

Evaluation for evidence-based decision making | WFP Office of Evaluation

Evaluation Quality Assurance System (EQAS)

## Management Response from WFP Regional Bureau Johannesburg to the recommendations of the decentralized evaluation of WFP contribution to market development and food systems in southern Africa DE/ZARB/2020/052 from 2018 to 2021

- 1. This document, finalized in December 2022, presents the management response to the recommendations of the thematic evaluation WFP contribution to market development and food systems in southern Africa (2018-2021). The evaluation, which was commissioned by WFP Regional Bureau Johannesburg covers six countries namely Lesotho, Madagascar, Malawi, Mozambique, Tanzania and Zimbabwe.
- 2. The evaluation serves the dual purpose of accountability and learning with greater emphasis given to learning as this is a relatively new and under-evaluated area of WFP work. WFP is interested in how these lessons can be applied to enhance future programmes and how of the contribution of WFP to market development and food systems can be enhanced to contribute to zero hunger. The findings and recommendations from this evaluation will be used by the WFP Headquarters, Regional Bureau for Southern Africa (RBJ) and the country office supply chain and cash-based transfer (CBT) teams across the region to enhance design and implementation of market development and system strengthening activities. The findings may also be used by other market actors to enhance their engagement and partnerships with WFP and other stakeholders.
- 3. The evaluation made 10 key recommendations with 45 actions. The matrix sets out whether WFP agrees, partially agrees or disagrees with the recommendations and sub-recommendations. It presents the planned (or taken) actions, responsibilities and timelines.

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
Priority: High Recommendation 1: Building on the draft Theory of Change (ToC) developed as part of this evaluation, and through a consultative process, WFP Markets and Supply Chain divisions should develop a ToC for market development that can act as a guide to regional bureau (RBs) and country offices (COs) in conceptualising, designing, implementing, monitoring and evaluating market development activities (MDAs). (December 2023)	Regional Bureau (RB) [HQ <sup>1</sup> Research, Assessment and Monitoring, Supply Chain Divisions/Units, COs]	Partially Agreed ToC development by COs is not a corporate requirement. Hence it should not be mandatory for COs to develop ToCs for MDAs.	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable
<b>Sub-recommendation 1.1</b> The HQ Supply Chain division/RB should develop the market development activities (MDA) ToC that will guide COs.	Regional Bureau (RB) [HQ Research, Assessment and Monitoring, Supply Chain Divisions/Units, COs]	Agreed	<ol> <li>The MDAs Theory of change is being developed at HQ level based on the proposed one from RBJ.</li> </ol>	HQ Supply Chain (SC) Retail & Markets	October 2023

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> WFP Headquarters

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
The country office should customise the ToC depending on their country context. Further, COs should develop a proper	Regional Bureau (RB) [HQ Research, Assessment and Monitoring, Supply Chain Divisions/Units, COs]	Partially Agreed This recommendation has been partially agreed based on the sub recommendation 1.2 where it was noted that ToC development	<ol> <li>COs undergoing second generation Country Strategic Plans (2G CSP) development will customize their specific Theories of Change in line with the HQ developed Theory of change (Optional as per CO requirement).</li> </ol>	CO Activity Managers and M&E (RB SC Retail & Markets, Monitoring, Programme cycle, Monitoring)	December 2023
(on targeted people, retailers, and the marketplace).		by COs is not a corporate requirement and sub recommendation 1.3 noted that needs analysis as a standalone requires resources and time.	<ol> <li>CO M&amp;E and Supply Chain (SC) will support and sensitize CO activity managers to conduct baselines and key performance indicators (KPIs) for Market development activities being implemented under each activity.</li> </ol>	CO M&E (CO Activity Managers, CO Supply Chain)	December 2023
Sub-recommendation 1.3Regional Bureau (RB)Develop a lesson learning and knowledge management system on MDAs by creating MDA[HQ Research, Assessment and Monitoring, Supply	Agreed	4. HQ Supply Chain Retail & Markets Unit will create and maintain a repository for "case studies" from COs.	HQ SC Retail & Markets	December 2023	
lesson learning opportunities for all country offices, where COs could disseminate findings, share lessons learned and collaborate with partners in academia, private sector, and	country offices, where COs uld disseminate findings, are lessons learned and llaborate with partners in		<ol> <li>COs and the RB will identify good stories and best practices to be shared through fact sheets and disseminated on WFP platforms e.g., Yammer, Twitter &amp; WFPgo.</li> </ol>	RB SC Retail & Markets (CO Communications Unit & Supply Chain; RB Evidence Generation Unit & Communications Unit)	December 2023

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
other development organizations.					
<b>Sub-recommendation 1.4</b> Ensure MDAs are market-driven if they are to be sustainable, so retailers' priorities must be considered. As such, conduct needs assessments of retailers to determine how best to make MDAs relevant to their needs.	Regional Bureau (RB) [HQ Research, Assessment and Monitoring, Supply Chain Divisions/Units, COs]	Partially Agreed conducting needs analysis as a standalone requires resources and time but retailer needs will be captured during the sectoral assessments before programme implementation.	6. WFP will continue to use the Market System Analysis (MSA) tool to identify the inefficiencies in the market system (SC actors, enabling environment and support structure) and recommend potential market development activities addressing those inefficiencies (as per CO requirements) which will capture retailer needs during the analysis.	HQ SC Retail & Markets (RB SC Retail & Markets)	December 2023
Priority: High Recommendation 2: Consolidate the various guidance materials that are currently in place and produced by supply chain, markets, and smallholder agriculture market support and strengthen frameworks and tools for designing and implementing MDAs within a broader food systems approach (December 2023)	HQ - Markets and supply chain CBT division [HQ - smallholder agriculture market support division RB smallholder market support and Supply Chain]	Partially Agreed The reason for partially agreeing is that: Sub- recommendation 2.3 notes that the overall guidance should not be restricted to unrestricted cash modality but address all transfer modalities that WFP implements (cash, vouchers and capacity strengthening)	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
<b>Sub-recommendation 2.1</b> Develop clear leverage points for the demand-side work on linkages with retailers and other market actors within the SAMS+ framework.	[HQ - smallholder agriculture market support division RB smallholder market support and	<ol> <li>WFP will develop, review and update market development activities guidance appreciating the different transfer modalities and will incorporate other functional units including Smallholder Agriculture Market Support (SAMS).</li> </ol>	HQ SC Retail & Markets, (HQ SAMS)	December 2023	
	Supply Chain]		<ol> <li>The COs will be supported to develop entry points during CSP visioning and design where WFP work would play a critical role under the retail engagement and smallholders agriculture markets workstreams.</li> </ol>	CO Activity Managers (RB SC Retail & Markets, Programme Cycle, SAMS Team and Procurement)	December 2023
MDAs. The problem is that the tools are there, but people do not a) know they are there, b) have a structured approach to	Markets [HQ - smallholder agriculture market support division RB smallholder market support and	Agreed	9. WFP HQ SC Retail & Markets jointly with other functional units will enhance cross divisional collaboration that includes communication, awareness, training sessions and webinars to promote usage of available tools and methodologies.	HQ SC Retail & Markets (RB Programme - SAMS, Supply Chain Retail & Markets and VAM)	December 2023
			10. HQ SC Retail & Markets will work with other functional units	HQ SC Retail & Markets,	December 2023

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
Systems Analyses, and Market Systems Analysis reports could integrate MDAs and such recommendations could be used to inform programming decisions as well as resource mobilisation.			within Supply chain e.g., the Strategic Engagement and Programme SAMS units on better alignment and utilization of the different tools and methodologies that seek to enhance market functionality and economic development.	(RB Programme - SAMS, Supply Chain Retail & Markets)	
Sub-recommendation 2.3 Finalise the MDA guidance material and develop tools to be used in unrestricted cash scenarios and disseminate them to country offices.	RB SC retail & Markets [HQ - smallholder agriculture market support division RB smallholder market support and Supply Chain]	Partially Agreed The overall guidance should not be restricted to unrestricted cash modality but address all transfer modalities that WFP implements (cash, vouchers and capacity strengthening)	<ol> <li>HQ SC Retail &amp; Markets will create MDA guidelines on the use of unrestricted cash, taking into consideration the five outcomes<sup>2</sup> stated in the new Cash Policy (now being discussed at the corporate level) that encourages the use of unrestricted cash.</li> </ol>	HQ SC Retail & Markets, (RB SC Retail & Markets and Programme CBT)	December 2023
<b>Priority: High</b> <b>Recommendation 3:</b> Strengthen WFP market assessments and retailer performance monitoring (June 2024)	CO - Supply Chain [CO - VAM, Programme CO & RB Monitoring & Evaluation, RB	Partially Agreed This recommendation has been partially agreed based on sub- recommendation 3.4 which notes that more assessments add to	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The five outcomes are (i) promoting women economic empowerment, (ii) giving people flexibility and choice when they need it the most, (iii) accelerating digital financial inclusion, (iv) support governments to build inclusive government-to-person payments and, (v) managing the risk of economic volatility and contributing to recovery

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
	Gender and Protection Teams]	implementation costs for MDAs and should be incorporated into the monitoring and evaluation systems while sub- recommendation 3.2 is addressed by standardization of the Market functionality index package.			
Sub-recommendation 3.1 Strengthen the monitoring and evaluation of MDAs and enhance the measurement of retail engagement results, more assessments must be conducted on the progress of activities.	and managers [CO - VAM, t of Programme more CO & RB Monitoring ducted & Evaluation, RB	Recognizing that monitoring of the MDAs is critical, the need for more assessments do add to the implementation costs of	12. Country offices to use the existing corporate Retail & Markets KPIs (price, quality, assortment & service) in measuring retail work as part of process monitoring and where MDAs have been implemented.	Country Offices Activity Managers and CO M&E (RB Supply Chain Retail & Markets, Monitoring)	June 2024
Also strengthen recommendations, making sure there are targeted to specific WFP units for effective implementation.	Protection Teams]		<ol> <li>RB Monitoring will support COs to develop KPIs that are context based and specific to MDAs that do not have corporate KPIs.</li> </ol>	RB Monitoring and CO M&E	June 2024

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
Sub-recommendation 3.2: Strengthen market assessments by considering market dynamics and seasonality of supply and demand in the design of assessments as well as conducting periodic and continuous monitoring of price differentiation.	CO -Activity managers [CO - VAM, Programme CO & RB Monitoring & Evaluation, RB Gender and Protection Teams]	Partially agreed At corporate level, market assessment has been standardized through the market functionality index (MFI) <sup>3</sup> methodology which evaluates market functionality across nine dimensions namely: 1) Assortment of essential goods, 2) Availability, 3) Price, 4) Resilience of supply chains, 5) Competition, 6) Infrastructure, 7) Service, 8) Food quality, and 9) Access & Protection. The uptake of the MFI by COs has been positive and it is continuously and effectively being utilized.	14. To fully achieve the benefits of Market functionality index, RB will closely work with COs in rolling out the <u>Transfer</u> <u>Modality and Mechanism</u> <u>Selection</u> (TMMS) tool <sup>4</sup> to assess the feasibility of delivering unrestricted cash and provide a list of possible mitigation measures when the context is not ideal.	RB Supply Chain Retail &Markets & VAM (RB Cash Working Group)	June 2024

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See the technical guidance on Market functionality index (MFI): <u>https://docs.wfp.org/api/documents/WFP-0000138670/download/</u> <sup>4</sup> See the link to the <u>Transfer Modality and Mechanism Selection (TMMS)</u> tool that incorporates the Market Functionality Index work among the core decision drivers.

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
<b>Sub-recommendation 3.3:</b> Strengthen the market systems analysis to ensure it covers contextual issues beyond the targeted markets being assessed. This can be done by including other units [resilience, VAM, nutrition] in the design of the market systems analysis.	CO - Supply Chain [CO - VAM, Programme CO & RB Monitoring & Evaluation, RB Gender and Protection Teams]	Agreed	15. Where CO are implementing the market systems analysis (MSA) other functional units will be incorporated in the selection of markets, commodities, data collection and validation to ensure objectives are well captured and their technical expertise utilized.	RB & HQ Retail & Markets (CO Supply Chain, Resilience, VAM, Nutrition)	
<b>Sub-recommendation 3.4</b> Improve the preferred supplier network and update regularly.	CO - Supply Chain [CO - VAM, Programme CO & RB Monitoring & Evaluation, RB Gender and Protection Teams]	Not agreed The preferred supplier network as recommended is very context based and timebound and hence cannot be updated regularly.	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable
Sub-recommendation 3.5 Enhance collection and reporting of sex disaggregated data and access and protection issues in assessments.	CO – Supply Chain [CO - VAM, Programme CO & RB Monitoring & Evaluation, RB Gender and Protection Teams]	Agreed	16. COs will be supported in ensuring quantitative data derived from assessments is disaggregated by sex, age and disability to monitor and respond to the gaps and needs of men and women.	Country Offices Activity Managers (CO Gender Focal Point and M&E RB Gender and Monitoring)	December 2023
Priority: Medium	CO - Supply Chain	Partially agreed	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
Recommendation 4: Strengthen country retailer (and other supply chain actors) market engagement strategies to enhance the contribution of WFP to market development (June 2024)	[CO - CBT, Programme, Finance RB Supply Chain]	This has partially been agreed based on sub recommendation 4.3 and 4.4 as this is heavily dependent on funding availability and scale of MDAs being implemented.			
<b>Sub-recommendation 4.1</b> Strengthen linkages of small- scale retailers to wholesalers and food manufacturers to gain best value of goods in quality, service, and price.	CO - Supply Chain [CO - CBT, Programme, Finance RB Supply Chain, Programme food systems	Agreed	17. COs will strengthen the analysis of linkages through mapping of supply chains where WFP CBT is implemented through retailers. This will be done by ensuring cross functional coordination to facilitate quality market assessments, and formulation of strategies through initiatives such as buying groups.	Country Offices – Heads of Supply Chain (RB Supply Chain Retail)	December 2023
Sub-recommendation 4.2 Strengthen support to retail business, helping them to be competitive and sustainable – essentially foster competitiveness in the retail sector to bring costs down and pass on the gain to the targeted people.	CO - Supply Chain [CO - CBT, Programme, Finance	Agreed	18. Where WFP is implementing Cash based transfers, establish a baseline of the retailers status in order to design trainings and guidance on retailers' management to improve stock management, storage facilities, access, shop layout and selection of merchandise, waste	CO Supply Chain, M&E Focal Points (RB Supply Chain Retail & Markets)	December 2023

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
			management and any supply chain relevant areas of WFP's expertise.		
Sub-recommendation 4.3 Enhance fresh produce supply chain and nutritious food commodities by strengthening linkages of retailers to farmers.	CO - Nutrition [CO - CBT, Programme, Finance	Partially Agreed WFP role is limited to where it implements programmes related to CBT and smallholder farmer support.	19. Country offices will design programmes through an integrated approach to increase outcomes and impact through the food systems lens.	Country Offices – Activity Managers, (RB Supply Chain Retail & Markets, Nutrition and Programme)	December 2023
Sub-recommendation 4.4 Expand the coverage of MDAs to a larger proportion of retailers/market actors and consider country contextual situations	[CO - CBT, Programme, Finance, supply chain RB Supply Chain]	Partially Agreed This is heavily dependent on funding availability and programme objectives.	20. COs will include all non-WFP contracted actors (e.g., farmers, fresh food vendors, financial institutions, government departments, academia and other partners) in capacity strengthening activities to ensure expansion of MDA coverage and synergies.	Country offices – Activity Managers and CO Cash Working Groups (RB Supply Chain Retail & Markets)	June 2024
<b>Priority: High</b> <b>Recommendation 5:</b> Continue to strengthen the gender approach in supply chain, CBT and smallholder agriculture market interventions that are geared towards market development.	CO - Gender Focal points [CO - Programme, CBT, Supply Chain RB Gender, Smallholder Farmer Support and Supply Chain	Partially Agreed Based on sub recommendation 5.1, the recommended gender analysis and related assessments should be integrated as part of sectoral	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
(March 2024)	Relevant Government Ministries]	assessments at programme design and at baseline.			
Sub-recommendation 5.1 Carry out assessments of the participation of women in retail sector, supply chain with relevant institutions in addressing the capacity gaps to contribute market development in various contexts.	CO - Gender Focal points [CO - Programme, CBT, Supply Chain RB Gender, Smallholder Farmer Support and Supply Chain Relevant Government Ministries]	Agreed	<ul> <li>21. COs to ensure the integration of assessments of the participation of women in retail sector by:</li> <li>a) Applying gender lens to sectoral assessments that cover retail work.</li> <li>b) Identifying activities that would encourage participation of women within WFP programming including capacity strengthening activities (e.g., financial inclusion, access to finance and markets.</li> <li>c) Identifying bottlenecks that hinder smallholder farmers (women) in playing a critical role in market development.</li> </ul>	RBJ Country Offices – CO Gender Focal Points, CWG, SAMs (RB CWG, Programme-CBT, Supply Chain Retail & Markets, Gender & SAMS)	March 2024
Sub-recommendation 5.2 Strengthen linkages of women smallholder farmers and retailers/actors to markets by	CO - Gender Focal points	Partially Agreed Though the involvement of women is critical where WFP implements	<ul><li>22. WFP will act as an enabler in the following two areas:</li><li>a) Enhancing women's capacity to access WFP supported</li></ul>	Country Offices – Activity managers, SAMS and Gender	December 2023

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
improving their participation in WFP supported aggregation systems and with retailers contracted by WFP.	[CO - Programme, CBT, Supply Chain RB Gender, Smallholder Farmer Support and Supply Chain Relevant Government Ministries]	its activities, more emphasis should be on activities that are not WFP-led which are more sustainable including public procurement (e.g., schools, hospitals etc.) and commercial markets.	aggregation systems, public and commercial markets through capacity building e.g., acquiring business related documents to enhance access to finance and becoming WFP vendors. b) Addressing women challenges and barriers that may hinder access to productive resources and markets.	(RB Programme, SAMS, SC Retail & Markets and Gender)	
<b>Sub-recommendation 5.3</b> Taking a transformative approach, identify strategies to strengthen women engagement	points [CO - Programme, CBT, Supply Chain RB Gender, Smallholder Farmer Support and Supply Chain Relevant Government Ministries]	23. WFP will take affirmative action during retail contracting of WFP retailers to ensure that women retailers are contracted.	Country Offices – Activity managers, and Gender (RB Programme, SC Retail & Markets and Gender)	December 2023	
and participation in retail store businesses.		24. WFP will work with partners and stakeholders improve access to affordable cost of goods through linking with manufactures, distributors and wholesalers.	Country Offices – Activity managers, and Gender (RB Programme, SC Retail & Markets and Gender)	December 2023	
		<ul><li>25. WFP will facilitate:</li><li>a) mentorship programmes for women retailers,</li></ul>	Country Offices – Activity managers and Gender (RB Programme, SC Retail & Markets and Gender)	March 2024	

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
			<ul> <li>b) formation of village savings and loans associations (VSLA) and</li> <li>c) linkages with financial institutions that offer products targeting women retailers.</li> </ul>		
<b>Sub-recommendation 5.4:</b> The country offices working with NGO partners and the relevant government ministries should contribute to developing a gender action plan for small, medium, and micro-enterprises (SMMEs) and retailers on how the gender, disability and other social inclusion gaps can be addressed.	CO - Gender Focal points [CO - Programme, CBT, Supply Chain RB Gender, Smallholder Farmer Support and Supply Chain Relevant Government Ministries]	Agreed	26. WFP will work with partners to develop gender action plans to inform strategies and recommendations, response to gaps in participation, representation, social inclusion and economic empowerment for women and any excluded/under represented groups	CO Gender and Activity Managers (RB Gender and Programme)	March 2024
<b>Priority: High</b> <b>Recommendation 6:</b> Take a country office cross-functional approach to market development in targeted areas by encouraging collaboration of different units: Programme CBT, VAM, M&E, Gender, Nutrition,	CO - Head of Programme [CO - all units RB - Programme and Supply Chain Units]	Agreed	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
and Supply Chain to achieve programmatic outcomes. <b>(January 2024)</b>					
Sub-recommendation 6.1 Involve all units in the design of MDAs for every unit to add their perspectives to the approach. This lays the groundwork for a multisectoral approach to MDAs (recommendation 7) because different units will be more invested in the interventions	CO - Head of Programme [CO - all units RB - Programme and Supply Chain Units]	Agreed	<ul> <li>27. RB Programme and Supply Chain will support COs through the established two cross functional working groups (Food Systems and Cash working groups) at RB level to replicate similar models at CO level.</li> <li>28. RB Programme and Supply</li> </ul>	RB Supply Chain Retail Unit and Programme SAMS, Cash Working Group RB Programme Cycle Unit,	December 2023
because of their involvement from an earlier phase. Learning from Kenya, management should create a process/system from the start of market and retail engagement activities, that break the silos across what have traditionally been supply chain or programme roles.			Chain will support the embedding supply chain expertise and opportunities into CSP visioning and design. From the Kenyan retail engagement, supply chain expertise is embedded within programme activities. Therefore, ensuring MDAs are funded.	SAMS, Supply Chain Units	
<b>Priority: High</b> <b>Recommendation 7:</b> Strengthen multisectoral	CO - Supply Chain [CO - Programme, CWG focal point	<i>Partially Agreed</i> Based on WFP response to sub- recommendation 7.1,	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
partnerships in design and implementation of MDAs. (December 2023)	RB Supply Chain, Knowledge Management, Programme]	this is heavily dependent on Government's capacities, priorities and funding to take over WFP programmes. Currently WFP MDAs address WFP specific needs which may hinder scalability and how other partners may engage in the processes. For instance, Farm2Go platform links only WFP-supported farmers to markets and Government cannot it.			
Sub-recommendation 7.1 WFP should engage more actively with the government to ensure continuity of the activities once the organization's funding cycle ends, as well as	CO - Activity Managers [CO - Programme, CWG focal point RB Supply Chain, Knowledge	Partially Agreed This is heavily dependent on Government's capacities, priorities and funding to take	29. WFP will work with the Government to strengthen national systems to ensure programme continuity once funding is over for WFP programmes. The advocacy through actualizing SDG 17 is	Country Office Programme and Activity managers (CO Management and Heads of Units)	December 2023

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
discuss and seek guidance from other country offices and partners outside WFP on MDAs to increase their impact on stakeholders.	Management, Programme]	over WFP programmes. Currently WFP MDAs address WFP specific needs which may hinder scalability and how other partners may engage in the processes. For instance, Farm2Go platform links only WFP-supported farmers to markets and Government	<ul> <li>key to ensure programme sustainability.</li> <li>30. COs will identify and engage relevant partners on collaborative and integrated programme design to increase</li> </ul>	Country Office Programme and Activity managers (CO Management and Heads of	December 2023
			programme design to increase impact and scale.	Units)	
<b>Sub-recommendation 7.2:</b> WFP should explore, within each country context, how best to coordinate MDAs with other actors through existing coordination mechanisms (such as external CWGs) where such exists or establishing new mechanisms where no appropriate mechanism exists.		cannot it. Agreed	31. COs will identify key partners (such as UN agencies, local based organisations, private sector and academia) that work in the MDA space to foster partnerships. Such partnerships will explore areas of collaboration including smart agriculture, climate change resilience, farmers' access to technologies and formal markets.	Country Office Activity Managers (Country Offices Heads of Units and SAMS)	December 2023

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
Sub-recommendation 7.3: Design MDAs in a cross-cutting manner, with the local context and the long term in mind if they are to be sustainable without external assistance. Work together with local organizations when designing MDAs.		<i>Partially agreed</i> MDAs are highly dependent on funding and on geographical areas where WFP programmes are implemented	32. RB through the Food Systems working group will work with COs during CSP designs to identify opportunities and entry points would work with local organizations to design activities that are sustainable and scalable.	RB Programme Cycle Unit, SAMS and Supply Chain	December 2023
<i>Priority: High</i> <b>Recommendation 8:</b> Improve partnerships with retailers and other market actors	CO - Supply Chain [CO - Finance, Programme, CWG focal point]	Agreed	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable
(March 2024) Sub-recommendation 8.1 Recognise retailers/traders as partners and find ways to involve them in the design of CBTs and design of MDAs. The partnership should move	CO - Supply Chain Agreed [CO - Finance, Programme, CWG focal point]	33. WFP will engage retailers during modality selection where cash- based transfers are feasible. This is to be considered at the design stage of all programmes.	Country Offices – Cash Working Group/CBT Focal Point, Supply Chain and VAM (RB Cash Working Group)	December 2023	
beyond compliance to WFP contractual agreements. WFP should engage retailers and other stakeholders for ideas on how to strengthen retail			34. Country offices will conduct market assessments and risk identification to identify potential risks and gaps when implementing retail work.	Country Offices Supply Chain and VAM(RB Supply Chain and VAM)	December 2023

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
engagement in the CBT programme.			35. There is need for flexibility to consolidate with SC capacity assessments (such as logistics capacity assessments) to understand retail supply chains and actors. This capacity assessment can be applied during emergency response and can inform modality switch (in-kind/CBT).	Country Offices Supply Chain (RB Supply Chain)	December 2023
Sub-recommendation 8.2 Strengthen the communication with retailers recognising their limitations in terms of connectivity, access to roads and other infrastructure.	CO - Cash WG [CO - Finance, Programme, CWG focal point]	Agreed	36. WFP COs will identify best communication methods to reach retailers in deep field and organize periodic meetings to get feedback from retailers.	Country Offices – Heads of Supply Chain (CO Programme, CO CBT Focal Point, RB Supply Chain Retail & Markets,)	December 2023
<b>Sub-recommendation 8.3:</b> Continue to improve payment procedures by addressing delays. This means continuous synchronization of the SC of WFP, procurement, ICT, and finance systems which should be easy to maintain if the multisectoral approach to MDAs is exercised.	CO - Cash WG [CO - Finance, Programme, CWG focal point]	Partially agreed Currently WFP systems are siloed and have specific modules and functionalities that hinder synchronization.	37. RB and HQ will support COs in digitalization of beneficiary data to reduce paper-based vouchers that lead to cumbersome reconciliation and payment processes.	HQ CBT Division, RB Programme CBT and RB SC Retail & Markets	March 2024
Priority: High	CO - Management	Agreed	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
Recommendation 9: Advocate for multi-year funding for MDAs (December 2023)	[CO - Supply chain & Programme RB Supply Chain,				
	Knowledge Management & Communication]				
Sub-recommendation 9.1 Document and share results from MDAs with donors, government and partners and their impact on businesses, economy and market development in general.	CO – Management, Partnerships [CO - Supply chain & Programme RB Partnerships, Supply Chain, Knowledge Management & Communication]	Agreed	38. WFP will develop communication products featuring best practices and good initiatives from different COs which have demonstrated high impact, to be featured through various platforms including yammer, WFP twitter, WFPgo and documented through fact sheets and articles.	(RB Communications and Supply Chain Retail & Markets) (RB EGB - Knowledge Management; CO Communications)	December 2023
Sub-recommendation 9.2:CO - Management, PartnershipsImplement MDAs through social protection programmes and resilience programmes including the SAMS rather than in emergencies only to address the challenges that come with the short duration of interventions.CO - Management, PartnershipsRB Partnerships, Supply Chain, Knowledge Management & Communication]Supply Chain, Knowledge	Partially agreed MDAs should be designed and implemented across all types of activities and interventions	39. RB will support COs in identifying entry points that will strengthen and improve markets where social protection and resilience programmes are implemented.	CO Supply Chain and Social Protection teams (RB SC Retail & Markets and Social Protection)	December 2023	
	Knowledge Management &	including in emergencies, such as, the Retail-in-a-box (RIAB) turnkey	40. With the support of RB, COs under the social protection framework will identify key supply chain expertise that will	CO Social Protection and Supply Chain	December 2023

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
		solution that creates markets in volatile and fragile environments	help in the industrialization thematic area on how communities can be supported from production to consumption.	(RB Social Protection, SC Retail & Markets)	
<ul> <li>Priority: High</li> <li>Recommendation 10</li> <li>WFP should consider the QuIP methodology when conducting (i) exploratory or formative evaluations (ii) evaluations in which it seeks to identify drivers of change and (iii) large evaluations conducted on a limited budget.</li> <li>(December 2023)</li> </ul>	RB and CO Management [RB Evaluation and Supply Chain & Programme CO Supply Chain and Programme]	Partially Agreed WFP will explore the use of QuIP among other available innovative methods, funds allowing	Not applicable	Not applicable	Not applicable
<b>Sub-recommendation 10.1</b> To test the ToC framework more fully and obtain a better overview of market dynamics and effects on beneficiaries, use	RB and CO Management [RB Evaluation and Supply Chain & Programme	<i>Partially Agreed</i> WFP will explore the use of QuIP among other available	41. Work with relevant units to facilitate evidence generation of the impact of WFP Supply Chain on strengthening food systems along the four areas of focus <sup>5</sup>	RB Supply Chain (RB Evidence Generation Block, Evaluation & Programme; HQ Supply Chain & Retail and Markets)	December 2023

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> WFP food systems approach has identified four focus areas that can have a positive influence on food systems: (1).<u>Home Grown School Meals</u>, which connect local smallholder farmers to the supply chain of school meals programmes; (2) fortification initiatives that help communities access <u>locally produced nutritious food</u>; (3). fortification initiatives that help communities access <u>locally produced nutritious food</u>; (3) strengthening public food reserves; and (4) <u>supporting smallholder farmers</u> through the facilitation of credit, capacity development and access to markets.

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
QuIP methodology with a more diverse set of stakeholders across the entire supply chain.	CO Supply Chain and Programme]	innovative methods, funds allowing.			
<b>Sub-recommendation 10.2:</b> Complement QuIP with quantitative analysis of representativeness and statistical inferences or use QuIP to explain the causal mechanisms behind factor correlations identified in quantitative studies.	RB and CO Management [RB Evaluation and Supply Chain & Programme CO Supply Chain and Programme]	<i>Partially agreed</i> WFP will explore the use of QuIP among other available innovative methods, funds allowing	42. Explore the use of innovative methods such as QuIP and other methods, funds allowing as well as relevant evaluand and context.	RB Evaluation Unit (Office of Evaluation)	December 2023
Sub-recommendation 10.3 Account for seasonality and market dynamics in the QuIP coding approach by, for example, linking price increases to COVID-19 or exchange rate volatility. However, this substantially increases the complexity of coding, and therefore time required to conduct the analysis, and it will be difficult to represent these phenomena visually in the causal map.	RB and CO Management [RB Evaluation and Supply Chain & Programme CO Supply Chain and Programme]	<i>Partially agreed</i> WFP will explore the use of QuIP among other available innovative methods, funds allowing	43. Explore various innovative methods in order to account for seasonality and market dynamics as deemed relevant in evaluations/ assessments based on need by commissioning unit.	RB Evaluation Unit, (RB Supply Chain)	December 2023

Recommendations and related Sub-recommendations (Deadline)	Recommendation and Sub- Recommendation Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Management Response [Is (sub-) recommendation Agreed, Partially agreed or Not agreed?	Actions to be taken	Action Lead (Supporting Offices/Divisions)	Action Deadline
Sub-recommendation 10.4 If the focus of the evaluation is simply to understand the drivers of change, then just understanding the linkages and general direction of these linkages is sufficient. If the objective is to examine these phenomena in more detail, they will have to be considered during the design of the study.	RB and CO Management [RB Evaluation and Supply Chain & Programme CO Supply Chain and Programme]	Agreed	44. Plan evaluations at programme design stage and have directional or non-directional assumptions specified at preparation of the evaluation terms of reference and inception phase.	RB Evaluation Unit (RB Supply Chain and Programme)	December 2023
Sub-recommendation 10.5 If WFP anticipates differences in results between stakeholder groups and disaggregation is desirable, the various stakeholder groups should be defined and categorized clearly during the design of the study, and these categories should be reflected in the contact list data made available to the evaluation team.	RB and CO – Management RB Evaluation and Supply Chain & Programme CO Supply Chain and Programme	Agreed	45. Ensure variables of interest for evaluation are disaggregated according to the needs of evaluation evidence users.	RB Evaluation Unit (RB Supply Chain)	December 2023