a	WFP Somalia (2021). Somalia Annual Country Report 2020, Interim Country Strategic Plan 2019-2021.
WFP Somalia, 2021b	WFP Somalia (2021). WFP Somalia Sustainable Food Systems
WFP Somalia, 2021c	WFP Somalia (2021) Somalia Country Strategic Plan (2022-2025)
World Bank, 2016b	World Bank (2016) Population ages 0-14 (percentage of total population) – Somalia. Available at: <a href="https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SP.POP.0014.TO.ZS?locations=SO">https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SP.POP.0014.TO.ZS?locations=SO</a>
World Bank, n.d.c	World Bank (n.d.) World Development Indicators



# Acronyms

CBT	Cash Based Transfer
CGAP	Country Gender Action Plan
CO	Country Office
EQ	Evaluation Question
iCSP	Interim CSP
MT	Metric Tonnes
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
RBN	Regional Bureau for the East and Central Africa region, Nairobi
TEU	Twenty-foot equivalent unit
TOR	Terms of Reference
USD	United States Dollar
WFP	World Food Programme